At Odds With Progress: Americans and Conservation

REVIEWED BY JAMES H. MADISON, INDIANA UNIVERSITY, BLOOMINGTON

The dozen essays in Sense of Place honor the contributions of Lynwood Montell to understanding the folklore of the Upper Cumberland region of Kentucky and Tennessee. The subjects range geographically from Oregon to Maryland’s Eastern Shore and topically from fur trapping to pioneer cemeteries. All are connected, however, by attention to a sense of place, particularly, as Barbara Allen states it, to understanding “how people construct a sense of place, of region, for themselves through cultural expression” (12).

Readers interested in the Midwest will find the collection of considerable utility. The overview essays by Barbara Allen and Thomas J. Schlereth constitute thoughtful introductions to the major themes and to the scholarly literature of regionalism, particularly in the disciplines of folklore and American studies. One of the essays relates directly to an interesting part of midwestern culture, the tornadoes and the stories about them that give midwesterners a particularly vivid sense of place. Tornado stories, Larry Danielson argues, allow for displaying “a covert pride in coping with and surviving such an unpredictable and potentially dangerous climate” (39). Other essays, on subjects further removed from Iowa or the Midwest, will nonetheless be of interest for revealing the complexities of regional cultures. The dualities, contradictions, and paradoxes within virtually all regions should make anyone cautious about generalizations for a place as large and diverse as the Midwest or even Iowa. And yet, as these essays show, regional identity, with its sense of us and them, runs through American culture. To assume a homogeneous nation and an American character without attention to this sense of place is to misread seriously the lessons of these essays.


REVIEWED BY PATRICK NUNNALLY, COLLEGE OF ST. CATHERINE

Bret Wallach’s book is an intriguing mixture of history, geography, and personal narrative. His thesis, argued through a series of case studies of land use issues across the United States, is that Americans who support conservation have been hindered by this country’s faith
in a doctrine of progress. Because conservationists have been reluctant to oppose progress publicly, they have resorted to what Wallach calls the "three disguises" to achieve their goals. The disguise of efficiency, the disguise of social welfare, and the disguise of ecology allow conservationists to argue for public policy decisions that protect resources without appearing to oppose progress.

Ironically, Wallach's book is strongest where he focuses least on arguing his case. While he never convincingly demonstrates that the three "disguises" are in fact rationales for other motives and not what conservationists really wanted, he writes very well about particular landscapes. Whether the locale is extreme northern Maine, the Tennessee mountains, or the eastern region of Washington state affected by Grand Coulee Dam, Wallach is acutely aware of the specific actions that give a place its distinctive cultural geography.

The book's importance for historians of the Midwest is that it directs our attention to the combination of private action and public policy that creates the cultural landscape. His work attends to how human history has inscribed itself on a particular topography. His essays, particularly when he describes the places and people he knows best, teach us to see places differently. The quintessential Main Street and farmstead landscapes of the Midwest need this kind of attention.


REVIEWED BY ROBERT P. SUTTON, WESTERN ILLINOIS UNIVERSITY

This ambitious project is the fifth book in a series devoted to updating bibliographies of state history and research. The series, edited by Light T. Cummins and Glen Jeansonne, has so far produced reference guides to Louisiana, Massachusetts, Texas, California, and Texas. Illinois's contribution, edited by John Hoffmann, librarian of the Illinois Historical Survey, is a comprehensive description of the voluminous historical materials on the Prairie State.

Hoffmann has organized the Guide into four sections. He first introduces the subject in a fine essay that acquaints the reader with the extant sources for research from the early nineteenth century to the present. Monographs, anthologies, journals, biographical compendia, primers—all are discussed. He also surveys topics such as waterways, railroads, the medical and legal professions, political and constitutional topics, historical geography, newspapers, and government publications. Then, in the second section, he has twelve histori-