Writing the Trail: Five Women's Frontier Narratives

Gayle R. Davis

Grand Valley State University

ISSN 0003-4827
Copyright © 2009 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.1298

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
ence of having written an earlier book on courts, gender, and law in colonial New York. She has also coedited three volumes of early American Indian documents involving U.S.-Indian treaties.

In producing such a major study, Rosen has used appropriate research sources with a balance of legal documents consisting of numerous court cases and laws. The primary research is enhanced by an extensive use of secondary sources. The bibliography will help readers interested in following up on specific topics.

People in states with native populations on reservations will find this book pertinent to the understanding of state-tribal relations. Rosen dissolves the mystery of Indian treaties, taxation, and defining Indian land as she explains the legal complexity of each of these important issues. Readers interested in the history of Iowa and the Midwest will learn about the long treaty history leading to land cessions by tribes to the United States for white settlement. For those with questions about Indian gaming, the legal authority originating from treaties and trust lands for tribal casinos is found in the lengthy federal Indian policy that Rosen writes about, although Rosen does not specifically discuss Indian gaming.

Rosen has made an impressive contribution to the fields of Indian law and U.S.-Indian history. Scholars such as Laurence Hauptman, Jean O’Brien, and Brad Asher have written insightful state-tribal histories. Rosen’s work takes the next big step by developing the larger picture of the historical and legal development of state and territorial laws affecting native people. Her timely and important book will help readers understand the evolving state-tribal relations in the early twenty-first century.

Writing the Trail: Five Women’s Frontier Narratives, by Deborah Lawrence. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press, 2006. ix, 158 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth.

Reviewer Gayle R. Davis is provost and vice president for academic affairs at Grand Valley State University. Her list of publications includes “Women’s Frontier Diaries: Writing for Good Reason” (Women’s Studies, 1987).

In Writing the Trail, Deborah Lawrence analyzes five frontier narratives, each written by different women who traveled pioneer trails of the United States between 1846 and 1870. Taken together, the narratives signal the variety and strength of women’s frontier writing, an underutilized but valuable literary category that Lawrence believes has a place in the academic canons of U.S. literature and history. She claims
that her subject “is neither social history nor literary history, but a literary analysis of the way in which five women’s westering journeys encouraged their change and the way their growth is related to the narrative movement of their texts” (3).

For this study, Lawrence selected authors who each created a different type of personal writing. With a chapter of the volume devoted to each pioneer writer, there is space enough for brief samplings of the selected authors’ work, along with Lawrence’s analysis. The first chapter treats the diary of Susan Shelley Magoffin, the first such narrative written by an Anglo-American woman on the Santa Fe Trail and published in 1926. Second is a spiritual narrative of Sarah Bayliss Royce, one of the few women in the early California gold rush, who wrote to inspire her son to return to his religious faith. The third author is Louise Smith Clapper, whose “letters” from the trail were actually composed after completing her western travels. Fourth is Eliza Burnhams Farnham’s autobiography of her westward pioneering that was specifically intended for publication. And the fifth selection, by Lydia Spencer Lane, was a treatise that sought to encourage young army wives who were unwilling pioneers on the westward frontier.

Lawrence’s book is well researched, including thorough endnotes and an expansive bibliography as well as photographs of most of the five pioneers and maps of their particular western routes. Her work builds on the flowering of scholarship about women’s personal writing on the western frontier that has occurred over the past several decades. The increased attention to these genres has engendered reprints and first publications of pioneer works themselves and ever deepening analyses by current researchers. Lawrence further develops several threads of this growing body of scholarly work in themes such as the place of “character” in the narratives, travel as emblematic of personal transformation, and the mediation of gender roles and the “artifice of separate spheres” (58) in frontier environments. Writing the Trail reveals the conscious and unconscious efforts of these five frontier women to define themselves as they encountered extreme and changing circumstances. In doing so, the book provides glimpses into the deeper nature of these individual women as historical and literary actors.

Noting the women’s varying positive or negative descriptions of the unknown landscape, forms of nature, and diverse peoples, Lawrence demonstrates the varied approaches each author used as her journey progressed in order to adjust to her new experiences away from the familiar comforts of a former home space. She shows how the dislocation fostered growth in self-reliance and perspective in most of these women, a comment on the potentially restrictive nature of taking
the usual path, well inside the borders of “civilization,” as opposed to
the risk and opportunity of breaking a trail in an unfamiliar world.

*A People at War: Civilians and Soldiers in America's Civil War, 1854–1877*,
by Scott Nelson and Carol Sheriff. New York: Oxford University Press,
2008. xii, 372 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, chronologies, bibliography,
index. $25.00 cloth, $24.95 paper.

Reviewer William Feis is professor of history at Buena Vista University. He is
the author of *Grant's Secret Service: The Intelligence War from Belmont to Appomattox* (2002).

Among the many Civil War books published each year a few gems
always stand out. *A People at War*, by Scott Nelson and Carol Sheriff, is
certainly one. Against the backdrop of military and political events,
Nelson and Sheriff focus on the experiences of common people whose
names and lives are not lost to history, just relegated to its footnotes.
Their approach fits perfectly within the “New Military History,”
which is the study of warfare and societies or, as the authors assert,
the examination of “enlisted men, substitutes, deserters, guerrillas,
[and] medical personnel—not to mention the millions of civilians for
whom the war was a day-to-day reality” (ix).

To set the stage, the authors spotlight an April 1865 photograph of
a group of individuals taken outside the Washington offices of the U.S.
Christian Commission. The image includes two Union amputees, a
grim-looking Confederate soldier, a variety of women, and several
well-dressed males, as well as common laborers, a few children, and
one African American. The image captures a moment when all walks
of wartime life mingled together. The purpose of the book, the authors
contend, is to “animate this frozen image” (ix). Under five themes the
authors examine everything from the “passions that led to the war”
and formed the foundation for wartime behavior and beliefs to the ef-
forts of leaders on both sides either to conform to the attitudes of their
respective peoples or to gain their support for larger politico-military
goals (x). The book begins in “Bleeding Kansas” and ends with the
Election of 1877. In between, the authors use multiple voices to connect
events, attitudes, and experiences of ordinary civilians and soldiers to
the eventual outcome, impact, and ultimate meaning of the war. Amaz-
ingly, the authors accomplish this with a minimum of confusion, which
is remarkable given the book’s pace and the vast and disparate topics.

In an ambitious study such as this, however, errors of fact and
interpretation are inevitable. For example, the authors assert that,