Plain Women: Gender and Ritual in the Old Order River Brethren

Steven D. Reschly
tions than at elite campuses on the coasts. The demonstrations at IU following the invasion of Cambodia and the killings at Kent State in 1970 were largely peaceful. No one was killed or seriously injured, although fears of violence—particularly from the Klan, the police, and prowar groups—were well founded.

Wynkoop's dissertation tackled head-on both the scholarly and political conflicts about 1960s protest, but the book does not consider those issues; thus the significance of the author's research gets understated. One other important point did not make it from the dissertation to the book: There is little acknowledgment of this history on most campuses, which does a disservice not only to the memories of the activists, but also to today's students, who are denied an important part of their own history.

Plain Women: Gender and Ritual in the Old Order River Brethren, by Margaret C. Reynolds. Pennsylvania German History and Culture Series 1; Publications of the Pennsylvania German Society 34. University Park: Penn State University Press, 2001. xii, 192 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. $29.95 cloth.

Reviewer Steven D. Reschly is associate professor of history at Truman State University. He is the author of The Amish on the Iowa Prairie, 1840 to 1910 (2000).

Margaret Reynolds researched the Old Order River Brethren in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania, with a combination of scholarly authority and personal empathy. Her fusion of participation and perspective makes this volume particularly interesting and useful. She conducted extensive oral interviews with 28 women and 7 men, supplemented by the available written sources and her participant-observer experiences of River Brethren life, faith, and ritual. Reynolds makes a rich contribution to the literature on plain religious groups.

Plain Women began as a doctoral dissertation in American studies at Penn State–Harrisburg. When Reynolds died in 1999 at the age of 51, her dissertation advisor, Simon J. Bronner, completed the editorial work for this publication.

The book consists of an introduction and four chapters. Chapter one traces the history of the Old Order River Brethren as a mixture of Anabaptist theology of church and world and Pietist understandings of conversion and religious experience. In the absence of extensive historical documentation, Reynolds relied at times on the "collective memory" of her subjects. One aspect of the story is the typical tale of separation—from the world, and from each other in church splits and personality conflicts. But Reynolds located another theme: blending—
of Anabaptist and Pietist traditions, of splintered River Brethren groups, of technology and simplicity. Her reading of this history, in other words, perceived both flexible creativity and inflexible core principles. Unfortunately, many observers miss the creative and adaptive side of the history of such groups.

In chapter two, on women's clothing, including the head covering, Reynolds identifies two core themes: plain clothing encourages bonding among women and, thus, greater social cohesion; and women's clothing reifies "shared social control" to ensure distinction and cultural survival (62). Reynolds also demonstrates that plain dress transmutes over time, does not remain static, and allows for some variation. For example, many River Brethren women, but not all, believe that the head covering should be opaque to fulfill the Apostle Paul's injunction in I Corinthians 11 that women's hair should be "covered." Net coverings leave the hair visible. Above all, Reynolds shows women's participation (complicity, if one prefers) in retaining plain clothing as a symbol and practice of distinction. The women she interviewed were thoughtful in discussing the reasons they choose to wear plain dress, showing the practice as more complex than simplistic patriarchal domination.

In chapter three, Reynolds discusses food and the relationship between kitchen traditions and business enterprise. She examines three different types of food interface, from least to most interaction with non-Brethren: baking for a neighborhood grocery, baking for a food stand, and serving meals in the home. Her description of a woman who serves meals in her home is especially effective and poignant. The family was willing to play "tourist Amish" instead of spending endless amounts of time attempting to explain the similarities and differences among plain groups, despite the generally tiresome confusion among outsiders who make little effort to differentiate among the groups. In one of the book's best phrases, Reynolds labeled the "contrived ethnicity" (132) of serving traditional foods to tourists that real River Brethren may not even eat any longer.

In chapter four Reynolds depicts breadmaking, a segment of the River Brethren love feast that is unique to this group. Her analysis of the elements of that ritual—the use of space in the worship service, the framing of women's breadmaking within men's preaching, the silence—are finely integrated into her understanding of women's power to make or break the group. Much as Elaine Tyler May used "domestic containment" as a term to identify gender ideology in the 1950s, Reynolds shows how River Brethren women are simultaneously recognized and appropriated to stabilize group identity.
Plain Women would benefit from a longer conclusion to pull the argument together, a step that the author’s death likely prevented. Nonetheless, I am happy to see this volume in print and offer kudos to Simon Bronner for seeing the project through. It adds valuable material to the small but growing scholarship on plain women.


Reviewer Jennifer Pustz is the historian at Brucemore in Cedar Rapids, Iowa, and a Ph.D. candidate in American studies at the University of Iowa. She is writing her dissertation on the interpretation of domestic servants at historic house museums.

In the closing essay of Restoring Women’s History through Historic Preservation, Heather A. Huyck reminds readers, “Historic places tell us who we are as a people and where we have come from. Omitting any significant portion of our history distorts all of it” (364). These simple but powerful sentences summarize the need for these two recent anthologies focusing on women’s history at historic places. Given that women make up half of the world’s population, ignoring their presence and activities in homes, landscapes, and a host of other locations prevents a significant portion of visitors to historic places from making their own personal connections to history.

Together, these anthologies thoroughly address the many ways women have been and can be more visible as preservationists and as the subjects of historical inquiry. Women have played an important role in the preservation movement since its beginning. The efforts of Ann Pamela Cunningham and the Mount Vernon Ladies’ Association to save George Washington’s home are legendary in the history of preservation, and their work inspired other women’s organizations such as the Daughters of the American Revolution to take on similar projects. Despite their significant contributions to saving historic places, these women have often been overlooked. Women were also frequently invisible residents of the thousands of historic houses and sites open to the public. Although the wives, mothers, daughters, and domestic servants connected to the great men of the houses played