Altering American Consciousness: the History of Alcohol and Drug Use in the United States, 1800-2000

ISSN 0003-4827
Copyright © 2005 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.10876

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
A later generation of social workers was appalled by the CAS's cavalier placement of its charges, insisting on a level of oversight that would offer the children protection and an ongoing relationship with the placement agency. The embattled organization responded to its critics with improved oversight, but it was never completely successful in quelling disapproval.

O'Connor tells the story of the orphan trains in a beautifully written book that is notable in two respects. First, he does a superb job of presenting Brace as a compelling intellectual, someone far more complex and uncertain than might be apparent from the somewhat simple-minded emigration scheme he devised. Second, he tells the stories of the children, successes and failures, as much as possible from the spotty records available. His writing is imaginative and compassionate, honoring Brace for his genuine affection for the children he tried to help and crediting him with helping to pioneer the foster care system. Yet he recognizes how abysmally the CAS failed to understand the vulnerability of its charges and how shamelessly it touted its successes, with little evidence to substantiate its claims.

Readers of Iowa history will be especially interested in the stories of children placed in the Midwest and in the protests made by western states regarding the emigration program. But the heart of the story is not regional. It is an intellectual history of an enterprise that was part genius and part folly, one that continues to haunt the American imagination.


Reviewer Elaine Frantz Parsons is assistant professor of history at Duquesne University. She is the author of Manhood Lost: Drunken Men and Redeeming Women in the Nineteenth Century United States (2003).

Altering American Consciousness, a collection of 15 essays dealing with substance use throughout the history of the United States, manages to be both ambitious and solid. The essays are quite cohesive; a body of themes, questions, sources, and theories appear repeatedly. The largest common theme is the changing consensus on the meaning of addiction, and on what sorts of uses of alcohol and other drugs are social problems. Many of the essays deal with competition among professional and governmental groups for ownership of the addiction problem. Certain important contemporary scholars, such as Larry Levine, Robin Room, and David Musto, and crucial historical figures such as Harry
Anslinger, T. D. Crothers, George Beard, and E. M. Jellinek, are significant in many of the essays, giving them a productive continuity.

One of the strengths of the book, and one of the primary goals of its editors, is its integration of alcohol history with that of other drugs, including prescription drugs. Although this collection reflects the fact that most scholars work on either alcohol or other drugs rather than on both together, both the editors’ introduction and one of the most exciting essays in the collection, Susan Speaker’s “Demons for the Twentieth Century,” explicitly discuss the connection. Speaker’s exploration of the interwar anti-drug movement’s mobilization of nineteenth-century temperance rhetoric is long overdue. The editors have also done a good job of juxtaposing drug and alcohol history and bringing out common themes through their choice of complementary essays. It is quite telling, for instance, to read Michelle McClellan’s and Lori Rotskoff’s work on alcohol, gender, and the family alongside Caroline Acker’s “Portrait of an Addicted Family: Dynamics of Opiate Addiction in the Early Twentieth Century.”

Although these essays are generally national in scope, one deals specifically with Iowa. Editor Sarah Tracy has done extensive work on the history of addiction treatment in the state. Her essay in this volume, “Building a Boozatorium: State Medical Reform for Iowa’s Inebriates, 1902–1920,” based on her award-winning article in the *Annals of Iowa*, maps out how the rise and fall of Iowa’s inebriate treatment system, which was far more robust than that of most other states, was driven by local factors such as strong progressive sentiment, expansion of the state bureaucracy, and interprofessional competition for responsibility and funding.

The only regret I have about this volume is the unavoidable flip side of its coherence: its uneven coverage of the territory staked out by its title. Few of the articles deal at length with the experiences of drug and alcohol consumers. Even Peter Mancall’s tantalizingly titled essay, “‘I Was Addicted to Drinking Rum’: Four Centuries of Alcohol Consumption in Indian Country,” for instance, is much more about others’ views of American Indians’ drinking than about American Indian drinkers’ self-understandings. Those pieces that emphasize addicts’ own experiences, such as Acker’s work on an addicted family, draw on accounts by or case records of those who have been institutionalized, in which the experience of substance use is heavily mediated by therapeutic culture. This selection of sources is largely a reflection of what is available, of course, but the inclusion of a few pieces on the experience of drink by literary scholars such as John Crowley or Nicholas Warner (both of whom endorse the book on its back cover) would
have complemented the others nicely. Perhaps the most problematic result of this therapeutic orientation is that only Nicholas Weiss's article on antidepressants and Steven Novak's on LSD include substantial discussion of alcohol or other drugs as anything other than a problem. The pleasures of moderate drinking and the conviviality of the saloon, for instance, have little place in this volume.

Also missing from this collection are attempts to place alcohol and drug use in the United States in an international context. A few essays, such as Tracy's, make gestures in that direction, and Great Britain makes an occasional appearance throughout the volume, but a more sustained reminder to readers that both the economics and discourse of alcohol and drugs were deeply implicated in a global system would have been healthy. I also wish there had been more on the first half of the 200-year time frame given in the book's title. Only two of the 15 essays, those by Mancall and Chavigny, focus on the 1800s. These criticisms, however, reflect much more on the state of the field than on the choices of the editors.

This is a valuable and much needed collection. Tracy and Acker have done their job well. After bringing together many of the most important established and emerging scholars of drug and alcohol history, they did valuable work editing their submissions, resulting in essays that are consistently well written, solidly grounded, and largely free of alienating jargon. This volume is an unmatched guide both to the ideas central to the field and to its cutting edge.


Reviewer Ralph Scharnau teaches U.S. history at Northeast Iowa Community College, Peosta. He has published a number of articles on Iowa labor history. Labor historians continue to publish important national studies. The number of accounts focusing on the state and local levels, however, remains limited. In Iowa, many labor topics await new or further exploration. A few tracts narrating the history of local unions in Iowa have been published. The most recent addition comes with John W. McKerley's study of Carpenters Local 1260 in Iowa City. McKerley, a graduate student in history at the University of Iowa, has written a brief historical overview of the local union based on research in selected secondary works and a variety of primary materials. Aiming at an audience of union members and professional historians, McKerley chronicles Local 1260's century of development from its founding in