America's Communal Utopias

ISSN 0003-4827
Copyright © 1999 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation
Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.10270

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
lict with the German and Welsh settlements of Cresco and Lime Springs, Iowa. Those familiar with the common experiences of Iowa farm families in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries will enjoy making comparisons with this family. The story of the Kruegers’ attempt to adapt to a world wrought with change is worth comparing with that of other farm families—immigrant or not. Those interested in the making of century farms in the Midwest will find the Kruegers’ story compelling because a primary goal for the family as it sought continuity with the past was to maintain a presence on the land.

Kathleen Neils Conzen’s informative essay, “Their Stake in the Land,” provides the broader context needed to give the Kruegers’ story regional significance, although it would have been better placed as a preface to the book rather than inserted after the first chapter. The photographs in the volume might have served the reader even better had they been numbered for quick reference from text to image. It would also have been preferable if all photographs in the volume were given dates to help readers keep generations straight, although the generational chart at the back of the volume is a useful guide.

Any student of history wishing to gain insight into working with material culture would do well to study this publication. McLellan shows how objects have meanings for people beyond their everyday uses. The Kruegers, like many midwestern farm families, passed along artifacts from one generation to the next, just as they passed on farm land. Those artifacts served as symbols of identity for the family and played a central role in the family’s need to develop a sense of shared identity. The photographs in this collection are filled with such everyday objects, carefully included in staged, idealized representations of a family that turned the camera on itself. Six Generations Here shows us how one family developed a perception of its past while at the same time helping us to understand on the local level the immigrant experience that helped create the rural landscape of the Midwest.


REVIEWED BY EDWARD K. SPANN, INDIANA STATE UNIVERSITY

If nothing else, this collection of essays covers many interesting aspects of America’s communal past. The 17 essays deal with, among others, Ephrata, the Shakers, the Harmonists, Robert Owen and New Harmony, Mormon communalism, Fourierism and Brook Farm, the In-
spirationists who founded the Amana Colonies, various monasteries, John Humphrey Noyes and his Oneida Community, the French Icarian communities, the Bishop Hill Colony, the Hutterite communities, Jewish agricultural communities, Cyrus Teed’s Koreshan community in Florida, the Theosophists of Point Loma and elsewhere, two socialist communities in California, and Father Divine’s Peace Mission. Each essay includes a chronology and a bibliography dealing with its subject. The editor, Donald Pitzer, provides, as an appendix, an awesomely detailed listing of every religious and secular community attempted in America before 1965 (he intentionally excludes the numerous counter-culture communes established after that date).

As one might expect from a collection of individually written essays, quality varies, but it is notably high in most cases. Perhaps the best essay is that by Jonathan G. Andelson on the Inspirationists and the Amana Colonies that they founded in Iowa. In a dozen pages, Andelson ably depicts the character and development of these interconnected communities from their formation in the late 1850s to their discovery by the tourist trade in the 1960s. Although this essay lacks the detail of Bertha M. H. Shambaugh’s definitive work on Amana, it is an excellent introduction to the subject, enhanced by an interesting panoramic photograph of the colony in 1910.

Some others essays are almost as good, notably Carl Guameri’s on the Fourierist phalanxes and Gertrude E. Huntington’s on the Hutterite communities. At the opposite extreme, though, is the essay by the editor, Donald Pitzer, on the Owenite experiment at New Harmony. Pitzer spends an excessive amount of time discussing Robert Owen without enhancing our understanding of the man, his thought, or his place in history. Not only is this discussion rather flabby, but it uses up most of the space needed to deal with the social experience of Owen’s largely American followers at New Harmony itself.

Probably every collection of essay invites criticism regarding the choice of subjects. In this case, the inclusion of essays on Catholic monasteries and on Father Divine seems to have more to do with today’s interest in “multiculturalism” than with communal utopias. On the other hand, one wonders why the editor chose to ignore Hopedale, one of the most American as well as most important of the religious experiments, and why he has done the same regarding various communities founded by secular socialists between 1890 and 1930: the Ruskin Colony is one example. By ignoring such in favor of the religious experiments that originated in Europe, Pitzer has weakened his book as a way to understand the American experience. Indeed, this
book will disappoint those who expect many insights into the relationship between communalism and American society.

All of the essays were written specifically for this volume under one guiding approach, what Pitzer calls "developmental communalism," that is, a concern with the origins, founding, growth, and decline of a community as elements of a dynamic developmental process. He would like us to believe that this approach is something new, a claim that may well irritate those who have long applied it to the subject of communalism. Original or not, this approach does establish some unity here, but that unity is far from complete and is attained at a cost. The cost is that often so much attention is given to the origins, especially the religious origins, of communities that there is insufficient space to discuss the inner workings of the communities themselves.

These are serious weaknesses, but they should not be seen as outweighing the important contributions made by the scholars who have contributed to this collection. They have given us a rich treasury of insights and understandings regarding America's communal past from which we can profit in countless ways. Whatever the weaknesses of his own work, Donald Pitzer deserves our thanks for making this possible.


REVIEWED BY S. CAROL BERG, COLLEGE OF ST. BENEDICT

Brenda J. Child, an Ojibwe from Red Lake, Minnesota, a graduate in American history from the University of Iowa, and currently an assistant professor of American Studies at the University of Minnesota, has written an engrossing study of Indian boarding school life, focusing on the years 1900–1940. She was stimulated by stories told to her by her maternal grandmother, Jeanette Auginash, a former student at Flandreau (South Dakota), one of the two boarding schools—Haskell (Kansas) is the other—Child covers in Boarding School Seasons. Research in the Bureau of Indian Affairs records and in state historical societies in Iowa, Kansas, Minnesota, and South Dakota gave her access to documents that tell of boarding school experiences "from the perspective of the American Indian students and their family members who lived in or lived with these institutions for many decades" (xiii). She quotes extensively from letters of both students and parents, the heart of this book.