"Neither White Men Nor Indians": Affidavits From the Winnebago Mixed-Blood Claim Commissions, Prairie Du Chien, Wisconsin, 1838-1839

Lucy Eldersveld Murphy

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.10713

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
had abandoned former notions of inclusiveness and turned the frontiers into “exclusive regions for their own use and determination” (247).

Overall, Hurt’s synthesis accomplishes the goal set out in the preface. In roughly 250 pages of text, he skillfully introduces readers to a number of different encounters that complicate generally held notions about the American frontier experience. Admirably, Hurt also makes a concerted effort to present a balanced narrative that details the brutal treatment of Indians throughout the continent while also concluding that “neither Indians nor whites had a monopoly on morality and virtue”(246). Hurt does make some debatable assertions, most notably when he concludes that the church proved to be a savior for Indians in California. He also fails to discuss the midwestern frontier and the experience of the Ohio Valley Indians who settled in present-day Missouri, Iowa, Nebraska, and Kansas in the 1820s and 1830s and had their own cultural encounters with western tribes. Such critiques should not overshadow the strengths of this text. In a very readable and comprehensive fashion, Hurt has crafted a synthesis that successfully introduces a complex series of frontiers where Indians, Europeans, and Americans worked with and against each other in efforts to achieve their objectives.


Reviewer Lucy Eldersveld Murphy is associate professor of history at Ohio State University, Newark. She is the author of the Benjamin F. Shambaugh Award–winning book, A Gathering of Rivers: Indians, Métis, and Mining in the Western Great Lakes, 1737–1832 (2000).

The 1837 treaty with the Winnebago (Ho Chunk) Indians that forced their removal from east of the Mississippi included a provision allocating $100,000 for the biracial relatives of members of the tribe. “Neither White Men Nor Indians” includes transcripts of testimony taken by commissioners sent by the federal government to determine who should receive these awards. Historians as well as genealogists will find that these fascinating statements provide a glimpse into the social lives and economic patterns of oft-neglected frontier people during a period of demographic transition.

For each of the sixty cases, sworn testimony and correspondence provided information about individual claimants and their families, seeking to explain their kinship to the Ho Chunk tribe and to evaluate the amount of service to both the Indians and the U.S. government
that each had rendered in the past and the potential for future service. Although these records must be used cautiously, they can reveal a great deal about family lineage, patterns of social relations between native families and their intermarried kin, relationships between native women and federal government officials and soldiers, and many other historical issues.

Linda M. Waggoner provides a helpful preface and a careful essay regarding the controversy over alleged fraud in the commission’s actions of 1838. The appendix includes copies of the 1837 treaty and the payment roll for the first commission. Researchers will appreciate a helpful index and bibliography of relevant primary and secondary sources. This is a useful resource for researchers interested in the nineteenth-century Midwest.


Reviewer Roger L. Nichols is professor of history at the University of Arizona. His research and writing have focused on the history of frontier exploration and American Indians.

The subject of considerable public interest during his lifetime and numerous biographies during the past half-century, John Charles Frémont continues to attract attention. For Chaffin, as for most previous authors, Frémont’s ideas, motivations, and personality prove to be illusive. The result is a long, detailed, interesting book that is a well-done life-and-times of the man, rather than his biography. For modern readers, it depicts a West characterized by almost unimaginable size and emptiness. Moving into that region during the 1830s and ’40s, the young army officer personally represented the United States and its government. A federally supported explorer by the time he was 25, Frémont tended to be brash and reckless, to ignore orders, to act in self-serving ways, and to indulge in considerable wishful thinking about the American presence in the West. The narrative, then, looks at the decades between the War of 1812 and the building of the early transcontinental railroads later in the nineteenth century.

In his discussion, author Tom Chaffin steers away from any complex analysis of Frémont’s thinking or motivations. Instead, his primary emphasis remains on a detailed narrative of the subject’s actions at crucial points during his career. The book’s main thrust is to present Frémont in the context of early and mid-nineteenth century ideas about American empire and the reasons for and means to achieve national