

Lincoln's Mercenaries: Economic Motivation among Union Soldiers during the Civil War

Donald C. Elder III

Eastern New Mexico University

ISSN 0003-4827

Copyright © 2019 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation

Elder, Donald C. III "Lincoln's Mercenaries: Economic Motivation among Union Soldiers during the Civil War." *The Annals of Iowa* 78 (2019), 300-302.

Available at: <https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.12594>

Hosted by [Iowa Research Online](#)

given the scope of his study, but this is Indian history, with its own milestones, rather than those of the invading whites.

By the author's own admission, this is a work of synthesis rather than original research, but what a synthesis! Conventional history rubs elbows with "The Ceremonial Landscape of the Newark Earthworks and the Raccoon Creek Valley." The bibliography alone is worth the purchase price. If I had a complaint, which I really do not, it would be that perhaps Nichols has tried to do too much: events, nations, individuals, and numbers relentlessly confront the reader. I have an advanced degree in the subject and I often found myself having to come up for air. I offer this only as a warning to the casual reader. *Peoples of the Inland Sea* offers a comprehensive, succinct analysis of a vast and complex topic. Nichols has done a great service for teachers and students alike. This will be the standard short survey for many years to come.

Lincoln's Mercenaries: Economic Motivation among Union Soldiers during the Civil War, by William Marvel. *Conflicting Worlds: New Dimensions of the American Civil War Series*. Baton Rouge, LA: LSU Press, 2018. xviii, 329 pp. Illustrations, tables, notes, bibliography, index. \$48 hardcover.

Reviewer Donald C. Elder III is professor of history at Eastern New Mexico University. He is the editor of *Love Amid the Turmoil: The Civil War Letters of William and Mary Vermilion* (2003) and *A Damned Iowa Greyhound: The Civil War Letters of William Henry Harrison Clayton* (1998).

After reading *Lincoln's Mercenaries*, students of the Civil War may have to reconsider their conclusions regarding the primary reason why individuals from Northern states decided to enlist in the military. Author William Marvel challenges the widely held notion that individuals who volunteered for service in the Union Army did so largely for patriotic reasons. He argues instead that economic considerations played a far larger role than historians have realized or acknowledged. His well-crafted monograph should cause anyone interested in the motivation of Union Civil War volunteers to reexamine long-held assumptions.

Marvel begins by examining the historiography relating to enlistment, noting that many authors discount evidence of volunteers enlisting military service for financial reasons; they choose instead to focus on other considerations, usually patriotism or mere wanderlust. Since these authors could only do rudimentary statistical computations based on the census of 1860 to inform their analyses, many of them discounted such evidence, instead using memoirs or regimental histories as the

basis for their conclusions. But the creation of the University of Minnesota's Integrated Public Use Microdata Series allowed Marvel to calculate the median wealth of volunteers from 94 companies representing every Northern state, giving him the ability to determine what sector of the American economy provided the greatest number of those enlistees. With few exceptions, he determined that the lower socioeconomic portion of the Northern population provided a disproportionately high number of volunteers—or, as he puts it, "The percentage of poorer soldiers stood impressively high" across both time and distance.

To support his thesis, Marvel examines the state of the American economy as the American Civil War began in 1861. Dealt a severe blow by the Panic of 1857, the financial vitality of the Northern states suffered a further setback when Southern states started to secede from the Union in 1860. From the industrial cities of the Northeast to the farmlands of the Midwest, the marginally employed elements of the Northern populace found their economic livelihood threatened. Given the level of distress, it seems logical to Marvel to assume that poor young men in Northern states would have had a keen desire to secure a regular source of pay through enlistment.

Clearly, the economic malaise in 1861 could in large measure explain why the majority of the young men who volunteered at the start of the war did so, but most of the 75,000 individuals who came forward enlisted in regiments that would serve only 90 days. The vast majority of the individuals who fought for the Union would therefore volunteer at a later date and for longer durations. Thus, Marvel felt compelled to consider whether the later volunteers had an economic status similar to that of the first wave of enlistees. Dividing the war into seven distinct phases of enlistment in the Union Army, Marvel suggests that the poorer elements of the Northern populace continued to be overrepresented in the military. The only exception to this rule came whenever the Lincoln administration authorized the creation of 100-day regiments. A majority of the members of those units, which rarely saw combat, often came from more affluent circumstances. Economic necessity as a motivating factor therefore appears to ring true throughout the entire course of the Civil War, rather than just during the economic lull that existed at the start of the conflict.

Anyone interested in the Civil War would enjoy reading this book, but individuals with a connection to the state of Iowa will find *Lincoln's Mercenaries* particularly engaging. Because the Hawkeye State had the second-lowest median wealth in 1860, Marvel frequently uses Iowa as an example to illustrate his thesis regarding economic motivation dur-

ing the conflict. For example, he argues that the narrow range of average income levels for three-year enlistees from Iowa reflects the poor economic state of affairs there much more than it does a greater desire of the more affluent Iowans to enlist than in other Northern states. In addition to analyzing the statistical data for Iowa, Marvel also includes passages from the diaries, letters, and memoirs of quite a few individuals from the state who served in the Union Army. *Lincoln's Mercenaries* would thus appeal to many *Annals of Iowa* readers.

"It's a rich man's war but a poor man's fight" is a phrase that many associate with the Union cause during the American Civil War. Quite a few historians, if they accept the statement's validity at all, believe that it could only apply to the period of time after the Lincoln administration created a conscription system in 1863 that allowed for a monetary commutation. William Marvel, however, has forcefully argued that the phrase holds true for the entirety of the conflict. Based on meticulous research, *Lincoln's Mercenaries* has changed forever the paradigm regarding Union motivation, and will undoubtedly lead others to examine his thesis on an even larger scale in the near future.

"The Most Complete Political Machine Ever Known": The North's Union Leagues and the American Civil War, by Paul Taylor. Civil War in the North Series. Kent, OH: Kent State University Press, 2018. xiv, 322 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$45 hardcover.

Reviewer Wallace Hettle is professor of history at the University of Northern Iowa. He is the author of *Stonewall Jackson: A Civil War Hero in History and Memory* (2011) and *The Peculiar Democracy: Southern Democrats in Peace and War* (2001).

In this concise yet ambitious book Paul Taylor examines the Civil War Union Leagues in the North. Pro-Republican Union Leagues in the South during Reconstruction have received ample scholarly treatment. Those organizations, however, had their roots in the North during the Civil War.

Although the Union Leagues have received relatively little scholarly attention, the author fits their story into a growing literature on loyalty and patriotism on the Union home front. It is no mystery why the Confederacy persisted at the ballot box and on the battlefield: Confederates could not imagine a world without slavery. In 1861 Confederate Vice-President Alexander Stephens famously called slavery the "cornerstone" of their society. While division among white Southerners existed, Confederate unity can be readily grasped.