Forging the Copper Collar: Arizona's Labor-Management War of 1901-1921

ISSN 0003-4827
Copyright © 1984 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.9008

Hosted by Iowa Research Online
the illustrations in the book. A modern map of the city would also have been helpful.

Despite this, *The Gate City* is an important contribution to the study of Omaha in particular and the midwestern city in general. The authors have produced a work that is largely free of partisanship yet full of a sense of Omaha's distinctive character. They have succeeded in producing a biography of the city without succumbing to the uncritical attitudes that biographies sometimes instill in authors.

*The Gate City* is also a welcome addition to the growing literature in the field of American urban history. As such it is a worthy successor to earlier Western Urban History Series volumes on Denver, St. Louis, and Kansas City. It is hoped that additional studies in this series will be forthcoming, and that they will be equally well done.

**University of Northern Iowa**

**Kevin Boatright**


The latest work in a series of studies of the American West which examine the region's frontier mining era is James Byrkit's *Forging the Copper Collar*. Along with Richard Lingenfelter's *The Hard-Rock Miners* (Berkeley, 1974), Ronald C. Brown's *Hard Rock Miners* (College Station, 1979), and Mark Wyman's *Hard Rock Epic* (Berkeley, 1979), Byrkit's study contributes to our understanding of the day-to-day existence of western miners and the force of technological and managerial change on their work and lives. *Forging the Copper Collar*, while more narrowly focused on industrial relations in Arizona's copper industry, tackles the political history of the state in the era as well. The deportation by vigilantes of 1200 striking miners in Bisbee, Arizona in 1917 forms the centerpiece of the work and the culmination of the campaign by copper corporations to secure control of the state.

Between 1901 and 1916 a wave of reform legislation transfigured Arizona politics. A distant outpost of the Progressive movement, the territorial legislature and the 1910 Arizona Constitution Convention favored the recall of judges plus initiative and referendum; passed the eight-hour day for state and local employees, child labor laws, workmen's compensation; and nearly enacted an anti-injunction law. Under the stewardship of Arizona's first elected governor, Democrat George W. P. Hunt, the liberal, reform, and anti-corporate wave crested. Hunt and liberal labor interests tried to tax the copper com-
panies on some of the wealth which flowed from the mines to corporate coffers back east. The copper kings, led by Phelps Dodge, struck back in a campaign to fasten the copper collar on the citizens of Arizona. In some of the most detailed and compelling chapters, the author shows how the corporations bought off the press, enlisted aid in the pulpit, introduced pro-corporate material in the public schools, and sought influence in the polling booth in a struggle to dethrone labor and reform interests from power. Employing defunct copper corporation records, newspaper accounts, professional mining journal reports, and oral interviews, Byrkit convincingly shows how Phelps Dodge and others plotted to run Arizona as a satrapy within their colonial empire in the West.

Labor challenged the copper corporations on the economic front as well and held them to a standstill during the Clifton-Morenci district miners’ strike of 1915-16. This struggle set the stage for the employers’ counter-offensive at Jerome and Bisbee in 1917 when war-time strikes were broken by mass deportations of recalcitrant strikers across state lines. Electing a Republican governor in 1916 and crushing labor the following year, the copper barons’ victory was complete. The chapters on the strikes—taken from contemporary testimony before investigating committees, oral interviews with survivors, and newspaper accounts—make a compelling narrative and some of the best writing as well.

Byrkit’s interpretation of the role of the IWW and anti-radical, anti-German hysteria, on the other hand, suffers from a variety of ills. A native of Jerome and no stranger to Phelps Dodge manipulations, Byrkit seems to have imbibed his anti-corporate ideology with his mother’s milk. In analysis of political events, that ideology guides him well; in considering the labor question, it leads him astray. In his zeal to identify Walter Douglas, of Phelps Dodge, as the *eminence grise* of Arizona politics and villain of the tale, Byrkit leads us to believe, with no more than circumstantial evidence, that President Wilson’s personal friendship with Phelps Dodge director Cleveland H. Dodge guided the federal government’s hand in responding to the deportation. Byrkit also leaves the impression that the prevalence of company spies in the IWW made the organization a pawn in the corporations’ struggle with the “real” miners’ union, the International Union of Mine, Mill and Smelter Workers, formerly the Western Federation of Miners. The author’s account of the IWW in general is the weakest and most idiosyncratic chapter. Neither the notes nor the bibliography credit the work of Phillip Foner. Melvin Dubofsky’s *We Shall Be All* is commended as the best work on the subject but Dubofsky’s reasoned interpretation is entirely set aside. Byrkit relies instead
on older historical scholarship and contemporary articles from which the IWW was seen as a labor "disorganization" with nothing of value to offer the American working class. The author shows no sign of being conversant with the historiography or methodology of the new social or labor history and the work suffers as a result.

_Forging the Copper Collar_ is a valuable addition to state and local history in its account of corporate influence in politics and on the Bisbee strike and deportation of 1917. The interpretive chapter on the IWW will not, in this reviewer’s opinion, withstand critical examination by historians of American labor.

_Coe College_  

**Gregory R. Zieren**


*Oklahoma: News Views* is a collection, and, as such, it shares the one characteristic common to all collections. The quality of its contents is highly variable. The essays range from the exceptional through the mundane to the atrocious. However, because there is only one atrocity, *Oklahoma: New Views* is above average. Of the six items in the work, two are exceptional and another, while not especially inspiring, is probably the most useful of all.

The most carefully researched article is by Douglas Hale, "The People of Oklahoma: Economics and Social Change." In sixty pages Hale traces the evolution of the economic structure of the state and ties that economic process to the social development of the people. In the most highly organized and most easily read of the essays, Hale develops the patterns and processes of the past century. His contribution is sufficient in itself to justify *Oklahoma: New Views*.

Also of merit is the essay by Danney Goble on the political history of Oklahoma. Being the most knowledgeable historian of Oklahoma politics currently active, and having produced one major monograph in the area and co-authored another, Goble could not easily do otherwise than provide a solid summary of his major efforts. "Oklahoma Politics and the Sooner Electorate" devotes a solid forty pages to the task, and the results are excellent.

The most useful of the essays is the sixty-page historiographical essay by Rennard Strickland. The task of making historiography interesting is difficult, if not impossible, so it comes as no surprise that this essay lacks the excitement of some others in the collection. But a deficiency of excitement is not the same as a shortage of fascination.