

Woman Suffrage and Citizenship in the Midwest, 1870-1920

Pam Stek

ISSN 0003-4827

Copyright © 2019 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation

Stek, Pam. "Woman Suffrage and Citizenship in the Midwest, 1870-1920." *The Annals of Iowa* 78 (2019), 220-223.

Available at: <https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.12573>

Hosted by Iowa Research Online

when at least two of the four more recent works, published within the last three years, give some Modoc perspective. Finally, it is often difficult to tell when Stockwell is speaking for herself or paraphrasing someone else. For example, "It might take a generation or two, but by the end of the century the Navajo would look and act exactly like most Americans" (61); and "Grant instead would intervene on behalf of the Indians to save them" (63). After discussing Parker's marriage to a white woman, Stockwell writes, "At some point in the future, the two peoples, white and red, would become one through intermarriage" (66). Such examples occur throughout the book, creating a thread of Eurocentrism or sloppy attribution.

Overall, Stockwell tries to walk the line between a new historiography and a popular history of a major historical figure. She does well in the latter, offering a balanced portrayal of Grant and his dilemmas over the unsolvable "Indian problem." But the historiography raises a problem. Stockwell follows C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa's argument in *Crooked Paths to Allotment: The Fight over Federal Indian Policy after the Civil War* (2012) that Indians and the country would have fared far better if Ely Parker had not been forced out of his position as commissioner. That is far too simplistic. The historiographical point that's missing is how Grant brought his total war mentality to the West. His strategy in the Civil War sacrificed lives to end the war quickly, thus saving lives in the long run. He similarly brought the sword to bear on Indians off the reservation to potentially save their lives by putting them on well-run government agencies. His strategy established reservations all over the West, and Native Americans have kept them in existence and significant. Although reservations are not ideal places for many reasons, few American Indians want them to end. That is the significance of Grant's Indian policy that has been lost on historians and leaves a new avenue for future research.

Woman Suffrage and Citizenship in the Midwest, 1870–1920, by Sara Egge. Iowa and the Midwest Experience Series. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press, 2018. xi, 233 pp. Maps, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$85 paperback.

Reviewer Pam Stek recently received her Ph.D. in history from the University of Iowa. Her dissertation was titled "Immigrant Women's Political Activism in Iowa, Minnesota, and Wisconsin, 1880–1920."

In *Woman Suffrage and Citizenship in the Midwest, 1870–1920*, Sara Egge argues convincingly that midwestern suffragists' struggles to gain the vote are best viewed through the frame of their spirited and deter-

mined efforts to help settle the region and develop community institutions. Over time, women in Iowa, Minnesota, and South Dakota built their claims for the ballot on the foundation of civic responsibility, community leadership, and wartime loyalty. Suffrage victories did not come easily, but midwestern women persevered, continually reevaluating and honing their message and strategies until the ratification of the Nineteenth Amendment solidified women's political equality.

In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, midwestern suffrage activists, like those in other parts of the nation, invested substantial time and energy in the fight for the ballot but realized few significant gains. The national women's rights movement faced internecine struggles in the latter decades of the nineteenth century; the 1869 split into two rival factions hampered concerted activism. During those early years, as Egge shows, women in Iowa, Minnesota, and South Dakota started organizing suffrage associations that would later form the backbone of support for state suffrage amendments. Just as importantly, however, they also began to develop political identities and skills through their membership in women's clubs, temperance organizations, and church-based ladies' aid societies, as they worked to advance the construction and development of churches, schools, parks, and libraries. They claimed a civic presence while working within gendered boundaries of female respectability.

The reemergence in 1890 of a unified national suffrage organization, following the merger of the National Woman Suffrage Association with its rival, the American Woman Suffrage Association, coincided with an escalation of suffrage activism in the Midwest. As Egge points out, South Dakota suffrage activists supported three suffrage amendments in the 1890s, all of which were defeated for various reasons, including woman suffrage's association with temperance reform, tensions between state and local leaders, and the difficulties suffrage workers faced in traveling across the state to make their case to voters. Suffragists in Iowa and Minnesota also failed to achieve any victories during these years, but they continued to organize and adapt.

Part of that adaptation involved reevaluating the basis of women's claims for full citizenship. Egge demonstrates that during the early years of the movement, suffrage leaders tended to structure their calls for the ballot in terms of women's equal rights. As the years rolled on with few tangible successes, suffragists began to reframe their claim for the vote in the language of municipal housekeeping: women's inherent morality and virtue positioned them as able and indeed vital members of the body politic. These arguments resonated more strongly with midwestern voters than did those based on more radical ideas about

female equality. In the years between 1900 and 1916 suffrage campaigns in Iowa, Minnesota, and South Dakota continued to end in defeat, but the cause was slowly gaining increased support among voters.

In 1917 U.S. entry into World War I allowed suffragists to use civic duty and national loyalty as a means to claim full citizenship rights. As Egge shows, midwestern suffrage leaders embraced the war effort, and suffrage workers' reputations as skilled and savvy community organizers allowed them to transform their work for the ballot into home-front mobilization. Wartime exigencies also allowed native-born suffrage activists to counterpose their demonstrated patriotism against the suspect sensibilities of European immigrants, a group that midwestern suffragists had always blamed for their electoral defeats. Suffragists' efforts to claim political equality in exchange for wartime service paid off with the ratification of the Nineteenth Amendment to the Constitution, which guaranteed women's right to vote, on August 18, 1920.

Egge's study is a local one that focuses on one county in each state: Clay County in Iowa, Lyon County in Minnesota, and Yankton County in South Dakota. That approach allows her to dig deeply into local newspapers, community histories, church documents, personal correspondence, and other records preserved in county museums, public libraries, and community centers. It permits an understanding of suffrage work in the context of activists' daily lives, as part of their interactions with others in their communities and in concert with their efforts to develop local institutions and services. Suffragists were not just activists; they were also wives, mothers, neighbors, and church members. Examining their grassroots struggle for political equality allows readers to see the movement as its adherents did, as part of a larger effort to build social and political institutions in the rural Midwest.

This kind of study allows for a deeper understanding of local concerns and strategies, but Egge does not address the question of whether her conclusions are equally applicable to other counties in the states under examination, including urban, industrializing areas. Suffrage activists in rural counties may have used different strategies, pursued different goals, and had at their disposal different resources than did suffragists in metropolitan areas. Also, as Egge points out, suffrage leaders in rural counties often blamed immigrant men for standing in the way of woman suffrage. Limited local studies do not address the extent to which German and Scandinavian immigrant suffragists shared those views. Women like Clara Heckrich, the corresponding secretary of the Minnesota Woman Suffrage Association in Minneapolis and a second-generation German immigrant, and members of the Minnesota Scandinavian Woman Suffrage Association, which was based in the

Twin Cities and made up of women of Swedish, Norwegian, and Danish descent, comprehended citizenship and suffrage through the lens of their experiences as immigrants. Focusing on just three counties limits our appreciation of the movement's diversity in these three states and of the ways different groups of midwestern women understood and worked for political equality.

Despite these limitations of scope, *Woman Suffrage and Citizenship in the Midwest* offers valuable insight into midwestern women's long, difficult struggle for the ballot and provides compelling analysis of what their suffrage activism can tell us about gender, citizenship, and national belonging.

Crusader for Democracy: The Political Life of William Allen White, by Charles Delgadillo. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2018. vii, 315 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$34.95 hardcover.

Reviewer Jeff Wells is associate professor of history at the University of Nebraska at Kearney. His current research focuses on the journalists of the Farmers' Alliance and the People's Party.

William Allen White gained widespread attention with his 1896 anti-Populist editorial, "What's the Matter with Kansas?" He continued to influence national politics for more than four decades. Other biographers emphasize White's midwestern values and relationship with his home town of Emporia, Kansas; in *Crusader for Democracy* Charles Delgadillo explores how White applied his regional small-town ideology during his career as a national political figure.

Throughout the early twentieth century, White (1868–1944) was the voice of the midwestern middle class. He bought the *Emporia Gazette* in 1896 but cultivated an audience far beyond Kansas as a writer for influential progressive magazines, as a novelist, and as a syndicated correspondent at major events such as the Versailles Peace Conference and the Washington Naval Conference. He broke from the influence of a political boss to become an independent voice for reform within the Republican Party, which dominated Kansas politics. He admired and befriended Theodore Roosevelt and forged relationships with his successors. His extensive international travel informed his commentary. In the Soviet Union, White observed that the Russians had exchanged liberty for security and peace. His tours of fascist countries convinced him that social justice was a national security issue. He was a liberal internationalist during the 1920s, when the GOP was defined by conservatives and isolationists, yet he remained loyal to the party throughout his career, with the notable exceptions of his support for his hero Theo-