European labor aristocracies: trade unionism, the hierarchy of skill, and the stratification of the manual working class before the First World War / Marc Linder.

Linder, Marc.

http://hdl.handle.net/2027/uc1.b4265861
The notion of a labor aristocracy has been in circulation for more than 150 years. A term of opprobrium and praise in different political circles, it has never been the object of rigorous scrutiny. This study seeks to locate the concept within the various traditions of class analysis.

First, the book uncovers the roots of the discussion of labor aristocracy in the political and socio-economic conditions prevailing in England in the second quarter of the nineteenth century. It shows how this pre-Marxist intellectual background was filtered through the political economy of Marx and Engels.

Second, on the basis of a critical analysis of the immanent contradictions of this dominant Marxist tradition, it undertakes a comprehensive empirical analysis of numerous indicators of the presence of a labor aristocracy in the major industrial societies of Europe before World War I.
European Labor Aristocracies
European Labor Aristocracies
Marc Linder was educated in the United States and West Germany. He received a Ph. D. in politics from Princeton University and a J. D. from Harvard Law School. He has taught economics and political science in the United States, West Germany, Denmark, and Mexico. Author of several books in the areas of political economy and jurisprudence, he is currently an attorney in the migrant farmworker division of Texas Rural Legal Aid in the Rio Grande Valley.
Marc Linder

European Labor Aristocracies

Trade Unionism, the Hierarchy of Skill, and the Stratification of the Manual Working Class before the First World War

Campus Verlag · Frankfurt
Linder, Marc:
European labor aristocracies: trade unionism, the hierarchy of skill, and the stratification of the manual working class before the first World War / Marc Linder. – Frankfurt/Main ; New York : Campus Verlag, 1985.
ISBN 3-593-33457-7

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.
Copyright © 1985 by Campus Verlag GmbH, Frankfurt
Printed in West Germany
Table of Contents

List of Tables ................................................................. 8
Preface ................................................................. 12
Acknowledgments ...................................................... 13

Chapter 1
Introduction ................................................................. 14

Part I
The Labor Aristocracy in Britain ............................................ 19

Chapter 2
Early Socialism and Trade Unionism (1820s and 1830s) .. 21

Chapter 3
Chartism .................................................................................................... 29

Chapter 4
The Transition from the Age of the Chartists to the Age of Capital: The Radical Left-Wing Naturalization of the Notion of an Aristocracy of Labor .............................. 37

Chapter 5
Marx and Engels and the Labor Aristocracy of Mid-Victorian Britain ................................................................. 48
A. The Structure and Distribution of Skills within the Manual Working Class ................................................................. 48
B. Working Class Income ............................................................... 59
C. Marx's and Engels' Progressive Disillusionment with British Trade Unions ................................................................. 64
D. The World Market ................................................................. 70
E. Economic and Social Differentiation within the Working Class ................................................................. 84
F. Engels' Accusation of Class Collaborationist Trade Unionism ................................................................. 98
G. The Second Reform Bill: The Parliamentary Debate on the Political Co-optability of the Labor Aristocracy ........................................................ 100

H. Engels on New Unionism ......................................................... 103

I. Conclusions ..................................................................................... 104

Chapter 6
Some Preliminary Results: An Alternative Theoretical Perspective .............................................................. 107

Chapter 7
The British Labor Aristocracy from the Depression of the 1880s to the First World War ................................. 112

A. The Trend Reversal of Basic Economic Variables ............ 112

B. Differentiation within the Working Class ......................... 115

1. Changes in Class and Occupational Structure ............ 115
   a. Age ........................................................................................ .. 120
   b. Sex ......................................................................................... 120
   c. Urbanization ........................................................................ 122
   d. Supervisory Personnel .......................................................... 123
   e. Trade Union Membership .................................................... 126
   f. Ethnic Composition .............................................................. 127
   g. Pauperism ............................................................................ 127

2. The Skill Structure ............................................................... 129

3. Income and Working and Living Conditions ............. 140
   a. Income ................................................................................. .. 140
   b. Unemployment ...................................................................... 156
   c. Other Sources of Wage Losses ........................................... 158
   d. Other Indicators ................................................................... 163
   e. Conclusions ...................................................................... .. 165

C. The Ambiguous Class Status of the Aristocracy of Labor ........................................................................... 167

D. Trade Unions, Politics and the Aristocracy of Labor ................................................................................... 176

Part II
Continental European Labor Aristocracies ......................... 179

Chapter 8
Germany ......................................................................................... 181

A. The Revolution of 1848 ............................................................. 181

6
B. A Comparison of the Craft Basis of Trade Unionism in Germany and Britain .......................... 184
C. From the Revolution to the Expiration of the Anti-Socialist Laws ......................................... 187
D. From 1890 to the First World War ......................... 191
   1. Comparative Growth of Trade Union Membership .. 191
   2. The Industrial Skill Basis of German Trade Unionism ......................................................... 195
   3. German Theories of Skilled Trade Unionists as Labor Aristocrats ..................................... 199
   4. Self-Employment .............................................. 202
   5. National Peculiarities of the German Labor Aristocracy ................................................... 205
E. Summary .......................................................... 210

Chapter 9
France .............................................................. 214
A. The Period prior to the Paris Commune ................. 214
B. The Third Republic to World War I ..................... 218

Chapter 10
Labor Aristocracies in other European Countries ...... 225
Appendix. South Africa: A Racial Aristocracy of Labor? ......................................................... 229

Chapter 11
Results ............................................................. 236
List of Abbreviations ............................................. 241
Notes ............................................................... 242
List of Tables

1 Shares of World Industrial Production, 1820-1920 .... 78
2 Shares of World Exports of Manufactured Commodities, 1880-1913 ...................... 79
3 Britain's Share of World Exports in selected Metal Industries, 1880-1913 ...................... 79
4 Rates of Increase in Average Real Wages in the United Kingdom, 1865-1884 .................. 87
5 Number of Paupers (exclusive of vagrants) in Receipt of Relief in England and Wales on January 1, 1870-1890 ................................................................. 87
6 Distribution of Wages in the United Kingdom, October 1886 ........................................... 94
7 Percentage of Wills left by Males in England in 1858 valued at below £ 20 and above £ 1,000, by selected Occupation .............................................................. 96
8 Net Real Wages in the United Kingdom, 1833-1914 .. 114
9 Class Structure of Males, aged ten Years and upwards, occupied in Industry in England and Wales, 1891, 1901 and 1911 .......................... 116
10 Class Structure of Females, aged ten Years and upwards, occupied in Industry in England and Wales, 1891 and 1911 .......................... 116
11 Ratio of Employed to Employers among Males and Females, aged ten Years and upwards, in Industry in England and Wales, 1891 and 1911 .......................... 117
12 Distribution of the occupied Population, aged ten Years and upwards, among non-overlapping Classes, Sectors and Occupational Groupings in England and Wales, 1891 and 1911 .......................... 118
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Persons in government and professional Occupations as a Share of all occupied Persons in England-Wales and Germany, selected Census Years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Children, ten to fifteen Years old, in the Labor Force in England and Wales, 1891 and 1911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Male Employees in the major skilled Occupations in England and Wales, 1891 and 1911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Male Employees in the major skilled Occupations in England and Wales, 1891 and 1911: Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Male Employees in the major skilled Occupations of the Metal and Engineering Trades in England and Wales, 1891 and 1911: according to Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Distribution of weekly Earnings among full-time adult Males in the United Kingdom, 1886 and 1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Structure of weekly Earnings among full-time adult Males in the United Kingdom, 1886 and 1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Average weekly Cost and Quantity of certain Articles of Food consumed by urban Workmen's Families in the United Kingdom, 1904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Average annual Earnings of Males, by occupational Class, in the United Kingdom, 1913/14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Percentage of selected Groups of occupied Males belonging to the highest Income Groups in East London, 1886/87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Distribution of weekly Earnings among Men Employees in various Industries in the United Kingdom, 1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Distribution of weekly Earnings among full-time Women Employees in the Textile and Clothing Industries in the United Kingdom, 1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Average weekly Earnings of full-time Men and their Distribution in selected Branches in the United Kingdom, 1906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pensioners and retired Persons per 100 occupied Males in selected Age-groups in England and Wales, 1901 and 1911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Workhouse Residents and other Pensioners and retired Persons not in Lunatic Asylums, by former Occupation, per 100 occupied Males in England and Wales, 1911</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
28 Legitimate infantile Mortality by Occupation/Class of Parent in England and Wales, 1911 ................. 163
29 The British and German Labor Force in Construction, Mining, Manufactures and Industry, Census Years, 1871-1911 ....................................................... 191
30 British and German Free Trade Union Membership, 1891-1913 ...................................................... 193
31 Plant Size for selected Branches in Germany, 1895 and 1907 ............................................................... 197
32 Employers and the Self-Employed in German Industry, 1895 and 1907 .................................................. 203
33 Sectoral Composition of the economically active Population in France, 1851 ........................................ 215
34 Distribution of World Manufacturing among the four major producing Countries, 1870-1913 ............... 217
35 Distribution of World Trade in Manufactures among the four major trading Countries, 1883-1913 ......... 217
36 Share of Wage and Salary Workers employed in Industrial Establishments in Germany (1907) and France (1906) according to Employment Size-Classes . 221
And even today the book, as the current scientific mode of production teaches, is an obsolete mediation between two different card filing systems. For everything that is essential is found in the card file of the researcher who wrote it, and the scholar who studies in it assimilates it to his own card index.

Walter Benjamin, Einbahnstrasse
Preface

You know that in our industry it is entirely different from the cotton industry, and the steel industry in this respect. Our employers are not capitalists in the sense that these large organizations are. We meet our employers every day, call them Tom, Dick and Harry; we meet them from time to time when we have a little trouble. They understand our troubles and we understand theirs. You know we have a lot of members in our trades union movement in the building industry who get up and preach about capitalism and all that kind of thing, and who would have us at one another's throats with our employers, who say we have nothing in common with them. Gentlemen, we have everything in common with them. ... (1)

This study originated in 1970 in connection with an investigation into the background and motivation of demonstrations conducted in May of that year on Wall Street by members of building trades unions in ostensible solidarity with President Nixon and the American invasion of Cambodia. (2) Further research indicated that a political-economic conjunctural logic did, ultimately, lie behind this seemingly un-class conscious behavior. In order to determine whether the peculiarities of construction work had generated such tactics in the past, a full-scale history of the American construction industry and building trades unions was written; in order to test the resulting working hypotheses in a different socio-political context, briefer histories were assembled for numerous European countries.

At this point an "epistemological rupture" occurred: with construction workers relegated to the role of one exemplar of a species, the problem orientation shifted to the basic theoretical issues underlying the alleged separatist political ideologies and actions of the better-situated strata of the working class throughout the capitalist era. Since the prevailing theoretical constructs proved, however, almost wholly devoid of mediated empirical studies, (3) detailed historical illustrations became necessary both to judge the reality-content of existing theories and to help formulate more adequate explanations.

A companion volume devoted to the United States is in preparation.
Acknowledgments

Public thanks are due the staffs of the following libraries for having made their resources accessible: McGill University; Aarhus University, Arbejderbevaegelsensbibliotek, Danmarks Statistik, Det Kongelige Bibliotek, Roskilde University; Frankfurt University, Free University of Berlin, Württembergische Landesbibliothek; British Library, British Library of Political and Economic Science, Edinburgh University, National Library of Scotland; Colegio de Mexico; Chalmers Tekniska Högskola; Balch Institute, University of Baltimore, Boston College, Brandeis University, Brookings Institution, Bryn Mawr College, University of California at Berkeley, University of California at Los Angeles, University of California at Santa Barbara, Catholic University, University of Chicago, City College of New York, City University of New York, Clark University, Columbia University, Cornell University, Duke University, Eleutherian Mills, Federal Reserve Bank of New York, Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia, Fordham University, Gettysburg College, Harvard University, Haverford College, Hoover Institution, Hunter College, University of Illinois, Indiana University, Institute for Advanced Study, Jewish Labor Committee, Johns Hopkins University, University of Kansas, Library Company, Library of Congress, Lincoln University, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Middlebury College, University of New Hampshire, University of New Mexico, New York Public Library, New York State School of Industrial Relations, Northwestern University, University of Oregon, University of Pennsylvania, Pennsylvania State University, Princeton University, Rice University, Rutgers University (New Brunswick), University of Southern California, Stanford University, Swarthmore College, Tamiment Institute, Temple University, University of Texas at Austin, United States Department of Labor, Vassar College, University of Virginia, University of Washington, Wesleyan University, Williams College, University of Wisconsin, Wisconsin State Historical Society, Yale University.