The short-by-position theory tested by an examination of Vergil's hexameters

Florence Helen Packard Sumner

State University of Iowa

This work has been identified with a Creative Commons Public Domain Mark 1.0. Material in the public domain. No restrictions on use.

This thesis is available at Iowa Research Online: https://ir.uiowa.edu/etd/3596

Recommended Citation
https://doi.org/10.17077/etd.lkmq93fj

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.uiowa.edu/etd
The Short-by-position Theory
tested by an examination of
Vergil's Hexameters

Thesis submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate College of The State University of Iowa
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Arts

By

F. Helen Packard, Summer
B. A. Iowa State Teachers College 1911

Iowa City Iowa
June 1912
In the usage of the Latin poets, the final syllables of words ending in a single consonant preceded by a short vowel sometimes occupy a long place, at other times a short place in the foot.

Scholars who consider these syllables normally (that is, when the word is pronounced alone) short explain their use in a long place by saying that when used before a word beginning with a consonant the syllable in question is "long by position".

On the other hand, the scholars who consider the syllable ending in a consonant preceded by a short vowel long say that this syllable though normally long may occupy a short position if it is followed by a word beginning with a vowel, in which case the final consonant is carried over to the following word and thus by the linking of the final consonant, part of the syllable is lost and thus it becomes "short by position". For example in the verse:

Sidoni|am pue|r ire parat| mea| maxima| cura

(A. I, 678) the final r in the word puer is linked with the initial i of the word ire and thus the part of the syllable which remains in puer occupies a short place in the foot, while in the word parat there is nothing that interferes with the normal pronunciation of the word.
The following paragraphs will indicate the views that have been held in regard to the quantity of the final syllable which ends in a single consonant preceded by a short vowel.

**Pompeius.** Keil V, p. 113 ff (Second Century A.D.).

"A short vowel takes up one unit of time. Therefore the word et takes up 1-1/2 units of time. To that add (1/2 unit of time) and the whole makes 2 units. Et is short. A short syllable must have a short vowel, not followed by a double consonant nor by two consonants.

**Charisius.** Keil I, p. 11. (Fourth Century A.D.)

"A syllable is long by nature if it contains a long vowel or a diphthong, by position if a short vowel is followed by two consonants a double consonant, or i and u as consonants."

**Diomedes.** Keil I, p. 427. (Fourth Century A.D.)

"A syllable is short if it has a short vowel and does not end in 2 consonants or in one double consonant used as two. A syllable is long by nature if it contains a long vowel or a diphthong, or by position if it ends in two consonants."

**Victorinus.** Keil VI, p. 26. (Fourth Century A.D.)

"When a short vowel is not followed by two consonants the syllable is short. A long syllable results from a long vowel or a diphthong (long by nature). It is long by position in 8 cases:—

(1) if a short vowelled syllable ends in two consonants, ars.

(2) if the syllable ends in a consonant followed by the same or different consonant, arma, anna.

(3) if the syllable is followed by two consonants, as Acrisioneis Danae."
(4) if it ends in a double consonant. \textit{nox}

(5) if it is followed by a double consonant. \textit{axis}

(6) if it ends in a consonant which has the sound of two as \textit{hoc erat}.

(7) if it ends in a consonant and is followed by a vowel used as a consonant. \textit{arvum}.

(8) if it is followed by double \textit{i}. \textit{Troiia, Aiio, Graiius, Aiiax}.


"A syllable is long by nature or by position in the first instance if it contains a long vowel or a dipthong in the second, if it contains a short vowel with two consonants ending the syllable as \textit{ast.}, or ending in a double consonant as \textit{dux}, ending in one consonant and followed by another as \textit{arca}, or if the syllable is followed by a double consonant as \textit{axis}, or if the vowel is placed before i-consonant, Troia, or if the syllable ends in a consonant followed by i-consonant as \textit{ad iumenta}.

"The liquid \textit{r} and also \textit{l}, ending in the same way, when it follows a short vowel in the middle of a word a consonant preceding in any way can not make this long by poet's licence; when in truth the liquid following is at the beginning of a word it can not make a vowel long which was naturally short at the end of the preceding word."

Kühner, 1877, p.134.

"A syllable is short if its vowel is short and has one consonant following as \textit{locus}, \textit{coquus}. A syllable with short vowel will become "long by position if two or three consonants or double consonants follow the short vowel."
Bullion and Morris, 1867, p. 345.

"is, us, and ys at the end of a word are short as turris, legis, lagimus, Capys".

Madvig (revised by Thatcher, 1870), p. 11, "A syllable is long by nature or by position". P. 15. 'us' is short; 'ys' is short.

Roby, 1871.

p. 89. "A syllable is long or short either because it contains a vowel naturally long or short; or on account of the position of its vowel."

p. 92. "Final syllables ending in any other single consonant than s are short. 'us' and 'is' are short - - - ".

p. 96. "Occasionally a short final closed syllable is lengthened by the arsis though the next word begins with a vowel; this is chiefly in the caesura, or when a proper name or a Greek word follows or where the sense is interrupted as oratis puer datur, erit, pectoribus (all examples from Vergil).

Fisher, Part I, 1877.

p. 7. "Pater must be divided pa-ter not pat-er."

p. 388. "A syllable is long by position when it consists of a short vowel followed by two consonants or x or z."

p. 393. "Sometimes a short syllable is used long in the arsis."

Kennedy. 1883.

p. 6. "Every syllable is considered long or short in quantity according as its vowel is short or long."
Andrews and Stoddard. 1882.

p. 340. "Final syllables in is, us, and ys are short."

Volkmann in van Müller's Handbuch II 3, p. 87ff. "A short vowelled syllable will always if a single consonant closes it, usually if it follows it, be counted short. A short vowelled syllable which is closed by 3 consonants or a double consonant is always long. If both consonants follow, it is partly long (by position) and partly short (by nature). A short vowelled syllable will, when three or more consonants follow, regularly be long (also by position)."

Allen and Greenough.

Sec. 604 i. "Final is, us, and ys are short. hostis, amicus, Nethys."

Sec. 604 j. "Of other final syllables those ending in a single consonant are short. Thus amat, amatūr; donec, fac, procul, intār."

Sec. 603, f. "A syllable is long by position if its vowel though short is followed by two consonants or a double consonant. adventus, cortex."

Sec. 11 b. "A syllable containing a short vowel followed by two consonants (except a mute before l or r) or by a double consonant (x, z) is said to be long by position but the vowel is pronounced short."

c note 1. "In syllables long by position but having a short vowel, the length is partly due to the first of the consonants which stands in the same syllable with the vowel."
Note 3. "In final syllables ending with a consonant and containing a short vowel, the quantity in verse is determined by the following word: if this begins with a vowel the first consonant is joined to it in pronunciation; if it begins with a consonant the final syllable is long by position."

Bennett.

Sec. 5. 3. "A syllable is short if it contains a short vowel followed by a vowel or by a single consonant, as mea, amat."

3. "Sometimes a syllable varies in quantity when its vowel is followed by a mute with l or r as agri, volucris. By separating the two elements (as ag-ri the poets were able to use such syllables as long."

Sec. 364. "Final syllables ending in any other consonant than s are short."

Burton.

Sec. 23. "In the latter case (its vowel followed by two consonants except a mute, a liquid, or by a double consonant, x, z) the syllable is said to be long by position. One of the two consonants may be at the beginning of the next word."

Sec. 1071. "The quantity of syllables is in general the same in poetry as in prose. A syllable is short if its vowel is short and is followed by not more than one consonant."

Harkness.

Sec. 581. 'us' final is short ______.

Gildersleeve. - Lodge.

Sec. 703. "A syllable is said to be long by position
when a short vowel is followed by two or more consonants or a
double consonant."

Sec. 3. "A syllable is said to be short when it contains
a short vowel which is not followed by two or more consonants,
lōcus, tābūlā."

Lane's Revised.

Sec. 177. "A syllable is long if its vowel is long or
if its vowel is followed by two consonants or by x or z, as
dūcēbas, volvunt -- -- the syllables of volvunt are long by
position."

Sec. 245. "Except in the thesis of a foot, a final "
syllable ending with a short vowel generally remains short
before a word beginning with two consonants or a double con­
onant as mollia, strata, nemorosa, Zacỹthos, lũcesmaragdi". Platner's translation of L. Muller's "De Re Metriia", p. 38.

"A vowel is either long by nature or it is regarded as
long on account of its position before two or more consonants." (Confusing length of vowel and length of syllable, H. P.)

Sec. 29, 3. "A syllable is also long even when the vowel
is short provided it ends in a consonant. The time taken in
pronouncing the consonant being added to that taken in pro­
nouncing the consonant being added to that taken in pronouncing
the vowel makes the syllable long."

Note 1. The quantity of the vowel is not affected.
Calling the vowel "long by position" often misleads the beginner
into such an error as pronouncing est,  is, with a long e."

Sec. 29, 4. "The same is true of final syllables. if
a word ends in a single consonant its last syllable is long be­
fore a word beginning with a consonant but short before a word
beginning with a vowel or h since in this case the final con-
sonant is carried over to the next word."

An examination of these statements shows that the traditional view held since the earliest days is that such a word as rūgis, for example, is a trochee and not a spondee.

The view of Hale and Buck is that it is a spondee when pronounced alone. This same view is held by Richardson.
An examination of the major works of Vergil has been made with reference to the application of these two opposing views to the explanation of the metrical structure of the hexameter.

With the purpose of testing these views, three principal lines of investigation have been followed, namely the nature of the last syllable of the verse, i.e., the so-called "syllaba anceps"; the occurrence of verses containing instances of "irregular lengthening" and the use of the feminine caesura.
The final syllable in a verse is usually called "sylloganceps" and no more attention is given to its quantity. An examination has been made of the final syllables of the verses throughout the Bucolics, Georgics, and the entire Aeneid (excluding incomplete verses) and the results shown in the following tables seem worthy of consideration.

Table A. Eclogues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eclogues</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
<th>VI</th>
<th>VII</th>
<th>VIII</th>
<th>IX</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vvc</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>u</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>830</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| -        | .662 | .690 | .630 | .634 | .688 | .604 | .714 | .545 | .671 | .701 | .644 |
| u        | .048 | .068 | .072 | .080 | .066 | .104 | .057 | .100 | .000 | .051 | .069 |
| Total    | .999 | .998 | .999 | .999 | .999 | .999 | .999 | .999 | .999 | .998 | .998 |

Table B. Georgics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Georgics</th>
<th>BK.</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>323</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>326</td>
<td>1348</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vvc</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>641</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>u</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>199</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>514</td>
<td>543</td>
<td>566</td>
<td>566</td>
<td>3188</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| -        | .628 | .643 | .618 | .575 | .615 |
| vvc      | .291 | .269 | .386 | .333 | .332 |
| u        | .079 | .083 | .095 | .100 | .091 |
| Total    | .998 | .999 | .999 | .998 | .998 |
Table C. Aeneid

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bk.</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
<th>V</th>
<th>VI</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>VII</th>
<th>VIII</th>
<th>IX</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>XI</th>
<th>XII</th>
<th>vn-XII</th>
<th>I-XII</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>427</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>426</td>
<td>423</td>
<td>524</td>
<td>528</td>
<td>2763</td>
<td>491</td>
<td>439</td>
<td>438</td>
<td>513</td>
<td>536</td>
<td>531</td>
<td>2947</td>
<td>5710</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>1649</td>
<td>268</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>306</td>
<td>314</td>
<td>379</td>
<td>1807</td>
<td>3456</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>362</td>
<td>672</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>753</td>
<td>794</td>
<td>711</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>865</td>
<td>899</td>
<td>4722</td>
<td>811</td>
<td>728</td>
<td>812</td>
<td>902</td>
<td>913</td>
<td>950</td>
<td>5116</td>
<td>9838</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>267</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>599</td>
<td>590</td>
<td>605</td>
<td>605</td>
<td>601</td>
<td>539</td>
<td>587</td>
<td>558</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>580</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>361</td>
<td>370</td>
<td>341</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>339</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>349</td>
<td>330</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>339</td>
<td>343</td>
<td>398</td>
<td>353</td>
<td>.353</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>361</td>
<td>.969</td>
<td>.057</td>
<td>.060</td>
<td>.060</td>
<td>.065</td>
<td>.064</td>
<td>.066</td>
<td>.099</td>
<td>.093</td>
<td>.069</td>
<td>.044</td>
<td>.070</td>
<td>.070</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>.997</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>.998</td>
<td>.998</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table based on the Aeneid, with columns and rows indicating various sections and totals.
In each table the upper line gives the number of syllables occurring at the end of the verse which everyone admits are long (marked - for convenience) that is, those which contain a long vowel, a diphthong or a short vowel followed by two or more consonants. The second line contains the number of syllables at the end of the verse whose quantity is questioned (marked \textit{v	extbf{c} short vowel\textbf{c}a consonant} for convenience) while in the third line is given the number of times an indisputably short syllable (one ending in a short vowel) occurs at the end of the verse of the second part of each table gives the per cent of each recorded figure.

Table A gives the data gained from the Eclogues, table B the Georgics and table C the Aeneid.

Table A shows that out of a total of 830 lines 535 end in syllables indisputably long (64.4\%) while only 58 (6.9\%) are indisputably short. It is noteworthy that the Ninth Eclogue does not contain a single syllable at the end of the verse, which ends in a short vowel. The last syllables of the remaining 237 (28.5\%) end in a single consonant preceded by a short vowel.

In table 6 three different totals are given -- books I-VI are included in the first, books VII-XII in the second and books I-XII in the last. These totals are practically uniform. The first six books show a total of 4722 verses 2762 (58.4\%) of which end in syllables always considered long while 1649 (34.9\%) end in syllables of the quantity under discussion. Only 311 (6.5\%) end in short vowels.
The last six books give a total of 5116 lines the final syllables of which are divided as follows: 2946 (.575%) are obviously long, 1807 (.353%) are the syllables in question and only 363 (.065%) end in a short vowel.

Considering the twelve books of the Aeneid together there are 9838 lines; the final syllable of 5708 (.58%) are always considered long, 3456 (.351%) end in a consonant preceded by a short vowel and the remaining 674 (.067%) end in a short vowel. That we may see these figures together we submit Table D which comprises a total of all the totals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7593</td>
<td>.590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4334</td>
<td>.337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>929</td>
<td>.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>.999</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From this table it is evident that Vergil sought to close the line with a long syllable, since only 933 final syllables out of 13,856 are indisputably short.

In order to ascertain whether this percentage of short syllables at the end of a verse is due merely to the natural proportion of short finals in the words which Vergil used, a count has been made of the final syllables of all the words in the first book of the Georgics.

From this we learn that a short vowel occurs at the end of 21% of all the words used, while only 7.8% of all the final syllables of verses end in a short vowel. This fact would in-
dicate much more strongly the poet's aversion toward ending a verse with a short syllable.

A study has been made of the indisputably short syllables occurring at the end of a verse from which it seems that Vergil did not use these syllables freely at the end of the verse but in limited situations only.

It should however be remarked that the following numbers and percentages are only approximate for many of the words might be classed in either of two groups.

In 359 of these instances (38.5%) the following verse begins with a vowel or h and thus a natural pause occurs at the end of the verse in hiatus. A. Ek. VI, 667:

Musaeum ante omnis (medium nam plurima turba
Mund habet atque umeris exstantem suspicit altis.

The short syllables which end the verse in 279 (29.9%) other instances mark the end of a sentence or of a clause. In these instances there is a natural pause at the end of the verse due to a pause in thought. A. V, 25.

si modo rite memor servata remetior astra.
tum pius Aeneas 'equidem sic poscere ventos.

One hundred other instances (10.7%) occur in which there is a natural pause at the end of the verse due to one or another of the following causes: an appositional element (69 instances); an emphatic ille, iste or ipse regularly used to mark a change of subject (19 examples); interruption of the thought by the insertion of a parenthetical clause (3 instances); anaphora (3 instances); asyndeton (5 instances); exclamation (1 instance).
An example is now given of each of the foregoing classes:

Sidoniam puer ire parat, mea maxima cura,
Dona ferens pelago et flammis restantia Troiae. (A. I, 678)
insidat quantus miserae deus. at memor ille
matris Acidialiae paulatim abolere Sychaenum. (An emphatic ille). (A. I, 719.)

Saepibus in nostris parvam te roscida mala,
dux ego eram vidi cum matre legentem. (Insertion of a parenthetical clause). (Ecl. VIII, 37).
tum pingues agni et tum mollissima vira,
tum somni dulcis densaeque in mortibus umbrae (anaphora) (Georg. I, 341).
deripientque rates alii navalibus ite
ferte citi flammae, date tela impellite remos. (asyndeton). (A. IV, 593).
huc ubi delati portus intravimus, ecce
laeta boum passim campis armenta videmus (exclamation) (A III, 219).

The examples just cited give us a total of 79.1% of 932 instances of verses ending in a short vowel. In each case there is a distinct natural pause which occurs at the end of the verse.

Fifteen percent more show upon examination some special reason of the poet for the use of such a syllable at the end of the verse.

In 54 verses (5.7%) a word though ending in a short
vowel owing to its relative importance has been placed at the end of the verse to give it emphasis. For example:

1 Venimus; his demum collectis omnibus una
vit. Defuit et cumites natumque virumque sefellit. (A. II, 743.)

Another 39 verses (3.1%) may contain several instances which might be included in the group last mentioned as they are ended by words which seem naturally to drift to the end of the verse. Thus we find *mella* four times and *ante* five times at the end of a verse.

-Que is found at the end of 51 verses. This was a convenient word with which to complete a verse which did not readily conform to the demands of hexameter. Sometimes the correlatives -que, -que, were used for this purpose as in the verse ending terramque polumque.

Especially in the case of unwieldy foreign words the poet found -que a very convenient syllable. As in *Drumoque Xanthoque* *Ligeaque Phyllodougue* G. IV, 336.

And -que is used not only as a moveable conjunction but in the words namque, quisque, ubique, atque. The enclitic -ne is once used in a similar way.

There are 6 (0.6%) verses ending in a short e in the three persons plural active indicative as dedere, iacere, fuere. It is noteworthy that Vergil does not use dederunt, iacerunt or fuerunt anywhere in his poems. The use of these forms indicates merely an individual taste and practice of the poet.
Tulere presents a problem a little different from these verbs as the form tulerunt occurs five times (four at the end of the verse). In two of the three instances in which tulere occurs at the end of the verse, there is a distinct pause as the verb ends a sentence. The one remaining verse to be considered is:

convertere animos acris oculosque tulere (A. XI, 800).

In this verse the use of the form convertere at the beginning of the verse possibly influenced Vergil in finishing the verse with the form tulere.

To recapitulate, Vergil closes 140 verses with short vowels which do not occur at a place where there is a natural pause. Here however, special reasons seem to be found for the use:

1. important word in the verse,
2. the use of words which tend to be placed last in the verse
3. perfect indicatives in ere rather than erunt,
4. -que in unwieldy verses.

The remaining verses do not seem to belong to any of these classes just mentioned and form a mere 5.9% of the 932 verses ending in a short vowel or 4.4% of the entire number of verses in the major works of the poet.

Finally, it seems that Vergil avoids using a short syllable at the end of the verse except in certain situations where there is a natural pause or where some special reason may be given.

Since it is evident that Vergil avoided the use of a short syllable at the end of the verse except in certain limited
situations and has freely used syllables ending in a con-
sonant preceded by a short vowel, it is reasonable to con-
clude that he regarded such syllables long.

To bring this to our attention graphically we now submit
another table which shows the comparative figures if these
syllables are to be considered long.

Table E

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11,926</td>
<td>.927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>930</td>
<td>.072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong> 12,856</td>
<td><strong>.999</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The following verses involve so-called irregular quantities. The explanations usually offered for these quantities are given with each.

(1) Invalidus.

G. III, 189. Invalidus etianque tremens etiam inscius av

Johnston: "It is thought by some that the lengthening of nominatives in us from o stems is due in Vergil to imitation of the similar treatment of the corresponding nouns in Greek poetry."

Kennedy: "Virgil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short."

Capillon and Haigh: "us' from 'o' stems is found also in Ennius perhaps from imitation of Homeric use."

Frieze: "The last syllable is lengthened by the ictus."

Ladewig and Schaper: Diastole before the caesura.
Nettleship: "difficult. This is a licence which is doubtful even in Plautus and it seems most probable that Ennius (and after him Vergil) was imitating the lengthening of the Greek os of the second declension."

(2) Oratio.

A. XI, III. Oratiae equidem et vivis concedere vellem.

Müller: "Diastole due to the full stop after the word."

Johnston: "One of miscellaneous examples of lengthening of short syllables in thesis."

Ladewig and Schaper: "In the second, third and fourth arsis
ebur

A. XII, 68.

siquis ebur aut mixta rubent ubi lilia multa

Kennedy:

Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Papillon and Haigh:

Virgil uses the licence as a mere matter of form with no thought of etymology.

Johnston:

Lengthening before the caesura.

Nettleship:

No grammatical propriety can be alleged for such scansion. Conington gives no explanation but cites two other instances.

Ladewig and Schaper: ebur before the caesura.
Vergil allowed diastole of short end syllables in t and s which in the ancient speech were long.  

Nettleship: "Lengthening".  
Kennedy: "Lengthening under the ictus."  

\[ \text{(3)} \]

dolor.

A. XII, 423. Quippe dolor omnis stetis imo volnere sanguis.

Lucian Müller thinks the caesura sufficient to account for this.  

Nettleship: "Lengthening of final syllable in \( r \). As far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short either in the thesis or arsis."

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to its original quantity. Nouns and adjectives in or genitive \( \text{ris} \) are scanned with long \( o \) in the nominative by Ennius and Plautus as the quantity of the \( o \) in the genitive would lead us to expect. By Vergil's time the \( \text{o} \) had become short in the unaccented final syllable of the nominative but the use of the ancient quantity gives to the verse a flavor of the antique. The lengthening of short syllables in \( r \) occurs in Vergil only in the second, third, and fourth theses.  

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus, final syllables naturally short.  

Ladewig and Schaper: Short end syllables are lengthened only in the second, third and fourth arsis.
aberrat

Ecl. I, 38. Tityrus hinc aberat, ipsae te Tityre pinus.

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity. It is generally agreed that the termination at was originally long. Vergil lengthens these syllables only in the second, third, and fourth theses.

Papillon and Haigh: 'at' of imperfect in Plautus and Ennius short even in thesi; in Vergil only in arsi.

Conington does not explain but merely gives other instances.

Nettleship: At of the imperfect is long in Plautus, and so in Ennius even in thesi. So Vergil (but only in arsis).

Ladewig and Schaper: Without position before caesura.

Frieze: lengthened by the ictus.

(6)

erit.


Johnston: "lengthened before the caesura" by some authorities believing it in the future was anciantly long.

Nettleship: Vergil has erit twice.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.
(7)

facit

E. VII, 23. Versibus ille facit aut si non possumus omnes.

Johnston: Lengthened before the caesura.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens iotus final syllables naturally short.

Nettleship: Constantly short in Ennius but long Ann. 123. So occasionally the comedians.

Ladewig and Schaper: In the second, third and fourth arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of short end syllables in t and s, which in the speech of ancient times were long.

(8)

puer

Ecloga IX, 66. Desine plura puer et quod nunc instat agamus.

Johnston: Lengthened before the caesura.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens the iotus final syllables naturally short.

Ladewig and Schaper: The lengthening of the short end-syllable in r is found only twice in the Eclogueus, each time before a main caesura.

Nettleship: No grammatical propriety can be alleged.

Papillon and Haigh: Vergil uses the licence as a mere matter of form with no thought of etymology.
(9)

amor


Johnson: Shortened syllable restored to original quantities. Nouns and adjectives in or, genitive oris are scanned with long o in the nominative by Ennius and Plautus as the quantity of the o in the genitive would lead us to expect. By Vergil's time the o had become short in the unaccented final syllable of the Nominative, but the use of the ancient quantity gives to the verse a flavor of the antique.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens under the ictus final syllables naturally short.

Papillon and Haigh: The corresponding Greek Α and the prosody of oblique cases point to the original length of this syllable which is always so in Ennius even in thesi.

Nettleship: Lengthening of final syllables in r. As far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short either in arsis or thesis.

Ladewig and Schaper: amor without position.

Charisius (Keil I, p. 13.) Long because of the break in the thought.

(10)

enituit

G. II, 211. at rudis enituit, inpulso vomere campus.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens under the ictus final syllables naturally short.
Conington: The quantity of the ı may be due to the caesura.
Nettleship: It of the perfect indicative is often long in Plautus, but Ennius mostly makes it short. The long scansion was afterwards taken up by Ovid and Vergil writes enituit and subiit.
Papillon and Haigh: It as originally.
Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity. It is generally agreed that the termination it was found in the perfect indicative of all conjugations.

(13)

Iovis.

§. III, 332. Sicubi magna Iovis, antico robore quercus.
Johnston: lengthened before the caesura.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens under the ictus final syllables naturally short.
Nettleship: may be an extension of the licence of Greek imitation.
Ladewig and Schafer: Lengthening of end-syllable before the caesura.
Frieze: Lengthened by the ictus.

(11)
ingreditur

G. III, 76. Altius ingreditur et mollia crura reponit.
Johnston: "lengthened before the caesura" is explanation that some would give, believing that the ending ur was ancient-
ly long.

**Kennedy:** Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

**Frieze:** lengthened by the ictus.

**Papillon and Haigh:** No precedent in Ennius.

**Nettleship:** always short in Ennius.

(l2)

**labor**

G. III, 18. Aequos uterque labor, aeque iuvenemque magistra.

**Johnston:** Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

**Nettleship:** As far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short either in arsis or thesis.

**Papillon and Haigh:** The corresponding Greek and the prosody of the oblique cases, point to the original length of this syllable which is always so in Ennius even in thesi.

**Kennedy:** Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

**Ladeqig and Schäfer:** Before main caesura. The old labo was here too formal.

(l4)

**nullius**

G. IV, 453. Non te nullius, exercent numinis irae.

**Johnston:** Lengthened before the caesura.

**Kennedy:** Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.
Vergil not infrequently lengthens a short vowel in arsis.

Wagner: early part of the line is corrupt since there (in Conington) can not be lengthening of a short syllable where there is no pause in the sense.

Frieze: lengthened by the ictus.

Nettleship: Vergil follows Ennius. The use in Ennius (populus) is difficult to explain.

(15)

peteret

A. I, 651. Pergama cum peteret, inconcessosque hymenasos

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to its original quantity. It is generally agreed that et was found in the subjunctive of all conjugations.

Nettleship: et in the imperfect subjunctive is both long and short in Plautus. Ennius uses it long even in thesis.

Papillon and Haigh: long in thesis.

Frieze: long by ictus.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Carter: Lengthening

Knapp: retention of original quantity.

Bennett: as an archaic reminiscence Vergil here revives the original quantity of the final syllable of the imperfect subjunctive.

Greenough and Kittridge: the long final syllable is retained
from an earlier quantity on account of the caesura.

Fairclough and Brown: original quantity retained.

(16)

iactetur

A. I, 668. *litora iactetur, odiis Junonis acertae.*

Johnston: "Lengthened before the caesura" is the explanation given by some authorities believing that the ending *ur* was anciently long.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Frieze: lengthened by the ictus.

Servius: *iacteturque.*

Ladewig and Schäfer: Short end-syllables in *r* Vergil lengthens only in second, third and fourth arsis.

Carter: Lengthening.

Knapp: before the caesura.

Bennett: the *u* is arbitrarily lengthened. We have here no reminiscence of an earlier quantity.

Greenough and Kittridge: with *u* long, perhaps according to an earlier usage.

Fairclough and Brown: the last syllable is lengthened before the caesura.

(17)

pavor

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.
Ladewig and Schafer: Short syllables Vergil lengthens only in 3", 3", and 4" arsis.
Nettleship: As far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short either in arsis or thesis.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens under the ictus syllables naturally short.
Bennett: the 5 represents the original quantity of the ending, here revived by Vergil.
Knapp: Lengthening before the caesura.
Carter: Lengthening.
Fairclough and Brown: An archaism.

(18)
obruimur

Johnston: "Lengthened before the caesura" is the explanation some would give believing ur anciently long.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens under the ictus syllables naturally short.
Papillon and Haigh: no precedent in Ennius.
Nettleship: No precedent in Ennius.
Ladewig and Schaper: Short syllables Vergil lengthens only in 3", 3", and 4" arsis.
Carter: lengthening.
Knapp: Before the caesura.
Bennett: irregularly lengthened.
Fairclough and Brown: lengthened before the caesura.

(19)

\[ \text{domus} \]

A. II, 563. \textit{et direpta domus} et parvi casus Iuli.
Johnston: Lengthened before the caesura.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus syllables naturally short.
Bennett: \textit{u} irregularly lengthened.
Carter: lengthening.
Fairclough and Brown: irregularly lengthened before the caesura.

(20)

\[ \text{nemus} \]

Ladewig and Schaper: In the second, third and fourth arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of short syllables in \textit{t} and \textit{a}, which in early language were long.
Nettleship: May be an extension of the licence of Greek imitation.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus syllables naturally short.
Johnston: Lengthened before the caesura.
Bennett: Irregularly lengthened.
Knapp: Lengthened before the caesura.
Carter: lengthening.
Fairclough and Brown: irregularly long.

Casus
A. III, 504. Atque idem casu unam faciemus utramque.
Johnston: lengthened before the caesura.
Carter: lengthening.

Note. This line really presents no difficulty for if it is Nominative plural as some consider it u is long, grammatically.

Datum
A. V., 284. Olli serva datum operum haud ignara Minerve.
Johnston: Some authorities believing ur anciently long would call this lengthened before the caesura.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens in ictus syllables naturally short.
Frieze: lengthening.
Papillon and Haigh: no precedent in Ennius.
Nettleship: This syllable is invariably short in Ennius.
Ladewig and Schaper: Short end-syllables in Vergil lengthens only in 2", 3", and 4" arsis.
Carter: lengthening.
Knapp: lengthened before the caesura.
Bennett: irregularly lengthened.
Greenough and Kittridge: u is lengthened or at least allowed before the caesura.
Euryalus


Nettleship: Vergil follows Ennius. Ennius is difficult to explain.

Papillon and Haigh: Ha from 'o' stem is found also in Ennius, perhaps from imitation of Homeric use.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens in ictus syllables naturally short.

Johnston: Lengthened before the caesura.

Another possible explanation is that there are three short syllables closing a word and also that by some to be due to imitation of the similar treatment of the corresponding nouns in Greek poetry.

Frieze: lengthening.

Bennett: irregular lengthening.

Knapp: lengthened before the caesura.

Carter: lengthening.

(34)

amittebat

A. V., 853: Nusquam amittebat, oculosque sub astra tenebat.

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

It is generally agreed that at was originally long.

Papillon and Haigh: long in Plautus and Ennius even in thesis; in Vergil only in arsi.

Nettleship: at of the imperfect is long in Plautus and so in Ennius even in thesis. So Virgil (only in arsis).
Ladewig and Schaper: In the 2", 3", and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of short end-syllables in t and a which in the early language were long.

Carter: lengthening.
Knapp: retention of original quantity.
Bennett: original quantity.
Frieze: lengthened by ictus.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.
Fairclough and Brown: retention of original quantity.

(35)

Numitor
A. VI, 768. Et Capys et Numitor et que te nomine reddet.

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.
L. Müller: Accounted for by the caesura.
Nettleship: As far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short, either in arsis or thesis.

Carter: lengthening.
Knapp: retention of original quantity.
Bennett: retention of original quantity.
Kennedy: Vergil often by ictus lengthens final syllables naturally short.

(36)
erat

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

It is generally agreed that at was originally long.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus syllables naturally short.

Ladewig and Schaper: In the 2", 3" and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of the short end-syllables in т and a which were long in the early language.

Nettleship: at of the imperfect is long in Plautus and so in Ennius even in thesis. So Vergil (but only in arsis).

(subiit)


Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus syllables naturally short.

Ladewig and Schaper: In the 2", 3", and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of the short end-syllables in т and a which were long in the early language.

Nettleship: often long in Plautus but Ennius mostly makes it short: a strange fact as the original length of the vowel is unquestionable.

(fatigamus)

A. IX, 610. terga fatigamus hasta nec tardo senectus.

Johnston: Some believing us anciently long would add this to the list lengthened before the caesura.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus syllables naturally short.
Ladewig and Schaper: In the 3", 3", and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of the short end-syllable in t and a which in the early language were long.

Nettleship: No analogy can be proved in Ennius.

Papillon and Haigh: no analogy in Ennius nor in the corresponding Greek.

petiit

A. X, 67. Italiam fatis petiit auctoribus esto

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Connington-Nettleship does not mention this particular instance but he makes the following statement. It of the perfect Indicative is often long in Plautus but Ennius makes it mostly short. The long scansion was afterwards taken up by Ovid in the case of words compounded with eo and Vergil writes continuit and subiit.

Ribbeck and other modern editors, read 'petiit fatis' and then the line offers no difficulty.

(30)

caput

A. X, 394. Nam tibi Thymbre caput Euandrius abstulit ensis.

Johnston: No adequate explanation has been suggested.

Connington: Vergil has extended to a substantive ending in t, a liberty which he usually only allows himself in the case of the 3" person of verbs.

Nettleship: extension of the licence of it in 3" person singular perfect.
Knapp: lengthened before the caesura.
Ladewig and Schaper: lengthened in the 3" arsis.
Papillon and Haigh: a miscellaneous example of lengthening.

(31)

sinit

Johnston: Lengthening before caesura.
Nettleship: constantly short in Ennius.
Papillon and Haigh: lengthening.
Ladewig and Schaper: In the 3", 3", and 4" arsis Vergil allows
the lengthening of short syllables in t and a, which were
long in the early language.
Knapp: original quantity retained.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables natur­
ally short.

(32)
pater

A. XI, 469. Concilium ipse pater et magna incepta Latinus.
Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.
Nettleship: Short in Ennius.
Papillon and Haigh: Corresponding Greek long vowel points
to its original length. Always long in Ennius.
Ladewig and Schaper: pate r before the chief caesura.
Kennedy: Virgil often lengthens by ictus final syllables
naturally short.
manus

A. XII, 333. Fatalesque manus infensa Etruria Turno.
Nettleship: Extension possibly, of licence of Greek imitation.

amor

A. XII, 668. et furiis agitatus amor et conscia virtus.
Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.
The use of the ancient quantity gives to the verse a flavor of the antique.
L. Müller: Caesura accounts for this.
Papillon and Haigh: The corresponding Greek ωρ, and the prosody of oblique cases point to the original length of this syllable which is always so in Ennius even in thess.
Ladewig and Schaper: Short end-syllables in r Vergil lengthens only in the 2", 3" and 4" arsis.
Knapp: original quantity.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

erit

A. XII, 883. Te sine frater erit η o quae satis iux. dehiscat.
Johnston: "lengthened before the caesura" according to some
authorities who think it (in the future) was originally long.

Nettleship: Vergil has erit twice.

Papillon and Haigh: lengthening.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Nettleship: Vergil has erit twice.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Nettleship (36)

G. IV, 92. Nam duo sunt genera hic melior insignis et ore

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

Nettleship: as far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short either in arsis or thesis.

L. Müller. Caesura accounts for these cases.

Papillon and Haigh: always long in Ennius.

Ladewig and Schaper: Vergil lengthens short endsyllables only in 2", 3", and 4" arsis.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Frieze: lengthened by ictus.

Nettleship (37)

videt

A. I, 308. Qui tenent nam inculta videt hominesne ferasne.

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Ladewig and Schaper: In the 2", 3", and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of short final syllables in t and s which
were long in the early language.

Papillon and Haigh: lengthening.

Nettleship: both long and short in Plautus. Ennius uses it long even in thesis.

Knapp: retention of original quantity.

Frieze: lengthened by the ictus.

Carter: lengthening.

Bennett: reminiscence of original quantity.

Greenough: retained from an earlier quantity.

Kittridge: on account of the caesura.

Fairclough and Brown: an archaism, the earlier quantity of the final syllable being admitted before the caesura.

(38)

adloquitur

A. IV, 333. Tu sic Mercurium adloquitur et talia mandat.

Johnston: Some authorities considering this originally long would call it restored to ancient quantity.

Nettleship: This is invariably short in Ennius.

Papillon and Haigh: No precedent in Ennius.

Laderig and Schaper: Short end-syllables in Vergil lengthens only in 3"", 3"", and 4" arsis.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengths by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Greenough and Kittridge: Lengthened before the caesura.

Bennett: irregularly lengthened.
Carter: lengthening.
Knapp: lengthened before the caesura.
Fairclough and Brown: lengthened before the caesura.

(39)

pater

A. V, 531. ostentans artemque pater, arcumque sonantem.

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.
Nettleship: Originally long. This had been forgotten in Ennius.
Papillon and Haigh: always long in Ennius. Greek \( \dot{a} \) points to the original length.

Ladewig and Schaper: Vergil often lengthens short end-syllables only in 2", 3", and 4" arsis.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Bennett: a reminiscence of original quantity of \( \dot{a} \).
Carter: lengthening.

Knapp: retention of original quantity.

Fairclough and Brown: an archaism.

(40)

procul

A. VIII, 98. Cum muros arcemque procul ac rara domorum

Nettleship: Procul stands by itself.
Johnston: no adequate explanation has been suggested.
Papillon and Haigh: Classed as a miscellaneous example of lengthening.
Ladewig and Schaper: Before strong caesura in the arsis.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllable naturally short.

(41)

dabat

A. X, 383. Per medium qua spina dabat hastamque receptat

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to its original quantity.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Papillon and Haigh: At in Plautus and Ennius even in thesi.

Nettleship: long in Plautus and so in Ennius in thesis.

Knapp: retention of original quantity.

(42)

amor

A. XI, 323. considant si tantus amor et moenia condant

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to its original quantity.

By Vergil’s time the ο had become short in the unaccented final syllable of the nomination but the use of the ancient quantity gives to the verse a flavor of the antique.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Ladewig and Schaper: amor before the caesura, Vergil lengthens the short end syllables only in the 2", 3", and 4" arsis.

Papillon and Haigh: Always long in Ennius. The corresponding Greek ο, and the prosody of oblique cases point to the original length.
Nettleship: As far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short either in arsis or thesis.

(43)

pater

A. XII, 13. Congredior\textsuperscript{f} er sacra pater\textsuperscript{f} et concipe foedus
Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

Vergil retains the original quantity as shown in the Greek Κ\textsuperscript{\textgamma}. Papillon and Haigh: original quantity.

Nettleship: seems to recall the original length but this had been forgotten as early as Ennius who constantly uses it short.

Ladewig and Schaper: before the chief caesura pater.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Knapp: Retention of original quantity.

(44)

domitor

A. XII, 550. Et Missapus\textsuperscript{\textgamma} ecum domitor\textsuperscript{\textgamma} et fortis Asilas.

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

L. Muller: Accounted for by the caesura.

Nettleship: As far as I can ascertain there is no instance in the fragments of Ennius where this ending is short either in arsis or thesis.

Papillon and Haigh: original quantity.

Ladewig and Schaper: Vergil lengthens short end-syllables only.
in the 2", 3", and 4" arsis.

**Kennedy:** Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

(45)

stabat

A. XII, 772. *Hic hasta Aeneae stabat* hic ictus illam

**Johnston:** Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

**Nettleship:** At of the imperfect is long in Plautus and so in Ennius even in thesi. So Vergil (but only in arsis.)

**Papillon and Haigh:** At of the imperfect in Plautus and Ennius even in thesi.

**Kennedy:** Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

(46)

fultus

Ecl. VI, 53. *ille latus niveum molli fultus* hyacintho

**Johnston:** lengthened before a Greek word.

**Kennedy:** Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

**Frieze:** lengthened by the ictus.

(47)

Pleiadas

G. I, 138. *pleiadas hyadas* claramque Lycanonis arcton

**Johnston:** lengthened before a Greek word.

**Kennedy:** Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.
tondebat

G. IV, 137. ille conam mollis iam tondebat, hyacinthi.

Johnston: Shortened syllables restored to original quantity also before a Greek word.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Ladewig and Schaper: The h in the Greek word hyacinthi makes position, so is the hiatus in this verse hardly read.

Nettleship: at of the imperfect is long in Plautus, and so in Ennius even in thesi.

Papillon and Haigh: Et of the imperfect in Plautus and Ennius even in thesi.

Frieze: lengthened by ictus.

Page: Vergil not infrequently lengthens a short vowel in arsis.

canit

A. VII, 398. sustinet ac natae Turnique canit hymenaeos.

Johnston: lengthened before a Greek word.

Papillon and Haigh: lengthening.

Nettleship: it of the present (third conjugation) is constantly short in Ennius.

Gonington: The initial letter of hymenaeos may probably account for the quantity of the last syllable of canit.

Ladewig and Schaper: The h in the Greek word hymenaeos makes is position so the Hiatus in this verse in Latin scarcely noticed.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

(50)

profugus
A. X., 720: Graius homo infectos linquens profugus, hymenaeos
Johnston: lengthened before a Greek word.
Conington: the rhythm is like Catullus 64:20:
Tum Thetis humanos non desepexit hymenaeos.
Ladewig and Schaper: The lengthening of the end syllable before hymenaeos. The h in the Greek word makes position.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally.

(51)
languentia
Johnston: lengthened before a Greek word.
Ladewig and Schaper: The h in the word hyacinthi makes position.
Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

(52)
super
A. VI, 354: pingue super, oleum fundens ardentibus, extis.
Bennett: irregularly lengthened.
Frieze: long under the ictus.
Fairclough and Brown: super.
Nettleship: no grammatical propriety can be alleged.

This is reading of the text used by these editors; Ribbeck
has the reading.

Pingue superque oleum infundens ardentibus extis, and so the line presents no difficulty.

(53)

sanguis

A. X, 487: Una eademque via sanguis animusque sequuntur

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

It occurs 16 times in Vergil, is long here only, but it was long originally and is always so scanned by Lucretius.

Neue-Wagener Formenlehre; Vol. I, p. 243: Often has the last syllable long as Lucretius. 4, 1050; 6, 1203. Vergil Aen., 10,487; Tibullus, I, 666; Ovid, Met., 10,459; 12,127 and Fast. 6, 486; Lucan 2, 339; 7,635; 9,702; 16,138; etc.

Ladewig and Schaper: In the 3"., 3" and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of the short end syllables in t and s, which were long in the early language.

Papillon and Haigh: always long in Lucretius.

Nettleship: (= sanguin-s) was originally long and so is always used by Lucretius and once by Vergil.

Knapp: original quantity retained.

Note: The i of the final syllable of this word was originally long. It is quite certain, by the evidence of other writers that two forms were common in the time of Vergil—sanguis and sanguis, like the two possible forms mihi and mihi, tibi, and tibī.
pulvis

A. I, 478: Per terram et versa pulvis inscribitur hasta

Johnston: Shortened syllable restored to original quantity.

Ennius had used pulvis in hexameter verse. Vergil lengthens short syllables in s only in 3", 3", and 4" theses.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Ladewig and Schaper: In the 2", 3", and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of short end-syllables in t and s, which were long in the early language.

Nettleship: Probably to be accounted for by the fact that pulvis = pulvis-a as geres = geres-a.

Knapp: original quantity.

Frieze: lengthened by the ictus.

Carter: lengthening.

Bennett: irregularly lengthened.

Fairclough and Brown: probably the original quantity.

(55)

gravidus

G. II, 5: muneribus tibi pampineo gravidus autumno

Johnston: lengthened before a Molossus at the end of a verse.

Ladewig and Schaper: Hiatus before a Molossus.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus, final syllables naturally short.

Skrine: In the arsis of dactylic verses the short final syllable of polysyllables, if ending in a consonant is sometimes used as long. (Madvig, 503, a). This means
that where the reader expects a long syllable, the poet, by a licence, trusts him to sound a short one long.

(56)

petit

A. IX, 9: Sceptra Palatine sedemque petit, Euandri

Johnston: lengthened before a Molossus at the end of the verse.
Papillon and Haigh: lengthening.
Nettleship: it of the present (3rd conjugation) is constantly short in Ennius.

Conington: It is doubtful whether this is present, the last syllable being lengthened by caesura or the perfect contracted.

Ladewig and Schaper: petit, perfect.
Kennedy: petiit.

Note: The translation of this passage clearly shows that this petit is a perfect indicative.

(57)

pectoribus

A. IV, 64. Pectoribus inhians spirantia consulit exta.

Johnston: lengthened when three short syllables close a word.

This explanation has hardly gained general acceptance.

There is some evidence for būs in early Latin.

Papillon and Haigh: būs has no example in Ennius and few in Plautus.

Nettleship: whether Ennius lengthened the dative plural in -būs
cannot be ascertained and such a scansion is not frequent in Plautus. But Vergil does not hesitate to write pectoribus.

Ladewig and Schaper: In the 2", 3", and 4" arsis Vergil allows the lengthening of short syllables in t and s, which were long in the early language.

Kennedy: Vergil often lengthens by ictus final syllables naturally short.

Frieze: Pectoribus lengthens the final syllable here.

Knapp: Retention of original quantity.

Carter: lengthening.

Bennett: irregularly lengthened.

Fairclough and Brown; the final syllable lengthened. An archaism.
We now pass to an examination of the various reasons and explanations that have been given.

The explanation "restored to the original quantity" is given for the following words: amor, dolor, labor, pavor, pater, Numitor, domitor, melior, pectoribus, pulvis, nemus, Euryalus, facit, sinit, oratis, fatigamus, tonderebat, stabat, dabat, erat, amittebat, aberat, iactetur, enituit, subiit, videt, peteret.

The final syllables of the words, amor, dolor, labor, pavor and pater were among the first to have their vowel shortened. Two laws — shortening before final r and the law of iambic shortening operated in the case of these words so that the short vowel was clearly established more than two centuries before the date of the Aeneid.

The shortening before final r in words such as Numitor, domitor and melior, not subject to the iambic law had taken place before the close of the second century B.C., as is attested by Lucretius' usage of contemplator (II, 114) and penetrator (II, 382) where the final syllables of these words occupy a short place.

The u of the final syllable of the word pectoribus was never long as this ending was derived from an early bhos.

In the case of pulvis no explanation of 'original long quantity' can be urged because there is no evidence of the addition of an s in the case of s-stems. Cucumis, cinis, and vomis, s-stems of the same category show no early doubling of the s. Even if there had been, this would have disappeared.
Nemus and Euryalus never had a long u as this u represents an original ơ.

It is a fact of Historical Latin Grammar that the i of the last syllable in such words as sinit and facit, was originally ơ which became ĭ before final t. In the case of oratis the tis represents an original thēs, this ơ becoming ĭ before final s. The mus of fatigamus represents an original mōs the ơ of which was changed to ū in final unaccented syllables. Thus none of the classical forms of these words could have resulted in a long vowel in the final syllable.

The a of dabat, erat and aberat was subject to the law of iambic shortening as well as to the law of shortening before final t and ā was clearly established by the time of Plautus. The law of shortening before final t operated also in the case of tondebat, stabat, and amittebat and these vowels became regularly short in the early part of the first century B. C.

The early history of the word iactetur is so uncertain that it is too great a presumption to assume an original long vowel. But even if that were the case, it would have been an original ē which would have become Ơ before it became u and thus a ū is impossible.

In regard to the words enituit and subiit there was an analogous form in the perfect indicative which had the ĭ but this too was subject to shortening before final t before the close of the second century B. C.
The e in *videt* was originally long but both by the law of shortening before final t and by the law of breves/ breviantes, the form *videt* became established as early as the time of Plautus.

The e of the final syllable of the word *peteret* was undoubtedly long in early times but it had become short before final t early in the first century B. C.

The words *fultus*, *Pleiadas*, *canit*, *profugus*, *languentia* are usually said to have the vowel of their final syllables "lengthened before a Greek word." It is hard to see why the presence of a Greek word would cause a Roman to mispronounce a Latin word.

"Possibly due to Greek imitation" is the way a long final syllable in the words *manus*, and *Jovis* is explained but this explanation has no weight whatsoever.

*Nullius* is really left unexplained according to these explanations, for the only reason offered is, "Vergil follows Ennius. The use in Ennius is difficult to explain." It is granted that the u of the final syllable was originally short.

*Gravidus* is another word left unexplained except for the suggestion that "the poet by a licence trusts the reader to sound a short syllable long." The only way this could be accomplished according to the theory that the syllable is normally short is to lengthen the vowel. Such a radical modification of the vowel of a word would give a very grotesque effect in the reading of the poem.
Other reasons which are closely related to one another are "lengthened by the ictus", "lengthened before the caesura", "lengthened in arsis", "diastole due to the full stop after the word" "licence with no thought of Etymology" and "irregularly lengthened".

In the belief that a syllable ending in a consonant preceded by a short vowel is short these reasons must imply that the vowel is lengthened. And it can hardly be imagined that an artistic reader of Latin verse would pronounced erit, "erīt", or caput, "capūt". Surely Vergil the master poet would hesitate decidedly before thus arbitrarily lengthening a vowel.

The various words for which only these explanations are offered, are invalidus, ebur, puer, domus, caput, erit, ad-locuitur, petiit, datur, obrui-mur, ingreditur, procūl. This list of words then is left with no explanation except arbitrary lengthening.

Thus we have shown that no adequate explanation of these apparent irregularities has been offered by those who assume that the syllables are normally short. Such explanations as have been suggested are contrary either to the laws of Historical Latin Grammar or to reason. While in many cases the explanations "lengthened in thesis" or "lengthened by the ictus" are in themselves a confession of a lack of explanation.
We shall now consider what explanations are available for the apparently irregular quantity of these syllables on the assumption that they are normally long.

In the case of the first forty-five of the fifty-seven instances cited above the principal caesura follows the syllable of so-called "irregular quantity". The pause caused by the caesura prevents the linking of the final consonant with the following initial vowel and the syllable remains closed and so retains its normal long quantity.

For example:

invalidus, etiamque tremens etiam inscius aevi.
G. III, 189 (trithemimeral caesura)

Tityrus hinc aberat, ipsae te Tityre pinus.
Ecl. I, 38. (penthemimeral caesura)

hic hasta Reneae stabat, huc impetus illam.
A. XII, 773. (hephthemimeral caesura)

It is noteworthy that in the case of hiatus the non-elided vowel immediately precedes a caesura as for example: (A. I, 16)

posthabita coluisse Samo: hic illius arma
A. III, 34:

accessi viridemque ab homo convellere silvam

The instances number 46-51 form another class. In each case a Greek word with a rough breathing follows the questioned syllable. Similar instances are found in Catullus' non despexit hymenaeos (64, 20) and novo auctus hymenaeos, (66, 11).
Evidently the distinct effort to pronounce the foreign word correctly prevented the linking of the final consonant of the preceding word.

The verses involving super (A. VI, 254), sanguis (A. X, 487), and petit (A. IX 9) have already been explained and in fact offer no irregularity.

In the verse involving pulvis:

per terram et versa pulvis inscribitur hasta (A. I, 478), there may be a hephthemereral caesura in which case the explanation would be the same as for the first 45 instances, explained above. In case a penthemimeral caesura is insisted upon, we must assume that the poet intended arbitrarily that the usual linking of final consonants should not take place thus leaving the syllable in its normal quantity. This may seem harsh but it is no more so than that the poet should suspend the law of elision at will as in A. IV, 335: quid struit? aut qua spe inimica in gente moratur.

G. II, 5: muneribus tibi pampineo, gravidus autumno. This verse is remarkable for it has a spondee in the fifth foot. The explanation of the final syllable of the word gravidus is the same as for pulvis cited above — that is, the poet here suspended the law of the linking of final consonants. This is comparable to the hiatus in the spondaic verse, A. I, 617:

tune ille Aeneas, quem Dardanio Anchisae

This same explanation holds for petit Evandri, (A. IX, 9) if it is insisted that petit is a present indicative.
A. IV, 64: pectoribus inhians spirantia consulit exta.

In this verse, the importance of the word pectoribus may demand a trithemimeral caesura and thus the syllable is closed. If the caesura occurs after the word inhians there must be a suspension of the law of the linking of final consonants as in the case of gravidus and pulvis.

Thus on the short-by-position theory a reasonable explanation is given for every instance where a syllable ending in a consonant preceded by a short vowel is used in a long place before a word beginning with a vowel.

Together with about 50 feminine caesuras which occur after a syllable ending in a short vowel in the following instances a feminine caesura may or must be admitted.

Ecl. II, 4: Adsidue veniebat ibi haec incondita solus.
Ecl. III, 90: Qui Pavium non odit amet tua carmina Maevi.
Ecl. IV, 34: Alter erit tum Tiphys et altera quae vehat Argo.
Ecl. V, 53: Daphin ad astra feremus amat nos quoque Daphnis.
Ecl. X, 28: equis erit modus inquit amor non talia curat.
G. I, 299: nudus ara sere nudus hiems ignava colono.
G. II, 133: extremi sinus orbis ubi aer a vinoere summum.
G. IV, 369: unde pater Tiberinus et unde Myssysqye Caicus.
A. II, 48: aut aliquis latet error equo ne credite Teucri.
While a verse as written may conform strictly to the requirements of the hexameter, the reading of the verse ordinarily would not correspond entirely, for wherever a caesura is admitted the consequent pause would interrupt the flow of the rhythm, and the pronunciation of a long syllable at this place would cause no offense even though the verse required technically a short syllable, if the short syllable is provided for in the written verse.

A similar situation is seen in such a verse as:

nam Póllydorus ego. hic conduxum ferrea texit (A. II, 45)

Where, owing to the pause in the verse the whole word would probably be pronounced while eclipsis or elision is required and provided for.

Having collected and examined the material that may
possibly be used to justify some decision concerning the true quantity of final syllables ending in a consonant preceded by a short vowel we may now sum up the deductions and state our conclusion.

In the examination of the "syllaba aniceps" we have found that Vergil distinctly sought to avoid closing the verse with a short syllable and allowed a short syllable only in certain classified situations. Since Vergil freely allowed a verse to end in a single consonant preceded by a short vowel, it is reasonable to conclude that he considered these syllables long.

An examination of the explanations offered for the so-called irregular quantities shows that in order to explain a long quantity, scholars who hold the view that these syllables are normally short are compelled to resort to statements which are contrary to the known facts of Historical Latin Grammar and statements contrary to reason and frequent confessions of unsolved difficulties. In a word those who consider these syllables normally short are unable to explain the fifty-seven cases of "irregular lengthening".

On the other hand those who hold the view that these syllables are normally long give a natural and simple explanation for these fifty-seven verses.

Finally, our examination of the hexameters of Vergil has shown that those who hold the view that a final syllable ending in a single consonant preceded by a short vowel is normally
short are unable to explain satisfactorily many of the phenomena in the verses, while those who hold the view that these syllables are normally long readily explain these instances in harmony with the facts of the language and the usage of the poet.
Note

Other considerations support the view
that a final syllable ending in a consonant preceded a short
vowel is normally long.

Agri normally divided a-gri is sometimes used by the
poets as a spondee, divided ag-ri. If the a when added the
a makes the syllable long it is hard to see why any syllable
ending in a consonant is not likewise to be regarded long.
Tenebrae and similar words present the same problem. In
the word ius sus the first syllable is universally considered
long. How can the last syllable which is practically identical
with it be short?
Bibliography

Vergil text - 1. Ribbeck

Authorities on the length of syllables.

**Ancient**

1. Pompeius Keil V.
2. Charisius Keil I.
3. Diomedis Keil I.
4. Victorinus Keil VI.
5. Bede Keil VII.

**Modern**

1. Kuhner Grammar
2. Bullion and Morris Grammar
3. Madvig Grammar
4. Roby Grammar
5. Fisher Grammar
6. Kennedy Grammar
7. Andrews - Stoddard Grammar
9. Allen and Greenough Grammar
10. Bennett Grammar
11. Burton Grammar
12. Harkness Grammar
13. Lane's Revised Grammar
14. Hale and Buck Grammar
15. Lucian Muller's "De re Metrica"
   translated by Platner.
16. Richardson was consulted but
   specific quotations can not
   be made from the text since
   it has unfortunately dis-
   appeared from the Classical
   Library.

Notes on Vergilian Meter.

3. Ladewig and Schaper Vergil.
4. Papillon and Haigh Vergil.
5. Carter Aeneid.
8. Knapp Aeneid.
11. Frieze
12. Johnston's "Metrical Licences of Vergil".