



Iowa Research Online
The University of Iowa's Institutional Repository

Shambaugh Conference Supplementary Materials

1-1-2013

Supplement to “Good Governance: Efficiency and Effectiveness in Russian Regional Healthcare”

Andrei Akhremenko
Moscow State University

Copyright © 2012 Andrei Akhremenko.

Comments

Supplement to chapter in book: Reisinger, William M. ed., *Russia's Regions and Comparative Subnational Politics* (New York: Routledge, 2012).
978-0-415-62996-6

Hosted by Iowa Research Online. For more information please contact: lib-ir@uiowa.edu.

Good Governance: Efficiency and Effectiveness in Russian Regional Healthcare

When using these data, please give authorship credit to Andrei Akhremenko, with support from the Laboratory for Regional Political Studies of the National Research University – Higher School of Economics. You should cite the source as follows:

Akhremenko, Andrei. 2013. Supplement to “Good Governance: Efficiency and Effectiveness in Russian Regional Healthcare,” in William M. Reisinger, ed., *Russia’s Regions and Comparative Subnational Politics* (New York: Routledge), http://ir.uiowa.edu/shambaugh_supplement.

Network Norm Coefficients

	2008	2009	2010
Altai Territory	1.079	1.078	1.077
Amur Region	1.147	1.143	1.145
Arkhangelsk Region	1.204	1.199	1.196
Astrakhan Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Belgorod Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Bryansk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Vladimir Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Volgograd Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Vologda Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Voronezh Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
the City of Moscow	1.000	1.000	1.000
the City of Saint-Petersburg	1.000	1.000	1.000
Jewish Autonomous Region	1.112	1.111	1.109
Zabaikal Territory	1.141	1.128	1.126
Ivanovo Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Irkutsk Region	1.092	1.091	1.103
Kabardino-Balkarian Republic	1.032	1.032	1.031
Kaliningrad Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Kaluga Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Kamchatka Territory	1.103	1.142	1.532
Karachaevo-Cherkessian Republic	1.072	1.071	1.069
Kemerovo Region	1.046	1.045	1.045
Kirov Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Kostroma Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Krasnodar Territory	1.043	1.042	1.041
Krasnoyarsk Territory	1.128	1.153	1.149
Kurgan Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Kursk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000

Leningrad Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Lipetsk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Magadan Region	1.542	1.545	1.530
Moscow Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Murmansk Region	1.021	1.021	1.021
Nenets Autonomous District	1.204	1.199	1.196
Nizhnii Novgorod Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Novgorod Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Novosibirsk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Omsk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Orenburg Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Orel Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Penza Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Perm Territory	1.100	1.117	1.116
Primorie Territory	1.052	1.052	1.051
Pskov Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Republic of Adygeya	1.064	1.063	1.061
Republic of Altai	1.382	1.377	1.368
Republic of Bashkortostan	1.000	1.000	1.000
Republic of Buryatia	1.163	1.153	1.150
Republic of Dagestan	1.098	1.095	1.092
Republic of Ingushetia	1.032	1.032	1.031
Republic of Kalmykia	1.000	1.000	1.000
Republic of Karelia	1.088	1.086	1.085
Republic of Komi	1.138	1.139	1.137
Republic of Marii El	1.000	1.000	1.000
Republic of Mordovia	1.000	1.000	1.000
Republic of Sakha (Yakutia)	1.516	1.515	1.502
Republic of North Ossetia – Alania	1.042	1.042	1.041
Republic of Tatarstan	1.000	1.000	1.000
Republic of Tuva	1.186	1.177	1.171
Republic of Khakassia	1.062	1.061	1.060
Rostov Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Ryazan Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Samara Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Saratov Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Sakhalin Region	1.101	1.100	1.096
Sverdlovsk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Smolensk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Stavropol Territory	1.039	1.038	1.037
Tambov Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Tver Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Tomsk Region	1.157	1.153	1.149
Tula Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Tyumen Region	1.137	1.135	1.130

Udmurtian Republic	1.000	1.000	1.000
Ulyanovsk Region	1.000	1.000	1.000
Khabarovsk Territory	1.105	1.107	1.102
Khanti-Mansiisk Autonomous District - Yugra	1.137	1.135	1.130
Chelyabinsk Region	1.056	1.055	1.055
Chechen Republic	1.032	1.032	1.047
Chuvash Republic	1.000	1.000	1.000
Chukotka Autonomous District	1.752	1.747	1.729
Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District	1.137	1.135	1.130
Yaroslavl Region	1.000	1.000	1.000

Source: Ministry of Regional Development.

http://www.minRegion.ru/upload/13_dmio/exec_evaluation/100512-raschet-neef-rash.xls

Raw Efficiency Scores. Variable Returns to Scale

	Social 2008	Social 2009	Social 2010	Technical 2008	Technical 2009	Technical 2010
Altai Territory	0.61	0.61	0.48	0.98	0.91	0.97
Amur Region	0.40	0.38	0.35	0.79	0.78	0.85
Arkhangelsk Region	0.77	0.81	0.78	0.91	0.87	0.92
Astrakhan Region	0.66	0.63	0.60	0.80	0.83	0.84
Belgorod Region	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.86	0.83	0.91
Bryansk Region	0.76	0.77	0.61	0.95	0.93	0.87
Vladimir Region	0.94	0.95	0.78	1.00	1.00	0.93
Volgograd Region	0.57	0.55	0.51	0.91	0.83	0.81
Vologda Region	0.84	0.98	0.91	0.84	0.78	0.79
Voronezh Region	0.74	0.76	0.76	0.88	0.88	0.86
the City of Moscow	0.82	0.95	0.90	1.00	1.00	1.00
the City of Saint-Petersburg	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.71	0.70	0.70
Jewish Autonomous Region	0.36	0.38	0.41	0.92	0.95	0.99
Zabaikal Territory	0.78	0.77	0.58	0.90	0.89	0.93
Ivanovo Region	0.79	0.80	0.86	0.88	0.83	0.93
Irkutsk Region	0.52	0.52	0.43	0.95	0.83	0.90
Kabardino-Balkarian Republic	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.91	0.87	0.83
Kaliningrad Region	0.98	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
Kaluga Region	0.82	0.84	0.84	1.00	0.97	0.99
Kamchatka Territory	0.46	0.46	0.59	0.74	0.72	0.79
Karachaevo-Cherkessian Republic	0.76	0.90	0.85	0.63	0.58	0.56

Kemerovo Region	0.61	0.62	0.51	0.96	0.90	0.93
Kirov Region	0.84	0.81	0.72	0.88	0.77	0.89
Kostroma Region	0.83	0.81	1.00	0.98	0.91	1.00
Krasnodar Territory	0.95	0.96	0.87	0.95	0.84	0.88
Krasnoyarsk Territory	0.52	0.51	0.51	0.87	0.85	0.89
Kurgan Region	0.64	0.58	0.53	0.97	0.91	0.96
Kursk Region	0.67	0.66	0.69	0.96	0.81	0.83
Leningrad Region	1.00	1.00	0.84	0.85	0.84	0.79
Lipetsk Region	0.82	0.81	0.82	0.99	0.97	0.97
Magadan Region	0.48	0.51	0.58	0.96	0.88	0.91
Moscow Region	0.84	0.89	0.95	1.00	0.95	0.96
Murmansk Region	0.82	0.83	0.95	0.71	0.72	0.80
Nenets Autonomous District	0.94	1.00	0.96	0.79	0.84	0.82
Nizhnii Novgorod Region	0.69	0.70	0.68	0.82	0.91	0.91
Novgorod Region	0.75	0.75	0.74	1.00	0.88	0.87
Novosibirsk Region	0.63	0.63	0.57	0.83	0.80	0.79
Omsk Region	0.72	0.75	0.64	0.97	0.96	0.99
Orenburg Region	0.71	0.70	0.61	1.00	0.94	0.98
Orel Region	0.92	0.92	0.86	0.78	0.72	0.74
Penza Region	0.91	0.92	0.70	0.97	1.00	1.00
Perm Territory	0.61	0.61	0.55	0.81	0.80	0.84
Primorie Territory	0.52	0.52	0.45	0.90	0.91	0.99
Pskov Region	0.63	0.65	0.64	0.78	0.73	0.74
Republic of Adygeya	0.78	0.76	0.69	0.98	0.89	0.97
Republic of Altai	0.53	0.52	0.48	1.00	0.93	0.99
Republic of Bashkortostan	0.93	0.96	0.90	0.95	0.87	0.90
Republic of Buryatia	0.60	0.59	0.58	0.88	0.78	0.82
Republic of Dagestan	0.60	0.88	0.96	0.95	0.90	0.93
Republic of Ingushetia	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
Republic of Kalmykia	0.43	0.44	0.50	0.90	0.87	0.93
Republic of Karelia	1.00	0.98	0.89	0.86	0.87	0.92
Republic of Komi	1.00	0.98	0.85	0.84	0.82	0.90
Republic of Marii El	0.80	0.81	0.70	1.00	0.98	0.88
Republic of Mordovia	0.84	0.77	0.76	1.00	0.95	0.97
Republic of Sakha (Yakutia)	0.56	0.57	0.62	0.86	0.82	0.85
Republic of North Ossetia – Alania	0.74	0.81	0.76	0.96	0.92	0.82
Republic of Tatarstan	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
Republic of Tuva	0.32	0.32	0.32	0.90	0.83	0.89
Republic of Khakassia	0.66	0.65	0.56	0.84	0.77	0.83
Rostov Region	0.70	0.72	0.72	0.99	0.89	0.80
Ryazan Region	0.63	0.62	0.63	0.96	0.82	0.84
Samara Region	0.77	0.76	0.71	0.85	0.78	0.77
Saratov Region	0.84	0.82	0.79	1.00	0.87	0.87
Sakhalin Region	0.62	0.65	0.71	0.87	0.82	0.93
Sverdlovsk Region	0.81	0.83	0.69	0.89	0.83	0.87

Smolensk Region	0.66	0.68	0.76	0.85	0.79	0.79
Stavropol Territory	0.69	0.71	0.77	0.90	0.85	0.82
Tambov Region	0.95	0.95	1.00	0.94	0.89	0.86
Tver Region	0.64	0.65	0.67	0.71	0.77	0.82
Tomsk Region	0.57	0.59	0.74	0.87	0.76	0.88
Tula Region	0.74	0.73	0.74	0.96	0.91	0.81
Tyumen Region	0.81	0.83	0.72	0.89	0.96	1.00
Udmurtian Republic	0.74	0.73	0.75	0.96	0.90	0.93
Ulyanovsk Region	0.72	0.71	0.72	0.96	0.92	0.95
Khabarovsk Territory	0.50	0.49	0.42	0.78	0.82	0.89
Khanti-Mansiisk Autonomous District - Yugra	1.00	1.00	0.98	0.86	0.81	0.87
Chelyabinsk Region	0.69	0.71	0.66	1.00	0.95	1.00
Chechen Republic	0.60	0.55	0.64	1.00	0.88	0.91
Chuvash Republic	0.80	0.78	0.82	0.93	0.89	0.99
Chukotka Autonomous District	0.47	0.49	0.36	0.81	0.76	0.71
Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District	0.54	0.54	0.52	0.79	0.75	0.80
Yaroslavl Region	0.97	1.00	0.85	0.92	0.83	0.86

Efficiency Scores, Adjusted for Network Norm Coefficients

	Social 2008	Social 2009	Social 2010	Technical 2008	Technical 2009	Technical 2010
Altai Territory	-0.113	-0.124	-0.230	0.08	0.05	0.09
Amur Region	-0.284	-0.328	-0.325	-0.11	-0.08	-0.02
Arkhangelsk Region	0.105	0.138	0.126	0.02	0.02	0.05
Astrakhan Region	-0.106	-0.154	-0.156	-0.11	-0.04	-0.05
Belgorod Region	0.229	0.220	0.248	-0.05	-0.04	0.02
Bryansk Region	-0.012	-0.008	-0.141	0.04	0.06	-0.02
Vladimir Region	0.166	0.166	0.030	0.09	0.13	0.04
Volgograd Region	-0.205	-0.231	-0.244	0.00	-0.04	-0.08
Vologda Region	0.072	0.196	0.156	-0.07	-0.09	-0.10
Voronezh Region	-0.028	-0.022	0.005	-0.03	0.01	-0.03
City of Moscow	0.046	0.171	0.149	0.09	0.13	0.11
City of Saint-Petersburg	0.229	0.220	0.248	-0.20	-0.17	-0.19
Jewish autonomous Region	-0.348	-0.344	-0.290	0.02	0.09	0.11
Zabaikal Territory	0.082	0.059	-0.109	0.00	0.03	0.05
Ivanovo Region	0.019	0.020	0.103	-0.03	-0.04	0.04
Irkutsk Region	-0.196	-0.209	-0.271	0.05	-0.03	0.02

Kabardino-Balkarian Republic	0.246	0.236	0.263	0.00	0.00	-0.06
Kaliningrad Region	0.210	0.220	0.248	0.09	0.13	0.11
Kaluga Region	0.053	0.061	0.091	0.09	0.10	0.10
Kamchatka Territory	-0.252	-0.247	0.098	-0.16	-0.14	-0.05
Karachaevo-Cherkessian Republic	0.030	0.160	0.137	-0.28	-0.28	-0.32
Kemerovo Region	-0.134	-0.131	-0.226	0.06	0.03	0.04
Kirov Region	0.072	0.034	-0.036	-0.03	-0.10	0.00
Kostroma Region	0.063	0.031	0.248	0.07	0.04	0.11
Krasnodar Territory	0.200	0.205	0.139	0.05	-0.03	-0.01
Krasnoyarsk Territory	-0.184	-0.186	-0.168	-0.02	-0.01	0.01
Kurgan Region	-0.130	-0.198	-0.225	0.06	0.04	0.07
Kursk Region	-0.100	-0.123	-0.064	0.05	-0.06	-0.06
Leningrad Region	0.229	0.220	0.087	-0.06	-0.03	-0.10
Lipetsk Region	0.049	0.035	0.069	0.08	0.10	0.08
Magadan Region	0.004	0.024	0.094	0.11	0.07	0.07
Moscow Region	0.070	0.113	0.202	0.09	0.08	0.07
Murmansk Region	0.057	0.059	0.212	-0.20	-0.15	-0.09
Nenets Autonomous District	0.278	0.328	0.311	-0.10	-0.01	-0.06
Nizhnii Novgorod Region	-0.079	-0.082	-0.077	-0.09	0.04	0.02
Novgorod Region	-0.017	-0.033	-0.011	0.09	0.01	-0.02
Novosibirsk Region	-0.143	-0.152	-0.187	-0.08	-0.07	-0.10
Omsk Region	-0.049	-0.035	-0.108	0.06	0.09	0.10
Orenburg Region	-0.061	-0.076	-0.141	0.09	0.07	0.09
Orel Region	0.152	0.144	0.106	-0.13	-0.15	-0.15
Penza Region	0.141	0.137	-0.051	0.06	0.13	0.11
Perm Territory	-0.102	-0.108	-0.141	-0.09	-0.06	-0.04
Primorie Territory	-0.221	-0.237	-0.280	-0.01	0.04	0.10
Pskov Region	-0.144	-0.132	-0.109	-0.13	-0.14	-0.15
Republic of Adygeya	0.047	0.015	-0.032	0.08	0.03	0.08
Republic of Altai	-0.034	-0.058	-0.087	0.13	0.10	0.13
Republic of Bashkortostan	0.164	0.182	0.143	0.04	0.00	0.01
Republic of Buryatia	-0.085	-0.111	-0.096	-0.02	-0.07	-0.05
Republic of Dagestan	-0.115	0.145	0.248	0.05	0.04	0.05
Republic of Ingushetia	0.246	0.236	0.263	0.09	0.13	0.11
Republic of Kalmykia	-0.340	-0.345	-0.253	-0.01	0.00	0.04
Republic of Karelia	0.279	0.252	0.181	-0.04	0.01	0.04
Republic of Komi	0.306	0.271	0.168	-0.06	-0.04	0.02
Republic of Marii El	0.030	0.025	-0.056	0.09	0.11	-0.01
Republic of Mordovia	0.073	-0.005	0.004	0.09	0.08	0.08
Republic of Sakha (Yakutia)	0.077	0.069	0.120	0.01	0.01	0.01
Republic of North Ossetia – Alania	-0.009	0.049	0.030	0.05	0.05	-0.07
Republic of Tatarstan	0.229	0.220	0.248	0.09	0.13	0.11
Republic of Tuva	-0.344	-0.367	-0.347	0.01	-0.02	0.01
Republic of Khakassia	-0.079	-0.099	-0.165	-0.06	-0.09	-0.06
Rostov Region	-0.070	-0.056	-0.033	0.08	0.02	-0.09

Ryazan Region	-0.136	-0.158	-0.127	0.05	-0.05	-0.05
Samara Region	-0.004	-0.023	-0.041	-0.06	-0.09	-0.12
Saratov Region	0.071	0.037	0.037	0.09	0.00	-0.02
Sakhalin Region	-0.094	-0.076	0.008	-0.03	-0.04	0.05
Sverdlovsk Region	0.040	0.055	-0.065	-0.02	-0.04	-0.02
Smolensk Region	-0.114	-0.099	0.010	-0.06	-0.08	-0.10
Stavropol Territory	-0.058	-0.046	0.041	0.00	-0.01	-0.06
Tambov Region	0.183	0.169	0.248	0.03	0.02	-0.03
Tver Region	-0.127	-0.134	-0.082	-0.20	-0.10	-0.07
Tomsk Region	-0.117	-0.107	0.063	-0.03	-0.09	0.00
Tula Region	-0.032	-0.046	-0.016	0.05	0.04	-0.08
Tyumen Region	0.119	0.127	0.030	-0.01	0.11	0.12
Udmurtian Republic	-0.036	-0.052	0.002	0.05	0.03	0.04
Ulyanovsk Region	-0.052	-0.068	-0.036	0.05	0.05	0.06
Khabarovsk Territory	-0.220	-0.235	-0.279	-0.12	-0.04	0.01
Khanti-Mansiisk Autonomous District - Yugra	0.306	0.296	0.289	-0.04	-0.04	-0.01
Chelyabinsk Region	-0.050	-0.035	-0.070	0.10	0.09	0.11
Chechen Republic	-0.156	-0.219	-0.084	0.09	0.01	0.02
Chuvash Republic	0.034	-0.005	0.065	0.02	0.02	0.10
Chukotka Autonomous District	0.114	0.114	-0.027	-0.03	-0.03	-0.11
Yamalo-Nenets Autonomous District	-0.152	-0.168	-0.163	-0.10	-0.10	-0.08
Yaroslavl Region	0.204	0.220	0.096	0.01	-0.04	-0.03