Conflicted Mission: Faith, Disputes and Deception on the Dakota Frontier

Michael Knock
Clarke University
afforded him the best opportunity of doing so. Moreover, his family and old neighbors appear to have held no grudge against him for it. In perhaps the most touching episode in the book, Pond returns home to Connecticut dressed in the finery of a *bourgeois gentilhomme* of Montreal. He was thought odd by the sober Calvinist merchants of the town, but there was no hostility to him as a Loyalist. It would seem that by the late 1780s the passions of war had dissipated and the world had moved on.

Chapin is to be congratulated for the research that went into this book. He has gone back to the primary documents to address a number of controversial previously reported incidents in Pond’s career and found that they probably never happened. He has also cleared up a number of details of where Pond was when. I suspect that this will be the definitive biography of the man for a long time to come. The impressive detail sometimes comes at a price, however. The author’s quest to nail down the details of Pond’s career sometimes makes for heavy going for lay readers. A more serious complaint relates to the book’s maps. Most of Pond’s career was in the far northwest, and his geographical insights were largely associated with that region. It is unfamiliar territory for most of us, and the maps reproduced or interpreted in the text are too small to provide much help to a reader seeking to keep track of Pond’s vast travels.


Reviewer Michael Knock is assistant professor of history at Clarke University. His Ph.D. dissertation (University of Notre Dame, 1996) was “‘Alone with Sitting Bull’s People’: The Dakota Indian Mission of the Congregational Church, 1870–1937.”

Conflict is at the heart of many cultural interactions, especially where religion is involved. That is not news. What is news are the conflicts that missionaries often have with one another, their spouses, and their parent organization. In some cases it is these conflicts that pose the greatest challenge to mission work. That is the idea behind Linda M. Clemmons’s *Conflicted Mission: Faith, Disputes and Deception on the Dakota Frontier*. The book furthers our understanding of the sometimes turbulent relationships that characterized the work of missionaries who represented the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM) on the Minnesota frontier in the decades prior to the Dakota War of 1862.
The expected conflicts are here. For example, the missionaries often clashed with the Native peoples they hoped to convert and “civilize.” Many of those problems can be linked to the attitudes that the missionaries carried with them. The Dakotas’ religious beliefs, Samuel Pond wrote, “were a strange medley of silly whims and abominable falsehoods; and their superstitious practices were a compound of ludicrous follies and disgusting absurdities” (31). The Dakota often responded to the missionaries’ cultural bias with a show of resistance. For example, when Stephen Riggs spoke out against a war party against the Ojibwe, a group of Dakota killed two of the mission’s cows at Lac qui Parle. One of the Dakota also removed his daughter from the mission school (70).

Less obvious—and therefore fascinating—conflicts are those that occurred within the mission and with the ABCFM. Clemmons tells the story of the missionaries’ growing appreciation for the richness and complexity of the Dakota language, for example, and the problems that change in attitude caused. Missionaries new to the frontier brought with them the bias that Dakota was a primitive language that would be easy to learn. Experience, however, taught them the complexity of the language. Some even claimed that Dakota was the equal of English and that its speakers deserved Minnesota citizenship. White settlers disagreed, putting the mission in conflict with its white neighbors.

The missionaries’ changing perceptions of the Dakota led to the kinds of deception referred to in the subtitle of Clemmons’s book, as the missionaries “consciously attempted to hide, or at least obscure, the reality of their work among the Dakota. They deliberately omitted information from their letters and reports. At times, they included information that they specified was not to be published” (216).

It is the little conflicts that are the most interesting. The missionaries’ struggle to balance maintaining a mission with learning the Dakota language and raising a family overwhelmed their initial evangelical zeal. As Mary Riggs wrote to her brother, “There is little romance in our circumstances” (118). Indeed, according to Clemmons, female missionaries were especially taxed. This is obvious in another letter written by Mary Riggs, who reported, “Agitation of spirits has unfitted me for writing, and even now, notwithstanding all my efforts to the contrary, I fear that mental depression arising from a variety of causes will weigh me down” (60). Ultimately, the stress over inadequate salaries and a lack of domestic help drove a number of missionaries from the field.

The stories that Clemmons tells are interesting, but her manner of telling them sometimes proves problematic. Because each chapter begins with a thorough summary of the main points to come, the bulk of the chapter in which the author fleshes them out seems redundant.
Nor does Clemmons tell the story of conflict from the perspective of the Dakota. She is up front with the reader about this in her introduction. This is primarily a story of white Americans told from the perspective of white Americans.

Still, *Conflicted Mission* is an excellent resource for those interested in studying the challenges of mission work on the Minnesota frontier. It also offers an interesting take on mission work. As Clemmons writes in her introduction, “Antebellum missionaries were not supposed to change; indeed, the very nature of missionary work in the early nineteenth century was designed to be unidirectional, with superior missionaries ministering to and changing supposedly inferior heathens” (3). *Conflicted Mission* confronts that stereotype by showing a dynamic mission that was constantly in flux much to the surprise of the ABCFM, the government, and certainly the missionaries themselves.


Reviewer Kristen Anderson is assistant professor of history at Webster University in St. Louis. She is working on a book manuscript tentatively titled “Abolitionizing Missouri: German Immigrants and Racial Ideology in Nineteenth-Century America.”

In *Race and Rights: Fighting Slavery and Prejudice in the Old Northwest, 1830–1870*, Dana Weiner examines the struggles of abolitionists and black rights advocates in the Old Northwest states of Ohio, Michigan, Indiana, and Illinois. Her goal is to expand our understanding of the antislavery movement by examining it in this relatively understudied region. She maintains that, although historians of abolition have generally focused on abolitionist activities in cities in the Northeast, many antislavery activists considered the Old Northwest region vital to the struggle against slavery; they thought that the future of the country lay in the West and wanted to influence its development.

In particular, Weiner argues that understanding the debate over race and slavery in the Old Northwest is necessary if we are to build a complete understanding of the evolution of racial politics in the United States during the nineteenth century. She argues that black rights were even more restricted in the Old Northwest than in other parts of the North. Officially outlawing slavery in the Northwest Ordinance did not remove issues of slavery or race from the region; slavery continued to exist in modified forms, and racial distinctions were written directly