

Women against Abortion: Inside the Largest Moral Reform Movement of the Twentieth Century

Alicia Gutierrez-Romine
La Sierra University

ISSN 0003-4827

Copyright © 2019 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation

Gutierrez-Romine, Alicia. "Women against Abortion: Inside the Largest Moral Reform Movement of the Twentieth Century." *The Annals of Iowa* 78 (2019), 320-322.

Available at: <https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.12606>

Hosted by [Iowa Research Online](#)

This is Marilyn's story, but it touches on issues social historians have explored through patient letters from other times and other sanatoria: the limits of medical authority; institutional culture; ways that patients operate within and upon an institution; the effect of disease stigma on the social identity of an individual or group; the degree of boundary permeability between institution and outside world. Krugerud does not address these issues explicitly, and the context and occasional interpretation of Marilyn's excerpts at times seem to be assumed knowledge rather than researched. That this book is not intended for an academic readership is evident from the seven endnotes, none of which reference the archival material or denote page location. The missing research trail and lack of historiographical context notwithstanding, Mary Krugerud introduces an important source to which future scholars will add analysis. Ultimately, Marilyn Barnes's letters are engaging, eliciting a vanished cultural and institutional era to be appreciated by generalists and specialists alike.

Women against Abortion: Inside the Largest Moral Reform Movement of the Twentieth Century, by Karissa Haugeberg. *Women, Gender, and Sexuality in American History*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2017. viii, 220 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$95 hardcover, \$24.95 paperback.

Reviewer Alicia Gutierrez-Romine is assistant professor of history at La Sierra University. She is the author of *From Back Alley to the Border: Criminal Abortion in California, 1920–1969* (forthcoming).

In *Women Against Abortion*, Karissa Haugeberg unearths the history of the pro-life movement from its beginnings in grassroots movements throughout the Midwest, and the women who made the movement possible. Haugeberg argues that while we may today associate aggressive anti-abortion strategies with evangelical Protestant men, conservative white women developed these strategies as early as the 1960s, forming their own grassroots organizations — characterized by less formal structures and hierarchies — when national anti-abortion movements were too “slow-moving” or prioritized fetal rights over women's interests (7).

Focusing on a number of high-profile women in the early anti-abortion movement, including Marjory Mecklenburg, Dr. Mildred Jefferson, July Loesch, Joan Andrews, and Shelley Shannon, Haugeberg seeks to answer two questions: Why did these women participate in a movement dedicated to ending abortion, and how did they find fulfillment and empowerment in this work? These women came to the anti-abortion movement through diverse avenues — religion, conservative ideologies,

even progressive, social justice reform. Haugeberg explains how these early anti-abortion activists set the stage for the modern pro-life movement with the tactics they employed – Crisis Pregnancy Centers, medical misinformation, protests, and violence – and the alliances they forged, with the Catholic church and the Republican Party, among others.

One of the points Haugeberg makes that is of particular interest is the notion that violence in the anti-abortion movement was not something that emerged isolated over time; rather, it existed early on in the movement. Haugeberg also does an excellent job of explaining how one place in the Midwest, Minnesota in particular, became the site for a local movement that turned national in scope. Haugeberg's main focus is not the place where these women were performing their grassroots activism, but it does provide insight into how a patchwork of community organizations can mobilize to create a national movement through their own tireless work. However, aside from a few sentences on demography scattered throughout the book, there is not much of an explanation for why Minnesota proved to be a hotbed of early anti-abortion activity.

Haugeberg's analyses of race, gender, and religion are also important to the book. She notes that many of the women who became involved in the anti-abortion movement were women who did not see the feminist reforms of the 1960s and 1970s as movements that would benefit them – instead, the women who became involved in the anti-abortion movement saw the reform movements as indictments against their choices and as threats “to a social order that had shaped their lives” (3). Except for Dr. Jefferson, the women that Haugeberg discusses are white, working or middle class, and religious. This means that when they turned to more aggressive strategies to combat abortion – like chaining themselves to equipment, storming clinics, or trespassing – they faced minimal legal consequences (usually community service or a few days in jail), allowing them to be effective towards that end.

For many women of the anti-abortion movement, their involvement in the movement required a sort of mental gymnastics. They encouraged pregnant women to adopt traditional gender roles at the same time that they were outside the home and becoming politically active. However, many of the women framed their involvement as an extension of their maternal instincts – not unlike the arguments white women made or used in colonial or imperial projects, or at any other time that white women needed to justify political involvement or leaving the home. Even the women who were involved in the more extreme and violent aspects of the pro-life movement often framed their defense of violence along gendered lines.

If the records were available, I would have appreciated more discussion of Dr. Jefferson or other nonwhite contemporaries who were part of the anti-abortion movement. Additionally, on occasion, Haugeberg's examples, though relevant and supportive, do not always align or coincide with the specific moment she's speaking about. These are minor points that do not distract from the fact that Haugeberg has produced a fascinating study of the early roots of the pro-life movement that should be read by anyone with an interest in women's history, or who wants to trace the genealogy of the modern pro-life movement.

Color Coded: Party Politics in the American West, 1950–2016, by Walter Nugent. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2018. x, 374 pp. Illustrations, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$34.95 hardcover.

Reviewer Cory Haala is a Ph.D. candidate in history at Marquette University. He is working on a dissertation on midwestern liberalism in the age of Reagan.

If the 2016 elections shattered understandings of modern American political history, the 2018 midterms exacerbated the difficulty of piecing it back together. Yet, to University of Notre Dame professor emeritus Walter Nugent, over a half-century of elections necessitates a narrative characterizing the politics of the American West.

Using the U.S. Census definition of the West, plus the plains states from the Dakotas to Texas, Nugent surveys the political changes of America's western half since 1950 and groups each state into one of five categories: states turning Republican, such as Texas; "reliably red" Great Plains states; swing states Montana, Colorado, Nevada, Arizona, and New Mexico; states becoming Democratic, such as Oregon and California; and thoroughly Democratic states (Hawaii and Washington). The result is a wealth of resources for scholars of western politics, including an appendix listing more than 5,000 electoral results for governorships, U.S. Senate seats, congressional races, and electoral votes. (State legislative control could have been given longer shrift, at least in similar tables in the appendix. For an example, see Michael J. Dubin, *Party Affiliations in the State Legislatures: A Year by Year Summary, 1796–2006* [2007].)

Nugent argues that two primary developments underlie these modern classifications. First, energetic party building by men like Oklahoma's Harvey Bellmon and South Dakota's George McGovern shifted power balances in one-party states. Second, incumbency and "the friendly drawing of district lines" reinforced political hierarchies in deep-red Texas and bright-blue California through processes like gerrymandering (255). Demographic shifts turned states like Colorado and