Indian Land Tenure: Bibliographical Essays and a Guide to the Literature

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.11372

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
mainly through use of extensive, informative footnotes and appendices. The inclusion of a modern, contemporary map would have been welcome, but that in no way detracts from this valuable work.

—Ronald Rayman
Western Illinois University


Perhaps the most misunderstood aspect of the American Indian's heritage among both the general public and the scholarly world is his relationship with the land. From the first European settlers to the readers of today the unique concept—or concepts—which the Indian has regarding the land has mystified whites. Frequently, this failure to comprehend has created serious problems for the Indian, and certainly many of the present disputes concerning Indian claims have roots entrenched firmly in the confusion resulting from the clash of conflicting ideas. Imre Sutton's Indian Land Tenure will do much to clarify the situation. Encased in this volume is a concise and comprehensive review of the various interpretations of the problem. Sutton leads the reader through the labyrinth of words created by the various "schools" and methodologies with the steadiness of Ariadne's thread.

The book is divided into several essays which cover the various aspects of Indian land tenure—such as original occupancy and territoriality or land utilization and administration. Sutton has eased the reader's task by cross coding the essays to denote where the topics are inter-related. Therefore, the second essay is labeled "B;" the third essay, entitled "Land Administration and Land Utilization," is labeled "C." The fourth essay deals with a combination of these topics and is labeled "BC." This arrangement allows the reader to quickly identify the subjects and make quick correlations.

The writing is of high quality and Sutton generally keeps his own ideas in the background and allows the interpretations to speak for themselves. However, when he states that the introduction of the horse not only allowed the Plains people to attain greater mobility but also "necessitated their entry into alien territories in quest of food," one may question whether it "necessitated" or "allowed" the natives to make incursions into their neighbors' lands.

The bibliography included in the volume will quickly become a standard reference work for all historians interested in the American Indian. It is a major contribution in itself.

In his forward to the volume, Wilcomb Washburn correctly asserts that: "No historian or student who wishes to examine the relationship of the Indian and the land . . . can ignore the pathways and directions that Professor Sutton has so carefully laid out." Both Sutton and Clearwater Publishing
Company—which is becoming a leader in the production of Indian history—should be congratulated on their effort. *Indian Land Tenure* will be a valuable addition to anyone's library of the American Indian.

—Carl N. Tyson
Oklahoma State University


In *The Navajos and the New Deal* Donald L. Parman examines the philosophy of John Collier, Commissioner of Indian Affairs from 1933 to 1945, the policies he instituted, and the operation of these policies on the Navajo reservation. Deliberately disregarding the events leading to the formation of Indian policies in Washington, Parman seeks instead to describe the tribe's experience with these policies. In this he is largely, though not entirely, successful.

Parman has produced an excellent administrative history in which he competently and interestingly describes the political environment in which New Deal policies operated, and the practical problems encountered in attempting to implement them. Collier's attempts to revive Indian culture, promote tribal self-government, improve education and health care, and establish a subsistence economy on the reservation met with resistance from "progressive" Navajos who urged that Indians be educated so as to be assimilated into white culture. Parman is at his best when describing Collier's attempts to halt the shrinkage of the reservation and to end overgrazing by herd reduction. These land-management policies met with resistance from whites who wished to prevent further expansion of Indian land and from Navajos who found their traditional way of life threatened.

Parman is considerably less successful in describing the cultural factors which influenced Navajo reactions to government policies and the effect of these policies on the Navajo way of life. For example, although he points out that resistance to herd reduction was due in part to the importance of livestock in Navajo religious and social life, he only superficially sketches the cultural factors involved and the adjustments required to comply with policy. Although he indicates the Catholic missionaries supported the "traditionalists" and Protestant missionaries favored the "progressives," he does not discuss the reasons behind these political alliances.

Parman's research is careful and well documented. He draws heavily on government archives and the private papers of those involved in the administration of New Deal policies on the reservation. Whenever possible, he personally interviewed participants. Relying on these sources, he tends to focus on political conflict and administrative details, somewhat neglecting the larger perspective. For example, although he points out that the Navajos
Copyright of Annals of Iowa is the property of State of Iowa, by & through the State Historical Society of Iowa and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.