

("Women in Late Antique and Early Christian Art and Art History"), Christine Havice ("Teaching about Byzantine Women in Art History"), Carolyn L. Connor ("Theodora's Challenge"), and Alice-Mary Talbot ("Teaching about the Religious Life of Byzantine Women"); Judith Herrin provided commentary. Prof. Gouma-Peterson and several other scholars, including all the presenters, have compiled an extensive bibliography on women in Byzantium. The bibliography is available for \$1.00 from Donna Warner, Art Department, College of Wooster, Wooster, Ohio, 44691. Annemarie Weyl Carr (who, with Christine Havice, organized a session on women in Byzantium at the 1991 BSC) is planning a follow-up at the Byzantine Studies Conference in the fall of 1993, to be held at Princeton University.

Another new undertaking, not limited to medieval art, is a project in curriculum transformation in art history organized by Diane Smith-Hurd (Art Academy of Cincinnati, 1125 St. Gregory St., Cincinnati, Ohio, 45202) and Linnea Dietrich (Miami University, New Art Building, Oxford, Ohio 45056). They chaired a session on this subject at the 1993 meeting of the College Art Association and they, too, are collecting syllabi and other materials; they welcome inquiries.

Scholars working on gender issues in medieval art will find a trove of material in a recent special issue of *Gesta* (vol. XXXI/2, 1992) on monastic architecture for women. The papers in this issue were presented originally at the 1991 meeting of the College Art Association, in a session entitled "Medieval Women and their Patrons: Architectural Space and Problems of Design," organized by Caroline A. Bruzelius and Constance H. Berman. Jeffrey F. Hamburger, the discussant for the session, contributes a valuable overview, "Art, Enclosure and the *Cura Monialium*: Prolegomena in the Guise of a Postscript," including a detailed bibliography. Though the special issue is not concerned specifically with teaching, anyone preparing a course dealing with gender and medieval art will find much of interest here.

¹ "An Art Historical Response to 'Gay Studies and Feminism: A Medievalist's Perspective,'" *MFN* 14 (Fall 1992): 16.

² Dorothy Miner, "Anastaise and Her Sisters" (Baltimore, 1974); Annemarie Weyl Carr, "Women Artists in the Middle Ages," *The Feminist Art Journal*, 1976-5-9, 26; eadem, "Women and Monasticism in Byzantium: Introduction from an Art Historian," *Byzantinische Forschungen* 9: 1-15.



COURSES ON WOMEN IN MEDIEVAL ART



The following are sample syllabi and readings supplied by Madeline Caviness and Charles Nelson, Tufts University, and Jane Welch Williams, University of Arizona. For information regarding the Art History Project's current interest in collecting syllabi, see Pamela Sheingorn's report, following.

WOMEN IN MEDIEVAL ART AND LITERATURE
Madeline Caviness, Art History, and Charles G. Nelson,
German, Tufts University

‡

The title is meant to invoke various relationships between women and works of art and of literature. The responses of both medieval and modern women—as viewers or as readers/listeners—are kept as much in view as are the medieval women authors, makers, and patrons (a useful reading for orientation is the section on reading as a woman in Jonathan Culler's *On Deconstruction*). Representations of women in art and literature constitute a major category for analysis, especially in the visual arts. Although I begin with Eve, very early on I consider the problem of women and silence and the process of silencing based on the example of the Bayeux tapestry (a male construction of history, even if stitched by women).

I have taught two versions of the course on women in the middle ages over the past five years: most frequently it has been an interdisciplinary course, taught as a seminar with Charles Nelson of the Tufts German department, a specialist in medieval literature and a literary theorist. Currently this course has expanded in enrollment (25 with 2 graduate student auditors), so that it is being taught now as a lecture course, with discussion, rather than as a seminar with discussion and class presentations. To stimulate discussion, however, each student is required to make a five-minute presentation from readings in feminist, art historical, and literary theory, primary textual sources, and art and literary criticism.

At the Institute of Fine Arts in New York I taught the course as an advanced-level lecture course (fall 1991). The large enrollment, room-size, and fewer class hours (two instead of three per week), were offset by the students' level of preparation, since they worked well independently.

The aim of the course is to confront modes of feminist critical thinking that evolved in relation to modern art (e.g., film criticism), or that have been ahistorical (e.g., Culler and Cixous), with selected works of art (and literature) that span the eleventh through the fourteenth centuries. These case studies are developed contextually as well as critically, so that students do not receive a monolithic impression of the middle ages, but instead become aware of chronological and geographical difference. However, a feminist historical perspective places traditional labels, such as the Renaissance, and genres such as courtly love literature, in question. Unless students have a very special reason for studying a work that dates after 1350, we prefer that they do not stray into the "renaissance." Some, for instance, come into the course eager to work on witches, only to find that witches do not belong in the middle ages. Many want to work on Christine de Pizan, but her thinking about the status of women is not representative of the earlier period. By focusing on the period from 950-1350 we can deal with monastic vs. cathedral school education, women as trained thinkers vs. mystics, women as sponsors vs. women as consumers of art.

The team-taught version of the course, which includes more literature, is enormously enriched by the incorporation of models from the vernacular and secular cultures as well as from the Latin and religious ones that tend to dominate surviving art. Consequently, even when I teach the course alone, I include a certain amount of this

material, using, for instance, "courtly love" poetry to discuss along with *The Song of Songs* and the cult of the Virgin; reading the poem as a woman transforms a viewing even of the seemingly lyrical Manesse Codex pictures. Throughout the semester we link material thematically: the issue of "irony" in Andreas Capellanus's conflicting responses to *amor* is discussed in association with a reading of marginalia as oppositional to the liturgical text in *The Hours of Jeanne d'Evreux* and the *Peterborough Psalter*.

Students typically bring very different levels of preparation to the course. Many are primarily interested in the feminist, rather than the medievalist aspect. Some have a fair knowledge of one or another aspect of the middle ages but have never seriously dealt with postmodern critical theory. Discussion brings out a diversity of viewpoints: ethnicity and sexual orientation are quickly added to the oppositional readings that are implied solely by biological difference. Our own role is often to reinforce the need for historical readings; at an appropriate juncture we engage in a discussion of gynophobia as a preferable term to misogyny to describe medieval attitudes to women.*

Madeline Caviness

WOMEN IN MEDIEVAL ART AND LITERATURE: SCHEDULE

‡

(The sample readings for each week represent an editorial selection.

For more complete information, please write Prof. Caviness or Prof. Nelson.)

Week 1. Introduction: ways of looking at and reading medieval art and literature; Ave-Eva, the double face of the Virgin and Eve; the creation myth (Hildesheim doors); the medieval literary text as exemplar.

Sample readings: Margaret Miles, *Carnal Knowing*, 1-116; Josephine Donovan, *Feminist Theory: The Intellectual Traditions of American Feminism* (New York, 1991); Aristotle, *Politics*, Bk. 1, ch. 12-13; St. Jerome, *Letter 22* (to Eustochium); Judson Boyce Allen, *The Ethical Poetic of the Later Middle Ages* (Toronto, 1982), 3-50.

Week 2. Warrior women; Judith in literature and in art; Brünhild vs. Kriemhild; visual narrative (Hildesheim doors; Bayeux tapestry; Susanna plaque) vs. verbal narrative.

Sample readings: Charles G. Nelson, "Virginity (De)valued: Kriemhild, Brünhild, and All That." 'waz sider da geschach': *American-German Studies on the Nibelungenlied*, ed. W. Wunderlich, U. Müller (Göppingen, 1992), 111-30; Henry Kelly, "The Metamorphoses of the Eden Serpent during the Middle

* Prof. Caviness is writing a book that has grown out of teaching these courses and that may be useful as a text for others. Its working title is *Essays on a Cock-Horse*. Issues are dealt with topically: silence and silencing; constructions of the virgin saint; female martyrdoms and sadomasochism; "courtly love" and the cult of the Virgin; patriarchy, genealogy and marriage; women and the margins. Her article on the marginalia in the *Hours of Jeanne d'Evreux* will appear in the spring 1993 issue of *Speculum*.

Ages and Renaissance," *Viator* 2 (1971); Genevra Kornbluth, "The Susanna Crystal of Lothar II: Chastity, the Church, and Royal Justice." *Gesta* 31 (1992): 25-39; J. Bard McNulty, "The Lady Aelfgyva in the Bayeux Tapestry," *Speculum* 55 (1980), 659-68.

Week 3. Versions of virginity (Judith, Kriemhild, Brünhild); representations of Eve or evil women cf. Mary Magdalen, Mary of Egypt as repentant sinners

Sample readings: Elizabeth Petroff, *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature* (Oxford, 1986), 83-90; Hrotsvit's "Basilus," "Dulcitus," "Pelagius," "Abraham," in Katharina Wilson, *Medieval Women Writers*, 47-53, 53-60, 114-23, 124-35; *Herrad of Landsberg: Hortus deliciarum*, eds. A. Straub, G. Keller (New Rochelle, 1977); Bonnie Anderson, Judith Zinsser, *A History of their Own: Women in Europe from Prehistory to the Present*, Vol. 1 (London, 1988) 181-213; Marjorie Malvern, *Venus in Sackcloth: The Magdalen's Origins and Metamorphoses* (1975), 71-88.

Week 4. Interpretations of Eve; discuss Hrotsvit

Sample readings: Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend*; Helen Rodnite Lemay, *Women's Secrets: A Translation of Pseudo-Albertus Magnus' "De Secretis Mulierum" with Commentaries* (Albany, NY, 1992), 59-149; Eleanor McLaughlin, "Equality of Souls, Inequality of Sexes: Women in Medieval Theology," in *Religion and Sexism*, ed. R.R. Ruether (New York, 1974), 213-66. Walter Koschorreck, *Der Sachsenspiegel: Die Heidelberger Bilderhandschrift Cod. Pal. Germ. 164* (Frankfurt am Main, 1989); Pamplona Bible plates (F. Bucher, *The Pamplona Bibles*, 2 vols. [New Haven, 1970]), esp. pls 527-36.

Week 5. Women in convents and at the court; gynophobia, marriage and social aspects of legitimacy; heraldry; the tree of Jesse in women's books; *Sachsenspiegel*; *Hours of Jeanne d'Evreux*.

Sample readings: *Song of Songs*; *St. Bernard's Sermons on the Canticle of Canticles* (7, 8, 9); Manesse codex (*Grosse Heidelberger Liederhandschrift*, 4 vols. [ca. 1971-74]); Andreas Capellanus, *The Art of Courtly Love*; Betsy Bowden, "The Art of Courtly Copulation," *Medievalia et Humanistica* 9 (1979): 67-85; *The Hours of Jeanne d'Evreux, Queen of France* (New York, 1957).

Week 6. Women as lovers and women loved; courtly love convention; women as authors and patrons (Heloise, Marie de Champagne, Marie de France, Hildegard of Bingen, Herrad, Agnes of Braine)

Sample readings: *The Lais of Marie de France*; Madeline Caviness, "Patron or Matron: A Capetian Bride and a *vade mecum* for her Marriage Bed," *Speculum* (in press); Lucy Freeman Sandler, "A Bawdy Betrothal in the Ormesby Psalter," in *A Tribute to Lotte Brand Phillip*, ed. W. Clark *et al* (New York, 1985): 154-59; Petroff, 207-21 (on Mechthild of Magdeburg).

- Week 7. Discussion of *Manesse Codex*, Capellanus. Cult of the Virgin vs. erotic love; *Carmina Burana* (male and female voices); marginalia in women's and men's books
Sample readings: Donovan, chaps. 2,6,7; Misogyny debate in *Medieval Feminist Newsletter* nos. 6 and 7; Rosemary R. Reuther, "Misogynism and Virginal Feminism in the Fathers of the Church," in *Religion and Sexism*, 150-83; Jean de Meun, *The Romance of the Rose*, lines 8455-9492.
- Week 8. Class presentations; discussion of readings; review readings and visual material for exam
- Week 9. Exam; discuss *Manesse Codex*; women and Arthurian romance; review *Hortus deliciarum*.
Readings: Susan Groag Bell, "Medieval Women Book Owners: Arbiters of Lay Piety and Ambassadors of Culture," *Signs* 7 (1982): 742-68; Joan Ferrante, "Public Postures and Private Maneuvers: The Roles Medieval Women Play," in *Women and Power in the Middle Ages*, eds. M. Erler and M. Kowaleski (Athens, Ga., 1988), 213-29. V. Sekules, "Women and Art in England in the Thirteenth and Fourteenth Centuries," in J. Alexander et al, eds., *Age of Chivalry: Art in Plantagenet England 1200-1400* (London, 1987), 41-48.
- Week 10. Control of women through devotional instruction: women's books (Hours, *Ancren Riwe*, *Hortus*, etc.)
Sample readings: M. Caviness, "Images of Divine Order and the Third Mode of Seeing," *Gesta* 22 (1983), 99-120; Hildegard of Bingen, *Scivias* (Vision I: 2,4,5; Vision II: 1,2, 3, 4, 6; Vision III, 2); Mary Ellen Waithe, "Heloise," in *A History of Women Philosophers*. Vol. 2: *Medieval, Renaissance, and Enlightenment Women Philosophers*, ed. M.E. Waithe (Dordrecht, 1989), 67-83; Sabina Flanagan, *Hildegard of Bingen, A Visionary Life* (London, 1989) 1-15, 41-56, 193-213.
- Week 11. Women as visionaries (Mary Magdalen, Elizabeth of Schönau). Discuss Hildegard of Bingen.
Sample readings: Miles, *Carnal Knowing* (continue); David Aers, ed., *Medieval Literature, Criticism, and Ideology* (New York, 1986); continue Anderson-Zinsser; Carol J. Clover, "Her Body, Himself: Gender in the Slasher Film," in *Representations* 20, 1987.
- Week 12. The body and the gaze; sado-eroticism and female martyrs (*The Golden Legend*).
- Week 13. Review and general discussion of feminist criticism.