Plain Diversity: Amish Cultures and Identities

Beth E. Graybill
Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society

ISSN 0003-4827
Copyright © 2009 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation
Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.1330

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
different Lutheran church bodies or synods between 1846 and 1900. The two Norwegian American Lutheran churches in Benson represented different approaches among Norwegian Lutherans in the United States. Lovoll’s detailed analysis of the history of the two congregations does much to shed light on a complicated process.

The book’s two final chapters provide an interesting and nuanced discussion of the ways Norwegian Americans in Benson, Starbuck, and Madison became part of what Lovoll calls “the American matrix.” Here, the level of analysis shifts from the ethnic community to American society at large, and the discussions deal with the ways Norwegians participated in the educational, political, and cultural life of their communities. The section on Norwegian Americans and politics provides a particularly interesting discussion. Lovoll’s treatment of the various reform movements, such as Populism, the Nonpartisan League, and temperance, helps to further our understanding of these complex issues. The final chapter, “The Persistence of Ethnicity,” brings the story up to the present time. As in his earlier work on contemporary patterns of Norwegian American ethnicity, Lovoll shows how a sense of “Norwegianness” has survived up until the present time, but also how its development has followed its own, at times, quite particular trajectory.

In conclusion, Odd Lovoll has written a highly interesting and readable book on a dimension of Norwegian American history that so far has gone unexplored. It is recommended for anyone interested in Norwegian American history, American immigration history in general, or the history of the upper Midwest.


Two respected scholars of the Amish have united to explore the diversity of Amish experience through the lens of the 20 distinct Amish settlements in Indiana. Nolt, a historian, and Meyers, a sociologist, base their study on five years of interviews, fieldwork, and archival research. They attempt to paint a larger picture of the Amish that will be applicable beyond their state’s borders by exploring three markers of difference: ethnicity (Swiss versus Pennsylvania German dialect and folk-
ways), differing patterns of migration, and differing *Ordnungs*. Nolt and Myers define *Ordnung* as “the accumulated traditional wisdom about the proper ordering of life,” and include both “general principles, such as assuming a humble demeanor, as well as specific directives, such as the dimensions of a woman’s bonnet” (8). Some of their general interpretive frameworks have broader application, but others, such as Swiss ethnicity, are unique to the Indiana or Ohio Amish scene, with less relevance for those of us studying Amish in other parts of the country where the Pennsylvania German stream predominates.

Indiana is home to the third-largest population of Old Order Amish, following Ohio and Pennsylvania. The eastern Iowa Amish settlement in Johnson and Washington counties (around Kalona), dates to 1846, about the same time as the Indiana Amish settlements. Amish migrants from Maryland, Pennsylvania, and Ohio chose land near Kalona because of its rich farming potential. For many years, the Kalona settlement was the largest settlement west of the Mississippi River. Today, the Amish population in Missouri (just under 10,000) is higher than Iowa’s total Amish population (6,210), though it is dispersed in smaller, more numerous settlements.

Nolt and Myers identify four distinct Amish migration patterns that relate to Amish in Iowa as well as to the Indiana Amish they studied: (1) migration during the 1840s from other parts of the eastern United States to Indiana and parts west (including Iowa); (2) 1840s immigration of Amish directly to Indiana from Europe (this is the Swiss influence, largely limited to Amish in Indiana and Ohio); (3) the spawning of “offshoot” or “daughter” communities (for example, the Amish settlement in Iowa’s Buchanan County in 1914 was spawned by the Kalona settlement); and (4) present-day migration as a result of rising land prices and demographic pressures in Pennsylvania, Ohio, and New York (newer small settlements in other parts of Iowa, such as Pulaski, and in Missouri would be examples of this).

Scholars more familiar with the Iowa Amish than I will need to assess to what degree Nolt and Meyers’s findings apply to Amish in Iowa. In his book, *The Amish on the Iowa Prairie, 1840 to 1910* (2000), Steven Reschly has noted that Iowa’s Amish consisted of transplants from farms in Pennsylvania, Ohio, Maryland, and Ontario, practicing self-sufficient subsistence farming balanced with commodity market participation. “Individuals constantly joined the community and left the community as new migrants arrived from the East and others left to establish more settlements farther West” (32–33).

Nolt and Myers mention the “paradoxical relationship between the farming ideal and the practical possibility of farming” (48), given
limited farmland and Amish population growth. To what extent is cottage industry and small business enterprise (as in the Lancaster, Pennsylvania, settlement and its sister communities in Indiana) and/or factory work (as in northern Indiana) common among Iowa Amish? Is their Ordnung high or low (accepting of a greater or lesser degree of interaction with the outside world)? In their final chapter Nolt and Meyers attempt to map some of these variations of an Amish worldview along their axis of communal versus individual orientation (examples given relate to use of the ban and visits to town) and traditional versus rational authority (examples given include use of telephones and modern medicine).

To their credit, Nolt and Meyers do a good job of gendering the Amish, specifying Amish men when speaking of Amish employment in Indiana trailer factories (as well as noting that occasionally young Amish women are employed in office work in such factories), and using “the Amish” only when speaking about beliefs presumably shared by men and women in the community. However, as in much modern scholarship on the Amish, gender and women’s voices are largely obscured.

Readers of this journal will want to take note of the new edition of *A Peculiar People: Iowa’s Old Order Amish*, by Elmer Schwieder and Dorothy Schwieder, newly available from the University of Iowa Press in spring 2009, which addresses the Amish in Iowa more specifically.


Reviewer Jill M. Nussel is visiting assistant professor of history at Indiana University–Purdue University Fort Wayne. Her research and writing have focused on using cookbooks to shed light on immigrants and their communities. Most self-appointed “foodies” might say that the most important culinary advancement from Missouri was Irma Rombauer’s influential treatise *The Joy of Cooking*, but many may be surprised to know that this beloved cookbook was originally self-published in 1931. That is just one of the many surprises in Carol Fisher and John Fisher’s examination of Missouri’s rich culinary history. The study of American foodways is a growing avenue of inquiry in the academy; for everyone else, there’s a love of food. In this case the Fishers have made their case that Missouri cookbooks play a vital role in understanding the rich and varied textures of the state.