Banners South: A Northern Community at War

Kenneth L. Lyftogt

University of Northern Iowa

ISSN 0003-4827
Copyright © 2006 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.1072

Hosted by Iowa Research Online

Reviewer Kenneth L. Lyftogt is a lecturer in history at the University of Northern Iowa. He is the author of several books on Iowa and the Civil War, including From Blue Mills to Columbia: Cedar Falls and the Civil War (1993).

Banners South: A Northern Community at War, by Edmund J. Raus Jr., is a study of local Civil War history, in much the same vein as my own From Blue Mills To Columbia: Cedar Falls and the Civil War (1993), the story of an Iowa town, or Fire Within: A Civil War Narrative from Wisconsin, by Kerry A. Trask. Each attempts to examine the war by studying the experiences of one community. Each story is representative of other communities but is also a unique story in its own right.

Banners South begins by telling the story of Cortland, New York, “the city of the seven valleys” in the Appalachian Mountains, which took its name from Pierre Van Cortland, the first lieutenant governor of New York. The religious effects of the Second Great Awakening, the economic challenges of an isolated area, and the growing abolitionist movement all contributed to the character of Cortland and its people. After setting this context, the book follows the story of the volunteers from Cortland County who served in the 12th New York Volunteer Infantry, and the 23rd New York Volunteer Infantry.

Raus has done a splendid job of gathering information on the county and its volunteers. He introduces readers to the volunteers as individuals and follows them through the war. His impressive collection of photographs brings the story to life. Raus is no sentimentalist in his depictions of the men; they can be viciously racist, often selfish, as well as brave and patriotic. Military service can be corrupting as well as noble. Raus pulls no punches on such issues.

One of the strengths of the book is its introduction of interesting Civil War figures, especially Colonel Henry Cane “Barney” Hoffman, a tragic character, and General Marsena R. Patrick. Patrick, as the Union military governor of occupied Fredericksburg, is a great example of the old-school professional soldier in the difficult position of commanding volunteer troops. Patrick was also a Union conservative who wanted to put down the rebellion without making war on southern civilians, which often put him at odds with his own men, who sought to punish rebels wherever they found them.

The largest difficulty of this approach to Civil War studies is how the author judges the potential audience. How much knowledge do readers have of the war? Do they look to a local study to learn about the war itself? Or are they knowledgeable about the war and look to
local studies to flesh out and enhance the larger picture? It is on this edge that the book is at its weakest. Raus has served as a historian at Manassas, Gettysburg, and Fredericksburg-Spotsylvania, and his battlefield expertise dominates the work. The campaign descriptions are as good as any but are superfluous for readers with a basic knowledge of the war. As a result, the Cortland volunteers become lost in the larger stories of the Manassas, Fredericksburg, and Antietam campaigns.

The book ends, as it begins, in Cortland, New York, taking the story of the county and its soldiers through the end of the war. The beginning and the end are the briefest but best parts of the book, with the long campaign histories sandwiched between. There is little to offer scholars of Iowa history here except in the book’s approach. Every soldier represented a community and had a family, loved ones, and a job back home, and that was true in every part of the nation.


Reviewer Dwight T. Pitcaithley is college professor of history at New Mexico State University. Former Chief Historian of the National Park Service (1995–2005), he is the author of several articles about the NPS and the preservation of public memory, especially in regard to the Civil War.

Former National Park Service historian Timothy Smith has followed his insightful This Great Battlefield of Shiloh: History, Memory, and the Establishment of a Civil War National Military Park (2004) with a pleasing companion volume. The Untold Story of Shiloh probes into little-known and little-analyzed aspects of the battle, Shiloh’s national cemetery, the story of the battle as presented by generations of historians, and the founders of the park. With a most accessible writing style, Smith covers a range of subjects, adding depth to the reader’s understanding of the place called Shiloh.

Several of his chapters deal with battle-related subjects—“The Ten Greatest Myths of Shiloh,” the campaign against Corinth, Mississippi, and the role of the U.S. Navy—but it is the non–military-related sections that make The Untold Story of Shiloh captivating reading. In “Historians and the Battle of Shiloh: One Hundred Years of Controversy,” Smith observes four distinct schools of thought that have shaped the