TEACHING MEDIEVAL WOMEN

"THE LITERARY TRADITIONS OF MEDIEVAL WOMEN" (1997 NEH SUMMER INSTITUTE): INTRODUCTION, DESCRIPTION AND READING LIST

The National Endowment for the Humanities Summer Institute on "The Literary Traditions of Medieval Women" directed by Jane Chance, Professor of English at Rice University, in Houston, Texas, was held from June 9–July 17, 1997, with twenty-five participants (college and university instructors, most of them from English departments), assistant director Mathew Kuefler, Visiting Lecturer of History at Rice University, and nine guest lecturers. This Institute examined the literary traditions of both major and minor medieval women writers from England, France, Italy, Spain, and Germany, as well as Central and Eastern Europe, Scandinavia, and the Byzantine Empire, between the ninth and the fifteenth centuries. Most of the women writers read during the Institute wrote in the vernacular. The purpose of the Institute was to outline the shape of a female literary tradition, or traditions, with singular literary conventions and topoi separate from that of the medieval literary traditions associated with male Latin and vernacular poets.

Because the shape of a writing identifiably female, an écriture féminine, has been suggested for medieval women authors only relatively recently, the concept has yet to become part of the literary canon. The Norton Anthology of English Literature continues to list Margery Kempe and Julian of Norwich as token medieval women, confined within a skimpy sixteen pages, although the anthology of Women’s Writing in Middle English edited by Alexandra Barratt (1992; reviewed in this issue of MFN) lays out the possibility of twenty-five texts by women available in English in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. A specifically female tradition of medieval writing has been fostered by means of recent translations such as Christine de Pizan’s Book of the City of Ladies (by Earl Jeffrey Richards, 1982) and seminal anthologies such as Medieval Women Writers (by Katharina Wilson, 1984) and Medieval Women’s Visionary Literature (by Elizabeth Avilda Petroff, 1986). The Encyclopedia of Medieval Women by Katharina Wilson and Nadia Margolis lists a total of 945 entries from 500–1500 in England and Europe. This recent work on medieval women attempts to redress two misconceptions: that medieval women were not literate and that what they wrote was mediocre in comparison to writing by male authors. It does so as if in agreement with fifteenth-century poet and scholar Christine de Pizan in a famous passage at the opening of Book of the City of Ladies, in which she finds a remedium for the misogyny of medieval scholars in her own experience and reading—that is, from within herself, in the the female allegorical
personifications of Reason, Justice, and Righteousness. Perspective, Christine might conclude, is the first principle behind learning to read texts by women differently. The gendering of female reading and writing thus becomes of paramount importance, as Susan Schibanoff reminds us in "Taking the Gold Back to Egypt: The Art of Reading as a Woman" (1986): "What is still crucial for us to examine now is how and why some female readers resist immasculation and others succumb to it, for our literary texts and traditions remain largely male-made" (100–101). Medieval women authors for the most part ignored heroic epic poems, didactic or moral poetry, and social satire and appropriated as their own the courtly lyric, epistolary and visionary poems, romances long and short, and mystical and confessional (autobiographical) works. Such gendering of genre in the Middle Ages appears in recent studies of mystical writings by continental and English women (Caroline Walker Bynum, Barbara Newman); troubairitz lyrics (Meg Bogen; Laurie Finke); and courtly romances and allegories by professional writers such as Marie de France and Christine de Pizan (Robert Krueger; Kevin Brownlee; Maureen Quilligan).

Because so few medieval women who wrote (and almost none outside the French and English traditions) have been anthologized or taught in traditional literary surveys in language departments, the Institute functioned to aid in the changing of the canon: first, by disseminating texts previously inaccessible; second, by discovering and articulating new ways of reading these specific texts; and third, by defining and characterizing the scope of a female literary tradition to which they belong. This subject area is now exploding in publications and conferences and symposia, which makes it difficult for college teachers to take account of this "new" field of study. By inviting as guest lecturers some of the scholars whose recent publications have helped to revolutionize study in this area, the Institute also helped to facilitate a dialogue among teachers drawn from Classics (specifically Latin and Medieval Latin), Comparative Literature, English, French, German, History, Humanities, Music, Philosophy, and Religion. The Institute's focus fell on strategies for teaching these noncanonical authors. Each participant was required to construct a syllabus for a new course, or adapt one from an existing course, that would be presented at a Roundtable on the last day of the Institute and thereafter offered at the home institution during the following year.

The materials that follow provide, first, a description of the Institute, along with a reading list, and, second, four exemplary course or assignment descriptions. Daniel T. Kline discusses the problem of including medieval and other early women writers in an already dense sophomore British literature survey; Lisa Robeson describes an upper-level course in "Arthurian Women"; Deanna Delmar Evans presents one performance assignment involving Christine de Pizan's role in the "Quarrel of the Rose" that generated public interest in
medieval women; and Jane Jeffrey and Ulrike Wiethaus describe an innovative course in medieval women and film.

Other course descriptions by ten participants and the director of this institute will appear in the forthcoming MLA collection, Approaches to Teaching Medieval Women, edited by guest lecturer Katharina Wilson. A guest issue of College Literature on Medieval Feminist Pedagogy is being edited by NEH Institute participant Jane Jeffrey.

STRUCTURE OF THE INSTITUTE
Generally, participants met in the mornings on Monday, Tuesday, Thursday, and Friday for seminars and workshops conducted by core faculty and guest lecturers. On Tuesday and Thursday afternoons they met to exchange their own ideas about texts read, to participate in readings of texts or to perform them, or to debate pedagogical strategies for including these texts in their own courses. Films such as Chris Newby's The Anchoress were shown and recordings of trobairitz lyrics played. Other afternoons were reserved for reading or field trips to examine manuscripts and art collections. On Wednesday mornings the director and visiting faculty conducted individual appointments with participants. The Institute also offered, in addition to social events and additional evening receptions, optional lectures relating to the subject of medieval women.

To facilitate the greatest possible participation, and also because of the breadth of this new "canon," and the reading it entails, all works with the exception of the Middle English were read in translation. There is another reason for this: many of these texts in the original language are available only in inaccessible, out-of-print, or expensive editions. Copies of the original editions were placed on reserve or made available through an Institute reading room. Included in a packet of readings were the two-cassette recording, "Voicing Medieval Women," edited by Jocelyn Wogan-Brown for the Chaucer Studio, with readings in Middle English, Old Norse, Provençal, Middle French, and Latin performed by contemporary women scholars (1996), and the five-cassette recording by Alexandra Barrett of Julian of Norwich's Revelations of Love (1993). While prior knowledge of the works was not required, participants were encouraged to acquire and to read ahead the texts necessary for the Institute before departure.

WEEK 1. INTRODUCTION: READING MEDIEVAL WOMEN
Elizabeth Grosz, Personal Chair and Director of Philosophy and Critical Theory, University of Monash, Melbourne, Australia; Laurie Finke, Professor and Chair, Study of Women and Gender, Kenyon College; and Barbara Harlow, Professor of English, University of Texas.
To explore the question of how to read medieval women, Institute participants began with recent examples of gender and feminist reader-response theory and how it can be used to understand texts by medieval women. Elizabeth Grosz introduced the topic with a seminar on feminism, power, and bodies on Monday, after the formal Introduction to the Institute by the director. Laurie Finke, core faculty member this week, conducted two seminars, one on feminist and gender theory, on Tuesday, the second on contemporary theory and texts by medieval women, on Thursday.

On Tuesday participants divided into two groups to discuss Diana Fuss’s essay, “Reading like a Feminist,” and the Finke essay, Chapter One of Feminist Theory, Women’s Writing.

On Wednesday afternoon participants examined the illuminated manuscripts and incunabula owned by the Rare Book Collection of the Houston Public Library.

In a workshop on Thursday morning Barbara Harlow demonstrated the ways in which women in modern third world countries have opposed, resisted, and subverted totalitarian governments and survived imprisonment and torture by means of the example of the South African writer Ruth First, which she supplemented with film clips. On Thursday afternoon participants, along with lecturers Chance, Finke, and Harlow, examined passages in Hildegard’s medical text, Causae et curae (On Natural Philosophy and Medicine), in the light of Barbara Harlow’s presentation on resistance. We looked for what Monique Wittig describes as the “crablike” way that women make their entrance in a text when gender, having been imposed, deprives women of “the authority of speech.”

On Friday Laurie Finke led a discussion about Trotula, medical writing by women, and the question of authorship and textual authority. Additional readings for both Thursday and Friday included the first two chapters of Joan Cadden, The Meanings of Sex Difference in the Middle Ages: Medicine, Science, and Culture, and articles by Monica Green and John Benton on Trotula.

**WEEK 2. LATIN WRITINGS BY WOMEN BEFORE THE TWELFTH CENTURY: GENDER, HAGIOGRAPHY, AND THE FATHERS; THE LATIN PLAYS OF HROTSVIT OF GANDERSHEIM (10TH C.); AND THE LETTERS OF HELOISE (12TH C.)**

Katharina Wilson, Josiah Meigs Professor of Comparative Literature, University of Georgia

To begin the Institute’s examination of writing by women it was helpful to explore the “material culture”—the architecture and archaeology—in which these women wrote. Most early writing by women took place between the ninth
and the twelfth centuries within the monastery. There women were educated and educated others. They might devote themselves to the copying of manuscripts and therefore also needed to be taught Latin in order to do so. This week was devoted to the shaping of early monastic writing by women by the fact of convent life, specifically the material spaces of medieval religious structures and architecture, the way a convent was constructed, the fact of the nuns’ claustration away from the external world, and the ways in which the nunnery differed in its effect on women from those of the abbey on men. For example, nunneries were often situated in out-of-the-way places whose isolation would ensure the preservation of chastity and avoidance of contact with the outside world, but they were rarely economically self-sufficient like male (or double) houses, which enforced a dependency on the order and therefore greater external control of the convent. Further, given the monastic ideal of depersonalization within the monastic community, there could be little difference between gender role and gender identity for these medieval women, that is, between cultural expectations for sexual behavior and private experience of a gender role reflective of an individual’s femininity. Participants read the first two chapters of Roberta Gilchrist, Gender and Material Culture: The Archaeology of Religious Women, “The Handmaid’s Tale” and “Mapping Women’s Religious Communities,” pp. 1-62, in preparation for Katharina Wilson’s seminar on Monday. Also at hand were Hrotvit’s legends, as represented by “Pelagius” and “Basilius.” The Latin pilgrimage of Egeria to the Holy Land (written in the fourth century) helped to frame the discussion.

These material differences are expressed explicitly in the Latin convent plays of the tenth-century female Benedictine canon Hrotvit of Gandersheim, in Saxony (modern Germany). Gender differences in education and the production of writing helped to shape her choice of subjects, form, and language. The remainder of the week was devoted to an exploration of gender and material space in her Christian conversion plays with late antique settings, such as Callimachus and Dulcitus, in which conversion to Christianity empowers women despite the pagan (and usually foolish or ignorant) rulers who regard obedience to their edicts as testimony of masculine power, and the monastic plays Abraham and Paphnutius, involving women who are cloistered as a means of control by their male guardians. On Friday Wilson discussed selected Latin Letters of another cloistered woman, the twelfth-century Heloise, on desire-love, monasticism, marriage, and the gender specificity of career opportunities.

Sessions on Tuesday and Thursday focused on strategies for staging or performing one play (normally about thirty minutes in length) within the undergraduate classroom, with parts selected by participants, and a videotaped performance on Friday evening.
WEEK 3, PART I. MEMOIRS AND BIOGRAPHY: WOMEN WRITERS FROM CENTRAL AND EASTERN EUROPE, SCANDINAVIA, AND THE BYZANTINE EMPIRE (12TH-15TH C.)
Katharina Wilson

The little-known and doubly-marginalized writings of women from Central and Eastern Europe, Scandinavia, and Byzantium, primarily from the twelfth to fifteenth centuries, were discussed in seminars on Monday and Tuesday conducted by Katharina Wilson, the core faculty member for this week, who provided unpublished excerpts drawn from her research. First she presented a short contextual survey of the history of female writing in those regions, traditions of female mythographies, Valkyries, warrior maidens, heroic virginity, etc. (Nibelungenlied, Gudrun, Edda). Among the texts included were those of Anna Comnena in Greek (Alexiad), Eudocia (St. Cyprian, Homeroentones), Skaldenut, Lea Ráskai (responsible for a fascinating adaptation of Hrotsvit’s Dulcitius, applied to impending Turkish danger), Elisabeth von Nassau-Saarbrucken, Helene Kottaner, a chambermaid in Austria whose memoirs of her service to the Empress left an indelible historical record of the period, Walada (Hispano-Arabic), Therese of Portugal, and Queen Olga of Russia.

Teaching the memoir was the subject of participant discussion on Tuesday afternoon. On Wednesday, a trip to the Menil Collection of Byzantine art followed by a tour of the Medieval and Renaissance collection of the Museum of Fine Arts provided insight into the cultural differences apparent in western and eastern forms.

WEEK 3. PART II. GENDER, DESIRE, AND WOMEN’S HONOR IN MEDIEVAL FRENCH COURTLY LITERATURE: MARIE DE FRANCE TO THE TROBAIRITZ AND BEYOND
Roberta Krueger, Leonard C. Ferguson Professor of French, Hamilton College

On Thursday morning, Roberta Krueger discussed selected fables and lais of Marie de France, whose identity as female has been challenged by contemporary critics; her use of the first person in courtly love fables and other signs of authorship have become vexed sites of gender disputation. In the afternoon participants met in small groups to debate teaching strategies for various fables.

The twenty female troubadour poets who wrote between 1150–1250—known as trobairitz—wrote about courtly love, or fin’ amor, romantic and aristocratic love, in their Provençal lyrics. In courtly love, the focus on the woman as an object of adoration by the poet is problematized when the writer is female. The issue debated in the seminar directed by Krueger on Friday was whether the lyrics of the trobairitz function to feminize masculine culture, or whether they perpetuate women’s subjugation by acting as a vehicle for masculine desire; also examined
were *chansons de toile*, the *Roman de Silence*, and Renart’s *Romance of the Rose*. On Friday afternoon participants compared recordings of the lyrics of the Countess of Dia and other trobairitz from the cassettes “Voicing Medieval Women” and other recordings with those of the troubadours. This was followed by participants’ close readings of lyrics of their choice; at issue was the use of these lyrics and the recordings in the classroom.

On Friday there was a reception and exhibit for participants at a local print gallery of three modern women printmakers.

**WEEK 4. THE SUBJECT WAS DESIRE: CHRISTINE DE PIZAN’S TRANSITIONAL WORKS AND WOMEN MYSTICS OF THE TWELFTH-THIRTEENTH CENTURIES**

Roberta Krueger; Barbara Newman, Professor of English and Religion, Northwestern University; Honey Meconi, Associate Professor of Music and Director, Schola Pastoris, Shepherd School of Music, Rice University.

On Monday and Tuesday, the question of desire and the female subject was again raised, first, by Roberta Krueger in a seminar on desire and honor in Christine de Pizan’s transitional works, *Book of the Duke of True Lovers* and *Book of the Three Virtues*. Small group discussions allowed participants the opportunity to contribute their own views after the seminar on Monday afternoon.

Barbara Newman presented a seminar on Tuesday on Hildegard of Bingen, the twelfth-century abbess whose liturgical music has enjoyed a recent popular renascence. She discussed Hildegard’s visionary and prophetic spirituality, her role in church politics and the monastic reform movement, and the strange vicissitudes of her reception both in the late Middle Ages and in our own day. Her presentation also included slides of Hildegard’s manuscript illuminations, as well as an exploration of the diverse performance practices employed in the many recent recordings and adaptations of her music. Newman also addressed the problem of translating her Latin lyrics in the *Symphonia*, by means of comparisons of literal and more figurative English translations.

On Wednesday evening Honey Meconi of Rice University led the musical ensemble Schola Pastoris in a concert of music by medieval women that featured Hildegard of Bingen.

On Thursday Newman led a seminar on the gendered and eroticized mysticism of the thirteenth-century beguine movement, as illustrated by Hadewijch of Brabant and Mechthild of Magdeburg. The beguine movement was a lay women’s religious movement that flourished on the borderline between traditional monastic orders and the secular world, permitting women to practice a life of devotion, active care of the poor and sick, and economic self-sufficiency.
without permanent vows or rigid organizational structures. Often subject to clerical suspicion because of their independence, beguines were particularly numerous in the Low Countries and the Rhineland, but their movement bore a close resemblance to the Dominican and Franciscan tertiaries of northern Italy. Newman discussed the distinctive brand of mysticism developed by such women, who sometimes feminized God in their writings to complement their strongly eroticized metaphors of God as male lover. Participants read selections from the writings of Hildegard, Hadewijch, and Mechthild, as well as the essay, "La mystique courtoise: Thirteenth-Century Beguines and the Art of Love," in Newman’s recent book, From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature. As background they also read essays by Mazzoni and Giles on Angela da Foligno and Spanish women, included in Chance, ed. Gender and Text.

Thursday afternoon participants debated the problem of teaching religious writers: why the mystics are so inaccessible to modern students, how to make them accessible, how to deal with the dual problem of fundamentalist religion in the classroom coupled with the lack of a common religious background among students.

WEEK 5. FIFTEENTH CENTURY ENGLISH MYSTIC WRITERS JULIAN OF NORWICH AND MARGERY KEMPE

Lynn Staley, Harrington and Shirley Drake Professor of English, Colgate University

On Monday and Tuesday Lynn Staley presented seminars on the maternal spirituality of anchorite Julian of Norwich, in particular focusing on her texts as biography and history and on her radical theology of the mother of God. Chapters by Staley and Aers from Powers of the Holy supplemented the discussion.

On Tuesday participants viewed a film, The Anchoress, about the life of the early fourteenth-century English anchorite Christine Carpenter. Such anchorites, literally walled off from the world in an act of renunciation that included the performance of a Mass for the Dead, seem most puzzling to modern students. At issue for participants was the film’s perception of medieval alterity.

Wednesday afternoon featured a field trip to a local mansion now owned by the Houston Museum of Fine Art.

On Thursday and Friday Staley conducted a workshop on Margery Kempe’s Book. Of interest in the workshop was the problem of Margery’s tears, dreams, and journeys, all of which have made her laughable to some of her contemporaries and presented evidence of neurosis to others. Staley also examined the historical context of Kempe’s "dissenting fictions." On Thursday
afternoon participants discussed the materialism of Kempe’s mysticism as a function of her life as a wife and mother, and how it differs from that of Julian’s figurative spirituality; they also debated the problem of making these two women’s mysticism accessible to students. Participants read Julian of Norwich’s *Revelations of Divine Love* and Margery Kempe’s *Book* ahead of time, so that excerpts only were discussed in these workshops. Participants also read the fourth chapter in Staley, *Margery Kempe’s Dissenting Fictions*, Jacques de Vitry’s *Life of Marie d’Oignies*, and Thomas de Cantimpré’s *Life of Christina of St. Trond*.

**WEEK 6. WRITING, GENDER, AND INTERTEXTUALITY: CHRISTINE’S LIVRE DE LA CITÉ DES DAMES**

*Earl Jeffrey Richards, Professor of Romance Languages, Sprach- und Literatur-Wissenschaften, Bergische Universität Gesamthochschule Wuppertal, Germany*

This week Jeff Richards conducted three seminars on Christine de Pizan and in particular, among her twenty works, the *Livre de la Cité des Dames*. By examining representative tales and legends from each of the three books, Richards demonstrated the intertextuality (that is, the relationship between a text and the earlier texts of others, chiefly male mythographers, poets, and hagiographers) of her feminizing scholasticism. On the first day, Richards looked at Christine and French and Italian poets; on the second, at Christine’s own self-referentiality in various works; and in the third, at Christine and the scholastic Latin tradition. He discussed the question of how a woman creates a place for herself in an otherwise masculine tradition, and what issues concerned Christine that still concern us (essentialism; nationalism; pornography; violence against women; representation of women; gender difference). He also wished to show the intertextuality of Christine’s own works, by focusing on her references to her own works, especially her lyrics and the *Epistre Othea à Hector*, in *The Book of the City of Ladies*.

Participants had an opportunity to discuss the use of intertextuality in the classroom in teaching Christine on Tuesday afternoon, when Richards led the participants’ discussion of Christine and pedagogy. Slides of Christine’s illustrated manuscripts were presented by Chance and discussed by participants on Thursday afternoon. Participants read ahead of time various selections from Christine’s works, including Richards’ translation of *The Book of the City of Ladies*. On Friday participants presented their syllabuses and descriptions of courses and other materials in a wrap-up workshop.
READINGS (in order of use)
I. Introduction: Reading Medieval Women


Hildegard of Bingen, Causae et curae, translated excerpts (hand-out).

The Middle English Trotula Texts, in Alexandra Barratt, ed., Women’s Writing in Middle English (Longman’s, 1992), pp. 27–39.


II. Latin Writings by Medieval Women before the Twelfth Century


III. Women Writers from Central, Eastern, and Scandinavian Europe and the Byzantine Empire


Eudocia, in Thiébaux, pp. 49–70.


IV. Gender, Desire, and Women’s Honor in Medieval French Courtly Literature: Marie de France (c. 1170) to Christine de Pizan


Annie Ernaux, Preface to Passion Simple (Gallimard, 1991).

Malrilda Tomaryn Bruckner, Laurie Shepard, and Sarah White, trans. Songs of the Women Troubadours (Garland, 1995):

La Comtesse de Dia, “Ab ioi et ab ioven m’apais”
“A chantar m’er de so q’ieu no volria”
“Estat ai en greu cossirier”
“Fin ioi me dona alegранssa”
Castelloza, “Ja de chantar non degra aver talan”
“Amics, s’ie.us trobes avinen”
“Mout avetz faich lonic estatge”

Maria de Ventadorn and Gui d’Ussel, “Gui d’Issel be.m pesa.”

20


_____, *Treasury of the City of Ladies, or Book of Three Virtues*, trans. Sarah Lawson, (Penguin, 1985, pb.), Book 1


V. Medieval Women Mystics in Latin and the Vernacular


Mechthild of Magdeburg and Beatrijs of Nazareth, in Thiébaux, pp. 385–412.


*The Book of Margery Kempe*, 2nd half.


**VI. Christine de Pizan and Male French and Italian Poets: Intertextuality and Gender**


Richards, “Christine de Pizan and Sacred History,” in City of Scholars, pp. 15–30.


Recommended (A Partial List)

Baker, Denise, Julian of Norwich’s Showings: From Vision to Book (Princeton University, 1994).

Bynum, Caroline Walker, Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion (Zone Books, 1992, pb.)
Hamburger, Jeffrey, *Nuns as Artists: the Visual Culture of a Medieval Convent* (University of California, 1997).


*Jane Chance*
Department of English MS30
Rice University
P.O. Box 1892
Houston, TX 77251