More Than a Contest Between Armies: Essays on the Civil War Era

William B. Feis

Buena Vista University

ISSN 0003-4827
Copyright © 2009 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation
Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.1323

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
owned and operated mostly by families. They may not look like the
family farms of the nineteenth century, but ownership and day-to-day
operations of most midwestern farms are still in the hands of families.
Decrying the loss of the family farm is an understandable sentiment,
but it is not clear why family farms deserve this attention while the
disappearance of other family enterprises, such as the local hardware,
drug, and grocery store, is ignored.

This work stands alongside that of scholars such as John Mack
Faragher who have characterized the early frontier as a time of neigh-
borly assistance, bartering, self-sufficiency, and wholesome communi-

ties. As market forces gathered and grew in strength, these idyllic rural
communities gave way to agricultural capitalism that marked the end
of America’s best hope. There is little doubt that market forces did
grow and did change the nature of farm communities. But one won-
ders whether those living through the early settlement years would
have described their existence as scholars such as Salstrom have de-
scribed it. Even Salstrom notes the drudgery of the hard work, the
dangers families faced, and the meager existence of many families in
those early years.

Arguments over Salstrom’s interpretation should not detract from
the value of this work. It is a piece of solid research, careful analysis,
and rich detail. It offers more substance and complexity than many
works of twice the length. Salstrom’s efficient style packs a tremen-
dous amount of information into a small number of pages. He negoti-
ates smoothly between local history and broader economic and politi-
cal history and sets individual farm families within the larger national
and international context. This book will be of lasting value to scholars
interested in the frontier, the Midwest, and agriculture change.

More Than a Contest Between Armies: Essays on the Civil War Era, edited
by James Marten and A. Kristen Foster. Kent, OH: Kent State Univer-
sity Press, 2008. xii, 309 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. $35.00 cloth.

Reviewer William B. Feis is professor of history at Buena Vista University. He
is the author of Grant’s Secret Service: The Intelligence War from Belmont to Ap-
pronattox (2002).

Without doubt, the Frank L. Klement Lectures at Marquette University
have been a seedbed of new and alternative thinking about all aspects
of the Civil War. Named for Professor Frank L. Klement, arguably one
of the more innovative historians of the war, the lecture series has be-
come a forum for the best and the brightest in the field to float alterna-
tive approaches, new lines of questioning, differing perspectives, and
penetrating reassessments of the conflict. The 12 essays in More Than a Contest Between Armies were originally presented as Klement Lectures by scholars even those with only a passing interest in the Civil War will recognize as marquee players in a field not short on talent. Moreover, many of the lectures have become important points of departure for how we view the war in several different contexts.

Editors James Marten and A. Kristen Foster provide an informative and sympathetic overview of the iconoclastic Frank Klement’s career as a revisionist, particularly with regard to Abraham Lincoln’s abuse of civil liberties during the war. The editors also detail the inception of the lecture series as a forum for “exploring un- or under-examined events, people, and points of view” (xi). The essays in this volume meet this goal admirably as they touch on nearly every new theme to emerge in Civil War studies over the past two decades.

The first essay by Edward L. Ayers examines how the World Wide Web has significantly enlarged both the scope and depth of study of the war, especially on the regional and local level. Ayers, the mastermind behind the much praised Valley of the Shadow Project, reveals that new and imaginative approaches to examining the war coupled with the new technology of The Information Age can produce striking results that, in turn, will reach a much wider audience on the information highway.

David W. Blight, a pioneer in the study of the “remembered war,” examines Frederick Douglass’s efforts to forge a national memory of Abraham Lincoln as the emancipator and savior of the nation that honored the man and the cause but also served Douglass’s larger political purposes. Other contributors also tackle the fascinating topic of the “remembered war,” including Joan Waugh’s reassessment of Grant’s memoirs, J. Matthew Gallman’s examination of civilian memories of the war, and Gary Gallagher’s classic piece on how Jubal Early and other “Lost Cause” revisionists traded swords for pens and won the postbellum “history war.”

Also in the volume, Robert Johannsen examines the arguments of Henry Tuckerman, a mid-nineteenth-century writer and intellectual, on the cause of the Civil War and the war’s ultimate meaning; George Rable uses the disastrous Federal campaign against Fredericksburg in 1862 to show how poor journalism affected the home front; the late John Y. Simon compares the leadership of U. S. Grant and Henry Halleck to determine why the former excelled in command while the latter never got off the ground; and Lesley Gordon adds to a robust modern discussion of how common soldiers defined bravery and cowardice. Moving away from the battlefield, Catherine Clinton ex-
pands our understanding of the Confederacy’s “public women”; Mark Neely follows Klement’s footsteps, although he focuses on Jefferson Davis and civil liberties in the Confederacy; and William Blair addresses the heated postwar discussion over treason and punishment for former Confederates.

Altogether, this volume shows that revisionism of this sort not only adds much to our understanding of the American past but also provides a richly rewarding lens through which to view human beings in the crucible of war. The disparate nature of some essay collections makes it difficult to find and assess common themes. However, though fundamentally different in many ways, the essays in this volume achieve a certain harmony by concentrating on new ways of thinking about well-worn topics and on explorations into new people, events, and ideas. This volume should find its way into the personal libraries of anyone with a serious interest in the Civil War.


Reviewer LeeAnn Whites is professor of history at the University of Missouri–Columbia. She is the author of _Gender Matters: Civil War, Reconstruction, and the Making of the New South_ (2005).

In _Women on the Civil War Battlefield,_ Richard H. Hall gives readers a wide-ranging overview of the various ways women participated directly in military aspects of the Civil War. He divides his initial chapters by the form of participation, and he includes discussions of women who were variously Daughters of the Regiment, vivandières, nurses, cross dressers, women cross dressers in the cavalry, and women who served as spies, scouts, and saboteurs. He also includes chapters that focus on women who ended up in prison in connection with their military service and African American women who served, as well as a chapter in which he takes on a dozen cases of women who are thought to have served in the military, but who were actually postwar fakes or just urban legends. In the last chapter and also in a lengthy appendix, the text becomes a list of short biographies, totaling, in the case of the appendix, more than 400 documented cases of women who served during the Civil War. In compiling so much basic information about women who served, Hall has done a useful service for other historical researchers. His work can be compared in this regard to the recently published book by Thomas Lowry, _Confederate Heroines: 120 Southern Women Convicted by Union Military Justice_ (2006), which also provides