

Moments of Impact: Injury, Racialized Memory, and Reconciliation in College Football

S. Zebulon Baker
Miami University in Ohio

ISSN 0003-4827

Copyright © 2016 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation

Baker, S. Z. "Moments of Impact: Injury, Racialized Memory, and Reconciliation in College Football." *The Annals of Iowa* 75 (2016), 188-190.

Available at: <https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.12294>

Hosted by [Iowa Research Online](#)

pect of technological change, among others, are illuminated through the lens of cycling and cycling culture. Lively writing and thorough research in original sources make *The Two-Wheeled World of George B. Thayer* a worthwhile addition to the literatures of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century sports and cultural history.

Moments of Impact: Injury, Racialized Memory, and Reconciliation in College Football, by Jaime Schultz. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2016. xiii, 198 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$40.00 hardcover.

Reviewer S Zebulon Baker is associate director of the University Honors Program at Miami University in Ohio. He received the State Historical Society of Iowa's Throne-Aldrich Award in 2014 for his article, "'This affair is about something bigger than John Bright': Iowans Confront the Jim Crow South, 1946-1951," published in the *Annals of Iowa* (Spring 2013).

Jaime Schultz's *Moments of Impact* is, at its center, a study of the processes through which historical memory is generated and subsequently put to use. She focuses her critical gaze primarily on the latter—particularly how the racialized violence visited upon three African American football players at Iowa universities in the first half of the twentieth century was later appropriated by those institutions to commemorate notions of progress beyond those outrages and to absolve the present of its own sins. Warning her readers against “utopian visions that posit some post-racist, post-racial society,” Schultz scrapes away the patina of myth and legend that encrusts the historical memories of the three athletes in question—Jack Trice, Ozzie Simmons, and John Bright—to understand how and why Iowans have chosen to remember—and forget—them and their injuries, as well as what those choices reveal about the ways Iowans engage with their racial history (146).

Like many other athletes of color in the early twentieth century, Trice, Simmons, and Bright fell victim to injuries that revealed a deliberate attempt by their white opponents to target them, or treat them roughly, because of their race. On October 6, 1923, in a game at the University of Minnesota, Trice sustained a broken clavicle in the first half, and then was cleated in the abdomen in the second, causing severe internal bleeding. After an excruciating train ride back from Minneapolis to Ames, he was checked into the student infirmary at Iowa State, where he eventually died. Eleven years later, Minnesota was again the perpetrator of so-called “rough tactics,” this time against Simmons in their game at Iowa City, which so infuriated Hawkeye supporters that threats of retaliation against the Gopher team and its fans were made

before Iowa and Minnesota squared off again the following season. To pacify “the simmering antagonism” caused by Simmons’s brutal treatment, the governors of Iowa and Minnesota, Clyde Herring and Floyd B. Olson, made a good-humored wager before the game of a prize hog, the forebear to the Floyd of Rosedale trophy that is still awarded to the winner of this annual rivalry (89). Far from the distraction caused by the governors, a series of pictures taken by *Des Moines Register* photographers during Drake’s contest at Oklahoma A&M in 1951 focused worldwide attention on an attack that Bright, Drake’s star player, endured on its first drive. Repeated hits with hard, heavy blows to the face by A&M lineman Wilbanks Smith shattered Bright’s jaw and knocked him out of the game. Rather than connecting these assaults to the broader pattern of racial violence in football at the time, Schultz notes, “most journalists represented them as discrete phenomena, as exceptional occurrences” (2).

The dimensions of exceptionalism cling to this trio because “they are all associated with some form of material culture” (2). Trice and Bright are namesakes to the football stadiums at their respective institutions; Floyd of Rosedale originated in Simmons’s battering. The central questions of Schultz’s study, by her account, “concern why, when, and how these memorials came about” (2). She explores the frustrating, decades-long fight at Iowa State to rename its stadium in Trice’s honor, which sprung not from a contemporaneous effort by his classmates to remember him, but from the forge of Black Power protests in the 1970s, which racialized the narrative of his legend. The eventual decision by Iowa State administrators to rename the stadium in 1997 was a conciliatory gesture that sought to make up for the insensitive naming of a hall for Carrie Chapman Catt, whose pioneering feminism was peppered with xenophobia and racism. Drake’s rededication of its football field in 2006 was framed as a “formal closure” to Bright’s attack, complete with an apology from Oklahoma State (*née* A&M) (131). These memorials, Schultz warns, are tricky endeavors that can lead to “unintended but nevertheless dangerous” outcomes (132). “My primary concern,” she argues, “is that symbolic acts, such as naming Jack Trice Stadium and Johnny Bright Field, become icons of racial progress. They simultaneously remind us of past racial injustice and stand as testaments to the end of an era” (144).

The most satisfying—and effective—chapter of the book is Schultz’s study of Floyd of Rosedale, which is destined to become mandatory reading for anyone interested in the black athlete experience in the Big Ten. Here, Schultz makes her most convincing case for how racialized memory determines the ways the past is remembered via a detailed

look at the contemporaneous processes by which it is also forgotten. "Rather than facilitating memories of Simmons," she explains, "Floyd of Rosedale was designed to make people forget" (73). The welter of anger that resulted from how Simmons was treated in that 1934 game disappeared as Governors Herring and Olsen redirected the public's attention from a serious confrontation with racial issues to a porcine absurdity. "Political intervention not only calmed interstate anxieties," Schultz observes, "it also glossed over and de-racialized any controversy concerning Simmons's place on the gridiron" (89). This was a fate to which Simmons resigned himself once his playing days were done. "Football's a racket," he said. "I play it because I love it. I know I'll be forgotten in two or three years" (98). Floyd of Rosedale is thus a talisman for how forgetting shapes remembering, indelibly fostering narratives that obscure as much as they crystallize popular historical memory. Schultz, in turn, challenges her readers to remember Simmons, Trice, and Bright, rather than "allowing their legacies to drift into the ether of neglect" (146). Yet, in that act of remembrance, "the racialized memories of these three men and the injuries and insults they sustained while playing college football best serve contemporary society by reminding us that coming to terms with the past must also include efforts to engage with the present" (146).

Inherit the Holy Mountain: Religion and the Rise of American Environmentalism, by Mark R. Stoll. New York: Oxford University Press, 2015. xiii, 406 pp. Illustrations, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$39.95 hardcover.

Reviewer Bill R. Douglas is an independent historian—and Presbyterian—based in Des Moines. His work focuses on Iowa's religious history.

Environmentalists were Presbyterians. That's the short summary of this long, engaging, and partially persuasive book. The longer summary is that Congregationalists in the nineteenth century, with their ordered commons, and Presbyterians in the early twentieth century, with their call for stewardship of the vast lands left for federal management, formed and dominated the American environmental movement. To be precise, Stoll argues that environmental leaders of the first half of the twentieth century had grown up Presbyterian, though they were often lapsed. The book's most important and provocative contribution is in recovering denominationalism as an essential category in American thought and practice.

This is a quirky book. The entire first part is a description of American nineteenth-century landscape artists. Patient readers may admire the full-color plates. Impatient readers may wonder about their relevance.